

Western  Graduate&PostdoctoralStudies

Western University  
**Scholarship@Western**

---

Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository

---

4-22-2016 12:00 AM

# Uprootedness and Health of Women Temporary Agricultural Workers: A Critical Ethnography

Kathryn Ann Edmunds  
*The University of Western Ontario*

Supervisor  
Dr. Helene Berman  
*The University of Western Ontario*

Graduate Program in Nursing  
A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree in Doctor of  
Philosophy  
© Kathryn Ann Edmunds 2016

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd>



Part of the [Public Health and Community Nursing Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

Edmunds, Kathryn Ann, "Uprootedness and Health of Women Temporary Agricultural Workers: A Critical Ethnography" (2016). *Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository*. 3716.  
<https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd/3716>

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Western. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Western. For more information, please contact [wlsadmin@uwo.ca](mailto:wlsadmin@uwo.ca).

## **Abstract**

In recent years, increased global mobility for work, gendered approaches to migration, and the vulnerabilities of women in temporary and precarious work have received increased attention. However, there is limited evidence regarding the health of women temporary foreign workers in Canadian agriculture. The purposes of this critical ethnography using feminist and intersectional perspectives were to: 1) explore and describe women temporary agricultural workers' experiences and meanings of health in the context of prolonged and repeated uprootedness from their homes and families, 2) to critically examine how the intersections of current gendered, global, political and economic conditions shaped their everyday lives and work, and 3) to collaboratively promote the development of programs and policies to support change. Data collection occurred over a twenty-month period through observational fieldwork, in-depth individual and group interviews, and the exploration of relevant systems, structures and contexts. Participants included 20 women in two federal programs whose countries of origin were Jamaica, Mexico and the Philippines. Analysis was an iterative process to identify and describe themes, relationships and power relations through the participants' representations of their lives.

The women interviewed recognized the injustices of needing to migrate for employment and in the working conditions they encountered. Yet due to the scarcity of economic resources in their countries of origin, they perceived their work in Canada as a necessary and caring maternal "sacrifice" in order to provide for their children. Temporary agricultural work was an essential opportunity, albeit one with costs to personal health due to the structural violence inherent in the restrictive and isolating terms of their employment contracts, crowded living conditions and the potential for workplace injuries. The women emphasized the importance of maintaining a "mindset" to adjust to repeated uprootedness from their children and families. Health, agency and resilience were promoted through emotional support from other women workers, technology to facilitate interpersonal connections, recreational and religious activities, and for some, overt resistance in publicly questioning the gendered and intersecting inequities of Canadian temporary foreign worker programs. Nurses in practice and research need to

have increased involvement in the multiple, collaborative and creative strategies necessary for change.

**Keywords:**

Temporary foreign workers, migrant agricultural work, women, gender, uprootedness, health, agency and resistance, structural violence, Canada

### **Co-Authorship Statement**

Kathryn Edmunds completed the following work under the supervision of Dr. Helene Berman and the advisement of Drs. Marilyn Ford-Gilboe, Cheryl Forchuk and Tanya Basok. All dissertation committee members have/will be co-authors on publications resulting from the chapters of this dissertation.

Chapter 2 was previously published and copyright is held by McGill University Library. Kathryn Edmunds selected and reviewed the articles for the review of the literature, wrote the manuscript and acted as corresponding author.

Drs. Helene Berman, Tanya Basok, Marilyn Ford-Gilboe and Cheryl Forchuk supervised and assisted in the development of the work and manuscript evaluation.

Copyright permission from the journal publisher is included in Appendix A.

## **Dedication**

For those everywhere who are made disposable; who resist, and find peace and joy in the smallest of spaces.

## **Acknowledgments**

First, I would like to acknowledge and honour the millions of women, men and children who, truly, have “no choice but to leave” their families and home for precarious, low-waged and often dangerous temporary work. The consequences of rampant neo-liberalism cause incalculable harm.

I sincerely thank the woman workers I met and those who agreed to participate in this research. I am humbled by their strength, resilience, determination, and sense of humour in more than difficult circumstances, as well as their ability to flourish while nurturing themselves and others.

I realize how fortunate I am to not only have had the opportunity to complete a PhD, but to have been in the graduate program at the Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing at Western University. The calibre of the faculty and the program is exceptional.

I am indebted to my supervisor, Dr. Helene Berman for her guidance and expertise, her endless patience and support, and for teaching me how to be a critical and compassionate researcher.

I could not have had a better advisory committee in Drs. Marilyn Ford-Gilboe, Cheryl Forchuk and Tanya Basok (from the University of Windsor). Your thoughtful and rigorous comments strengthened my research and writing at every step.

To Dr. Carole Orchard, who offered her home as a place of rest, company and deluxe accommodation when I needed to stay in London overnight, and meant it, thank you.

It takes more than an academic village to raise a PhD student.

To my husband David (another steadfastly patient person), and my son John, thank you for all the love and richness you have brought to my life.

To my family, especially my sister Margaret, dear friends, and colleagues at the University of Windsor, who tried and succeeded in not asking me when I would be finished, much gratitude. You all believed I could this, even when I did not.

I would also like to acknowledge all those who work tirelessly in communities and community organizations, most often with scarce resources, to learn about the lives of temporary workers while they are here in Canada, and then advocate for change.

## Table of Contents

Abstract .....	ii
Co-Authorship Statement.....	iv
Dedication.....	v
Acknowledgments.....	vi
Table of Contents .....	viii
List of Appendices.....	xii
Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
Purposes of the Research .....	2
Significance.....	2
Migrant Workers .....	4
Theoretical Perspectives .....	5
Critical theoretical perspectives .....	5
Feminist theoretical perspectives.....	6
Methodology.....	8
Study Summary.....	11
Conclusion .....	12
References .....	13
Chapter 2 – The Health of Women Temporary Agricultural Workers in Canada:	
A Critical Review of the Literature .....	19
Purpose.....	21
Methods.....	21
Findings.....	23
Gendered Migration and Temporary Work in the Context of Globalization....	23
Theoretical knowledge and understandings.....	23
Empirical knowledge and understandings .....	25
Health of Temporary Agricultural Workers .....	28
Theoretical knowledge and understandings of health.....	28
Empirical knowledge and understandings of health .....	30
Discussion .....	33
Implications for Research .....	34



Implications for Policy Development .....	35
Conclusion .....	36
References .....	38
Chapter 3 – “I Never Thought I Would Have to do This in Canada”: Acts of Agency and Resistance to Structural Violence by Women Temporary Agricultural Workers..	47
Significance.....	48
Purposes of the Research .....	49
Conceptual Framework .....	50
Globalization and structural violence .....	50
Temporary migration and structural violence.....	51
Agency and resistance to structural violence.....	52
Methodology.....	53
Research Methods .....	55
Recruitment.....	55
Interviews.....	56
Participant observation.....	57
Photovoice.....	57
Data Analysis.....	58
Findings.....	59
No Choice But to Leave: The Context of Globalization.....	60
The dialectic of leaving and staying .....	61
We Fear We May not Return Again: The Context of Temporary Agricultural Work.....	63
Constraints of the temporary foreign worker contracts .....	64
Permanent immigration status denied: Gendered and racialized streaming.....	65
We Can’t get Sick: The Context of Work and Health in Canada .....	67
The stress of being strong .....	68
Living with injuries.....	68
The necessity of staying healthy .....	69
Taking Action: The Context of Agency and Resistance.....	70

Discussion .....	73
Limitations .....	73
Implications for Research and Change .....	74
Conclusion .....	75
References .....	76
Chapter 4 – Intentional Uprootedness: Women Temporary Agricultural Workers in Canada.....	86
Purposes of the Research .....	87
Significance.....	87
The Concepts of Uprootedness .....	89
Methodology .....	91
Research Methods .....	92
Data Analysis .....	93
Findings.....	94
The Certainty of Uncertainty: Creating and Maintaining Uprootedness .....	95
Living with precarious work.....	95
The ambiguities of being apart .....	96
Competing Commitments: Self, Family and Uprootedness .....	97
The necessity of overcoming .....	99
Finding health in displacement .....	100
Becoming Rooted: Connection and Disconnection .....	102
Meanings of home and community.....	103
The paradox of connection.....	105
Discussion .....	107
Limitations.....	108
Implications for Research and Change .....	108
Conclusion .....	110
References.....	111
Chapter 5 – Conclusion: “Trying to Get to the Bigger Things” – Opportunities for Change .....	118
Validity.....	118

Research Findings and Contributions .....	120
Experiences of health.....	120
Contributions to Nursing.....	121
Challenges and Opportunities for Change .....	122
Implications for research.....	122
Implications for advocacy.....	124
Implications for policy .....	125
Implications for nursing practice and education .....	126
Conclusion .....	127
References .....	129
Appendices.....	132
Curriculum Vitae .....	155

## **List of Appendices**

Appendix A: Copyright Permission.....	132
Appendix B: Ethics Approval.....	133
Appendix C: Information Letter For Study Participants.....	137
Appendix D: Consent Form For Study Participants .....	140
Appendix E: Recruitment Flyer .....	141
Appendix F: Announcement for Radio, Information meetings .....	142
Appendix G: Interpreter Confidentiality Agreement.....	143
Appendix H: Information Letter For Study Participants – Spanish.....	144
Appendix I: Consent Form For Study Participants – Spanish .....	147
Appendix J: Recruitment Flyer – Spanish .....	148
Appendix K: Announcement for Radio, Information Meetings – Spanish .....	149
Appendix L: Interview Guidelines.....	150
Appendix M: Participant Demographic Characteristics .....	154

## Chapter 1: Introduction

The International Organization for Migration (2013) has estimated that 105 million people have migrated for work outside of their countries of origin. Due to escalating global trade pressures to remain competitive, and changes and trends in the immigration policies of high-income countries, migrants are increasingly being placed in and restricted to temporary contract positions (Walia, 2010). Canadian reliance on temporary “low skilled” foreign workers is growing, resulting in an increased dependency on transitory labour in a variety of sectors, including agriculture (Davids & van Driel, 2005; Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011; Sharma, 2012). Workers accept employment for long hours at minimal wages while performing demanding and often hazardous labour, and must return to their countries of origin at the end of the work contract. In 2013, there were approximately 300,000 temporary workers in Canada, more people than were admitted as permanent immigrants for employment (Citizenship and Immigration Canada [CIC], 2014, 2015).

The numbers of women migrating for work has been rising more quickly compared to men (International Labour Organization, 2010; Pyle, 2006). Despite this development and increased attention to women’s experiences, international migration as a gendered phenomenon remains understudied (Cachon, 2013; Parrado & Flippen, 2005; Piper, 2006; Oishi, 2005). Occupations and opportunities for work at home and abroad remain rooted in gendered roles and expectations, as do work-related dangers and vulnerabilities. Globalization has created new opportunities for increased global mobility and personal economic success. However, the effects on employment opportunities generate and perpetuate limited, difficult, and hazardous work situations for women migrants (Pheko, 2010), and contribute to women’s complex and contested experiences of migration.

Agriculture is a major national employer and a significant element of the Canadian economy, representing approximately 7% of the gross domestic product (Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 2015). Hiring foreign workers to meet the labour needs of this sector has become essential for employers (Preibisch & Hennebry, 2012). Introduced by the federal government in 1966 to address a long-standing shortage of farm labour, employer

demand through the Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program (SAWP) has steadily increased. In 2012, over 25,000 workers from Mexico and several Caribbean countries participated in SAWP (CIC, 2013). Employment contracts in SAWP can be offered for a maximum of eight months per calendar year, for an unlimited number of years. In 2014, employer demand for workers recruited in the Stream for Lower-Skilled Occupations (S-LSO), (formerly the Low-Skill Pilot Project), resulted in 10,390 approved positions for low skilled temporary workers in agriculture (Employment and Social Development Canada, 2014). Temporary workers in S-LSO can be employed for up to 2 years, with the potential for limited contract extensions. The women worker participants in this research were economically marginalized in their countries of origin, and despite the high personal and family sacrifices, regarded this work as an essential opportunity in order to provide for their families, especially their children.

### **Purposes of the Research**

The purposes of this critical ethnography were twofold:

1. to explore and describe women temporary agricultural workers' experiences and meanings of health in the context of prolonged and repeated uprootedness, and
2. to critically examine how the intersections of current gendered, global, political and economic conditions shaped their everyday lives and work.

Ultimate aims of this inquiry were to: explore how the context, structure, opportunities and constraints of participating in two federal programs influenced the health of female temporary agricultural workers; advance understanding of the power relations, processes and connections between gendered migration, temporary agricultural work, health and uprootedness, and; in collaboration with participants and key stakeholders, to promote the development of programs and policies that support this population.

### **Significance**

A variety of factors influence the health of temporary farmworkers including gender, culture, race, circular migration, recurring separation from families, and the social determinants of health (McGuire & Martin, 2007; McLaughlin, 2009). However, more needs to be understood about how these factors intersect to shape their health while in Canada (Hennebry, 2010; Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011). Although women in both SAWP

and S-SLO make up only 4% of temporary agricultural workers in Canada (Pysklywec, McLaughlin, Tew, & Haines, 2011), their numbers are increasing. Because of the relatively low numbers of women participating in Canadian temporary agricultural programs, and the focus to date on studying women migrants employed in feminized occupations such as domestic work, rather than women in masculinized labour sectors, inquiry with this population has been lacking (McLaughlin, 2008; Preibisch & Hermoso Santamaria, 2006; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010).

Theoretical inquiry in the social sciences has resulted in increased attention to the complexities of migration, and the fluidity of identity, home, and boundaries in contemporary societies. In this context, the concept of uprootedness refers to the state of being displaced, as well as the subsequent transformation of identities created within different contexts of relocation and settlement (Berman et al., 2009). The influence of lengthy, recurring uprootedness from homes and families on gender roles, expectations, and the health of women temporary agricultural workers is largely unknown, and has received limited attention in the nursing literature. The metaphors of uprootedness as being torn from one's homeland and being rooted as intimately grounding people and place require further exploration (Malkki, 1992, 1995).

This research provides insight and new conceptual knowledge in relation to gender-based meanings of uprootedness and health within the larger political and economic contexts in which Canadian temporary agricultural programs are promoted and administered.

Investigating the perceptions of women temporary agricultural workers enhances our comprehension of their health and work while employed in Canada. Findings contribute to the limited research pertaining to the relationships between uprootedness and health, and the influence of recurring uprootedness and the social determinants of health on well-being. This investigation adds to nursing research with marginalized and underserved populations. It has the potential to strengthen interdisciplinary collaboration through its attention to a multi-faceted and complex area of inquiry drawn from theoretical and empirical research in nursing, anthropology, geography, health sciences, political science, psychology and sociology.

## **Migrant Workers**

For the purposes of nation-states, the definition of migrants has two primary elements: the criteria of mobility (the period of entry and stay) and the criteria of citizenship (Kofman, Phizacklea, Raghuram, & Sales, 2000). For individuals, the process of being a migrant is situated within the inclusionary and exclusionary forces of sending and receiving countries. Consistent with immigration policy objectives, high-income receiving countries have developed increasingly restrictive access to citizenship, applying personal qualifications and quota systems as the basis for entry. Sending countries' emigration policies tend to exercise more control over women than men, reflecting the relationships among such policies, constructions of social legitimacy, and women's decision making for emigration (Oishi, 2005).

Being a migrant involves self-definition, which changes with location, over time, and in different contexts. These contexts can construct migrants as being visible in some circumstances (for example, as foreign temporary workers) and invisible in others (hidden and non-mobile while employed). Characterizations of migrants are also socially and politically positioned. In Canada, the immigration of higher skilled workers who are eligible for permanent residency, and considered more desirable, receives the most attention in research and policy (Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011). Portrayals of immigrants, particularly those who are members of visible minorities and streamed into low skilled work, have become increasingly negative and racialized, while the pressures of economic globalization that lead to migration and the subsequent significant contributions to both the sending and receiving countries are often overlooked (McGuire & Canales, 2010).

Conferring or withholding citizen rights while maintaining a stratified and flexible low skilled work force creates state-authorized discrimination reflecting the intersections of race, class and gender (Preibisch, 2007; Spitzer, 2012), and temporary work functions to perpetuate social control, marginalization and isolation of vulnerable groups (Kawabata, 2009; Walia, 2010). Yet, within the contexts of global mobility and temporary employment, migrants are sometimes depicted as participating in "guest worker programs". This term is misleading as the use of the word guest implies being invited, welcomed and accorded positive and privileged treatment. Temporary workers who are



classified as low skilled are guests who legally do not fully belong and for whom permanent residency status is usually unattainable.

### **Theoretical Perspectives**

**Critical theoretical perspectives.** Critical social theories and inquiry within a critical methodological approach are increasingly utilized and relevant for nursing research, particularly with regard to nursing's commitment to social justice to address inequities and improve health (Baumbusch, 2011; Berman, 2003; Browne, 2001; Fontana, 2004; Georges, 2003; MacDonnell, 2014; Mahon & McPherson, 2014; Manias & Street, 2000; Mill, Allen, & Morrow, 2001; Parissopoulos, 2014; Thorne, Reimer Kirkham, & Henderson, 1999; Weaver & Olson, 2006). These perspectives are based on the epistemological assumption that all knowledge is rooted in sociopolitical, historical, and cultural realities (Berman, Ford-Gilboe, & Campbell, 1998), and that knowledge becomes "taken for granted" over time (Ford-Gilboe, Campbell, & Berman, 1995).

Critical theories are concerned with issues of power and justice, and the ways in which race, class, gender, ideologies, discourses, economic structures and cultural dynamics interact to construct social systems (Guba & Lincoln, 2005). It is assumed that the broader social contexts and power structures that limit access to full privileges and participation in society require change. This focus provides the philosophical foundation for critical scholars to challenge, explore, and deconstruct the dominant discourses, structures and power relationships that disadvantage and oppress various groups in contemporary society (Browne, 2000). The concept of structural violence is also useful, where the systematic processes are examined through which social structures and institutions produce economic, social and political inequities that disadvantage and cause harm to individuals, communities and populations (Farmer, 2003; Scott-Samuel, Stanistreet, & Crawshaw, 2009).

Critical knowledge in the epistemology of CST is theorized as knowledge that enables human beings to emancipate themselves through self-reflection from forms of domination arising from incomplete or distorted knowledge, linking those involved in the research with historical contexts and the present, specific social locations (Kincheloe & McLaren,

2005). Because dominant groups have the power to access, and more importantly control, the full range of knowledge about society, members of subordinate groups may have only partial access and influence (Carroll, 2004). The process of facilitating discovery involves the creation of safe and secure spaces for reflection, critique, and dialogue (Berman, 2003). From this comes awareness of the differences between everyday communication with its “common sense” knowledge, and the ideologic discourses that conceal oppression.

Praxis, an activity consisting of both action and reflection, is a continuous progression, emphasizing the importance of dialogic and dialectic processes (Lather, 1991; McLaren, 2001), and has been “described as the ability to link knowledge and theory development to practice-relevant social, political and ethical actions aimed at improving health, health care and social conditions” (Baumbusch, 2011, p. 189). It is precisely the dialectical engagement between the researcher and participants, and the ability to link knowledge and theory development to practical and everyday experiences, which can precipitate change (Browne, 2000). Thus, the exact nature of change cannot be predicted in advance of the research. Emancipation occurs within individual and collective contexts, in ways that facilitate understanding and agency, and through the difficult process of challenging the social structures and systems that resist alteration and are responsible for so much human suffering. Critical social theories are used in this dissertation as the lens through which the participants’ lived experiences are related to the critique of current ideologies, power relations and structures influencing temporary work.

**Feminist theoretical perspectives.** Feminist theories are an integral part of a gendered approach to migration due to the philosophical and intellectual contributions of this perspective when applied to women’s lived experiences. Feminist theories are one form of critical social theory, focusing on how gender influences “whose knowledge is being considered” and how that knowledge is used (Pressley, 2005). With a philosophy of science also informed by constructivism and postmodernism (Campbell & Wasco, 2000), feminist theories assume that knowledge is socially situated, which guides and gives focus to the relational, the contextual and the everyday (Campbell & Bunting, 1991; Guruge & Khanlou, 2004). Through this “situatedness of knowledge construction”

(Davids & van Driel, 2005), feminist theories make explicit the connections between gender, knowledge, power relations, and social justice (Hill Collins, 2000; MacDonnell, 2014).

As recognized by Keough (2006), “feminist scholars insist that we look to women’s own perspectives and experiences for a more nuanced understanding of the complexities of change and the multiple effects and contradictions generated by economic transitions” (p. 434). According to Runyan and Marchand (2000), feminism is the bridge to understanding the micro, meso and macro forces that shape women’s lives, and an understanding of gender and power relations is necessary to understand the complexity of globalization. A focus on the social relations of gendered inequality also leads to questioning the prominent discourse that the forces of globalization are impossible to modify or overcome, and challenges the assumption that economic globalization is “value-free” (Steans, 2003).

A gendered analysis transforms migration theory by not only making women visible, but providing the means to link both the private and public spheres of women’s lives, exploring how economic change differentially influences men and women (Kofman et al., 2000). What is gained is a deeper understanding of the diversity of women’s migration experiences and the ways in which they contest and navigate the settings of work and home (Kofman et al., 2000; Piper, 2003). There is a multiplicity of responses to migration and the effects of migration on gender relations are highly variable; gains in some areas can be counteracted by losses in others.

Whether hegemonic or subordinate, neither masculinities nor femininities in global economic relations are uniform; nor are they experienced in uniform ways. The gendered practices of women and men, both capitalists and labourers, are always and already culturally and historically situated... The challenge is to explicate globally inflected processes in their locally specific forms while at the same time seeking connections across economic and social contexts. (Mills, 2003, p. 54)

Feminist theorizing also recognizes and articulates the intersecting factors shaping the diversities of individual and collective experiences (Swigonski & Raheim, 2011).

Intersectionality “is concerned with understanding the multifaceted, complex, and

interlocking nature of social locations and power structures and how these shape human lives” (Hankivsky, 2014, p. 255). There are many interrelated factors in both oppression and privilege and incorporating an intersectionality perspective strengthens critical and feminist approaches.

## **Methodology**

Developed in social anthropology, ethnography “emphasizes the natural environment of the research participants and the relationship between research participants and the cultural world” (Spradley as cited in Maggs-Rapport, 2001, p. 376). Ethnography originally focused on the discovery of emic or insider cultural meanings, values and behaviours, as interpreted from an etic or outsider perspective. It is both a process and a product (Tedlock, 2003), and is characterized by immersion of the researcher in the field over time through participant observation (Allen, Francis, Chapman, & O’Connor, 2008; Borbasi, Jackson, & Wilkes, 2005). Yet ethnographic investigation has continuously incorporated diverse philosophical and methodological approaches (Atkinson, Coffey, & Delamont, 2003). As first conceptualized, the role of the ethnographer was that of the objective, neutral observer. More recent interpretations of ethnography are less post-positivistic and have been influenced by postmodernism in the recognition of multiple subjective realities, which include the perspective and position of the researcher (Tedlock, 2003; Vidich & Lyman, 2003). Critical ethnography shares with ethnography a focus on discovering meanings and patterns of cultures through qualitative and ethnographic methods (Thomas, 1993). Common features include: interest in social interaction, communication and behaviour; an emphasis on thick and rich data collection and representation; simultaneous data collection and analysis; and, an interest in identifying cultural structures and themes. What is particularly useful for research is ethnography’s flexible methodological synthesis of multiple methods and holistic focus on context (Savage, 2006).

Fontana (2004) identified a synthesized critical methodology based on seven fundamental processes: critique, context, politics, emancipatory intent, democratic structure, dialectical analysis, and reflexivity. Social critique is necessary to challenge ideologies and structures that function to maintain power, and are often hidden. The boundaries and

limitations in the organization of the everyday world that marginalize can serve to conceal constraining and repressive systems and discourses. Therefore, responsibility “is shifted onto the researcher to investigate and analyze the wider social relations that shape people’s everyday experiences – social relations that are usually not visible to the ‘knower’” (Browne, 2004, p. 122). Through social and political engagement, the critical ethnographer is concerned with analyzing and revealing dominant social interpretations and the interests they represent, in order to ultimately transform society through the liberation of individuals from sources of control and subjugation (Sparks, 2001).

Critical ethnography begins with an ethical responsibility to address processes of unfairness or injustice within a particular *lived* domain....The critical ethnographer also takes us beneath the surface appearances, disrupts the *status quo*, and unsettles both neutrality and taken-for-granted assumptions by bringing to light underlying and obscure operations of power and control. (Madison, 2012, p. 5)

Critical research does not profess to be neutral, and what distinguishes critical ethnography is the purpose of the methodology, which is to describe and critique culture (and power) so that political action and change can be realized (Cook, 2005; Kincheloe & McLaren, 2005; Koro-Ljungberg & Greckhamer, 2005; Marshall & Rossman, 2011; Thomas, 1993).

For a chosen methodological approach to be credible and rigorous it needs to be consistent with the researcher’s philosophical assumptions, theoretical framework, and the purpose of the research. The methodological approach also shapes the participants’ and researcher’s experiences, which in turn, influences the findings (Maggs-Rapport, 2001). It is consistent with the purposes of the research to incorporate a feminist perspective within the methodology of critical ethnography. As stated by Canella and Manuelito (2008):

Feminist research epistemologies have played a major role in the conceptualization and reconceptualization of qualitative, and especially critical qualitative, research purposes and methods. In addition to equity and social justice for women, scholars and activists have... focused on and problematized constructions of gender. (p. 45)

In critical inquiry, “knowledge is believed to be socially constituted, historically situated, and valuationally based” (Henderson, 1995, p. 59). Knowledge evolves from interaction and negotiation between the researcher and the participants (Campbell & Bunting, 1991; Madison, 2012). The process of knowledge production in critical ethnography informed by feminist theory is an explicitly intersubjective co-construction among all concerned, which involves continuous revision. This is accomplished through encounters of dialogue, reflection, and critique so that mutual understanding can occur concerning the relationships between everyday experience and forces that oppress (Browne, 2004). Participation in dialogical relationships creates safe places for initial reflection regarding sources of oppression, and continuing reflection regarding the influence of structural forces. This research utilizes a diversity of contexts in which knowledge is produced, including personal narratives and critique of social structures (Carroll, 2004), and acknowledges that the researcher is culturally and politically situated (Foley & Valenzuela, 2005). Because knowledge is always socially constructed and negotiated, the co-creation of meaning during the research process should be openly evident between the participants and the researcher.

However, as Berman (2003) points out, a mutually reciprocal and dialogical exchange between researchers and participants carries with it an assumption of equality and may lead the researcher to overlook issues of power. Issues of authority, voice, and power; the influence of race, class and gender; and how these realities may or may not have been resolved also need to be clearly evident throughout the research process (Baumbusch, 2011; Madison, 2012). The researcher recognizes the power inherent in their role in the research process, and utilizes this opportunity for restructuring relationships with participants (Manias & Street, 2001). Reflexivity on the part of the researcher is required during all stages of the research. This occurs when “the researcher’s assumptions, motivations, biases, and values are made explicit and their influence on the research process is examined” (Berman et al., 1998, p.4). To be critically reflexive means recognizing the privileged role of research (and the researcher) in potentially facilitating liberation and/or sustaining oppression (Madison, 2012; Reyes Cruz & Sonn, 2011).

Diversity in women's roles, expectations, and experiences are valued through respect for personal and collective choice and agency. This diversity is anticipated and sought in critical ethnography (Madison, 2012), is strengthened through the use of a feminist and intersectional lens, and the use of multiple methods to add richness and depth to the data and discover varied perspectives (Willis, Jost, & Nilakanta, 2007). It is always the researcher's responsibility to have reflected upon the theoretical assumptions underlying any inquiry, and to evaluate congruence between these assumptions, the purposes of the research, methodological approaches and the proposed methods. With my use of a range of methods, including prolonged engagement in the field in collaboration with participants, critique of social structures relevant to temporary agricultural worker programs, and exploration of gender roles and power relations, critical ethnography was an appropriate methodological decision.

### **Study Summary**

In Chapter 2 of this dissertation, *The Health of Women Temporary Agricultural Workers in Canada: A Critical Review of the Literature* (Edmunds, Berman, Basok, Ford-Gilboe, & Forchuk, 2011), the theoretical and empirical literature is synthesized and analyzed regarding gendered and temporary migration in the context of globalization and the health of temporary agricultural workers, with a focus on women in Canadian programs. The findings from Chapter 2 strongly support the need for further research, particularly in nursing and other health disciplines, in order to explore the strengths, barriers and health needs of women migrant agricultural workers in Canada. Chapter 3, *"I Never Thought I Would Have to do This in Canada": Acts of Agency and Resistance to Structural Violence by Women Temporary Agricultural Workers*, examines how the processes of gendered structural violence operating through regional, national and international contexts shapes the women participants' health, agency and acts of resistance. As suggested in this chapter, temporary agricultural work resulted in significant costs to personal health and well-being for the participants, due to lengthy and recurrent separation from families, restrictive employment contracts and the physical strain of repetitive work. Locally experienced structural violence was linked to the political and

economic organization of temporary employment, shaping both possibilities and constraints for agency and resistance.

The concept of uprootedness is utilized in Chapter 4, *Intentional Uprootedness: Women Temporary Agricultural Workers in Canada*, to explore and describe women temporary agricultural workers' experiences and meanings of health in the context of prolonged and repeated displacement from their homes and families. For temporary foreign workers, to belong is to be largely controlled by the systems and structures of the employment contracts. As Chapter 4 makes clear, uprootedness for the women in this research was regulated by those who had the power to offer or withhold the right to be temporarily in Canada and was experienced within the context of psychological and residential uncertainty. This uncertainty was constant given the women's precarious work and lack of secure immigration status. In Chapter 5, *Conclusion: "Trying to Get to the Bigger Things" – Opportunities for Change*, the contributions of this research, the challenges and opportunities for change, and the implications for future advocacy, research and collaboration needed to address the inequities experienced by temporary foreign workers in Canada are discussed.

## **Conclusion**

Increasing numbers of women are entering the global migrant workforce, due in part, to the growing dependence of high-income countries on temporary foreign workers in sectors such as agriculture. While gendered approaches to migration and the global feminization of labour have received increased attention in recent years, there remains limited knowledge regarding the work and health experiences of women employed in predominately masculine labour flows. Utilizing critical and feminist theoretical perspectives within the methodology of critical ethnography, this study contributes new conceptual knowledge regarding gender-based and cultural meanings of uprootedness and health for women workers in the context in which Canadian temporary agricultural foreign worker programs are currently promoted and administered.



## References

- Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. (2015). *An overview of the Canadian agriculture and agri-food system: 2014*. Retrieved from <http://www.agr.gc.ca/eng/about-us/publications/economic-publications/alphabetical-listing/an-overview-of-the-canadian-agriculture-and-agri-food-system-2014/?id=1396889920372>
- Allen, S., Francis, K., Chapman, Y., & O'Connor, M. (2008). Examining the methods used for a critical ethnographic enquiry. *Contemporary Nurse*, 29(2), 227-237.
- Atkinson, P., Coffey, A., & Delamont, S. (2003). *Key themes in qualitative research: Continuities and change*. Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press.
- Baumbusch, J. L. (2011). Conducting critical ethnography in long-term residential care: Experiences of a novice researcher in the field. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 67(1), 184–192. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2010.05413.x
- Berman, H., (2003). Getting critical with children: Empowering approaches with a disempowered group. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 26(2), 102-113.
- Berman, H., Alvernaz Mulcahy, G., Forchuk, C., Edmunds, K., Haldenby, A., & Lopez, R. (2009). Uprooted and displaced: A critical narrative study of homeless, aboriginal, and newcomer girls in Canada. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 30(7), 418-430.
- Berman, H., Ford-Gilboe, M., & Campbell, J. (1998). Combining stories and numbers: A methodology for a critical nursing science. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 21(1), 1-15.
- Borbasi, S., Jackson, D., & Wilkes, L. (2005). Fieldwork in nursing research: Positionality, practicalities and predicaments. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 51(5), 493-501.
- Browne, A. J. (2000). The potential contributions of critical social theory to nursing science. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 32(2), 35-55.
- Browne, A. J. (2001). The influence of liberal political ideology on nursing science. *Nursing Inquiry*, 8(2), 118-129.
- Browne, A. J. (2004). Response to critique of 'The influence of liberal political ideology on nursing science'. *Nursing Inquiry*, 11(2), 122-123.
- Cachon, M. F. (2013). *Embodied cartographies of Mexican-Canadian transnationalism* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (NR79305)
- Campbell, J. C., & Bunting, S. (1991). Voices and paradigms: Perspectives on critical and feminist theory in nursing. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 13(3), 1-15.
- Campbell, R., & Wasco, S. M. (2000). Feminist approaches to social science: Epistemological and methodological tenets. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 28(6), 773-791.

- Canella, G., & Manuelito, K. (2008). Feminisms from unthought locations: Indigenous worldviews, marginalized feminisms, and revisioning anticolonial social science. In N. Denzin, Y. Lincoln & L. Tuhiwai Smith (Eds.). *Handbook of critical and indigenous methodologies* (pp. 45-59). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Carroll, W. (2004). Unpacking and contextualizing critical research strategies. In W. Carroll (Ed.), *Critical strategies for social research* (pp. 1-14). Toronto, ON: Canadian Scholars' Press.
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2013). *Canada facts and figures 2012. Immigration overview: Permanent and temporary residents*. Retrieved from [http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection\\_2013/cic/Ci1-8-2012-eng.pdf](http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2013/cic/Ci1-8-2012-eng.pdf)
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2014). *Canada facts and figures 2013. Immigration overview: Temporary residents*. Retrieved from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/2013-Facts-Temporary.pdf>
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2015). *Canada facts and figures 2014. Immigration overview: Permanent residents*. Retrieved from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/2014-Facts-Permanent.pdf>
- Cook, K. E. (2005). Using critical ethnography to explore issues in health promotion. *Qualitative Health Research*, 15(1), 129-138.
- Davids, T., & van Driel, F. (2005). Gender and globalization: An analytical alliance. In T. Davids & F. van Driel (Eds.), *The gender question in globalization: Changing perspectives and practices* (pp.217-228). Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Edmunds, K., Berman, H., Basok, T., Ford-Gilboe, M., & Forchuk, C. (2011). The health of women temporary agricultural workers in Canada: A critical review of the literature. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 43(4), 68–91.
- Employment and Social Development Canada (2014). *Number of temporary foreign worker positions on positive Labour Market Impact Assessments (LMIA's) under the Agricultural Occupations*. Retrieved from [http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign\\_workers/lmo\\_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml](http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign_workers/lmo_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml)
- Farmer, P. (2003). *Pathologies of power: Health, human rights and the new war on the poor*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Foley, D., & Valenzuela, A. (2005). Critical ethnography: The politics of collaboration. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp. 217-233). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Fontana, J. S. (2004). A methodology for critical science in nursing. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 27, 93-101.
- Ford-Gilboe, M., Campbell, J., & Berman, H. (1995). Stories and numbers: Coexistence without compromise. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 18(1), 14-26.
- Georges, J. M. (2003). An emerging discourse: Toward epistemic diversity in nursing. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 27, 44-52.

- Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). Paradigms and perspectives in contention. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp.191-216). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Guruge, S., & Khanlou, N. (2004). Intersectionalities of influence: Researching the health of immigrant and refugee women. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 36(3), 32-47.
- Hankivsky, O. (2014). Rethinking care ethics: On the promise and potential of an intersectional analysis. *American Political Science Review*, 108(2), 252-264. doi:10.1017/S0003055414000094
- Henderson, D. J., (1995). Consciousness raising in participatory research: Method and methodology for emancipatory nursing inquiry. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 17, 58-69.
- Hennebry, J. (2010). Not just a few bad apples: Vulnerability, health and temporary migration in Canada. *Canadian Issues: Temporary Foreign Workers*, Spring, 73-77. Retrieved from [http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/cdn\\_issues\\_CITC\\_mar10.pdf](http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/cdn_issues_CITC_mar10.pdf)
- Hill Collins, P. (2000). *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). New York, NY: Routledge.
- International Labour Organization (2010). *International labour migration: A rights-based approach*. Retrieved from [http://www.ilo.org/public/libdoc/ilo/2010/110B09\\_59\\_engl.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/libdoc/ilo/2010/110B09_59_engl.pdf)
- International Organization for Migration (2013). *Migration initiatives 2014: Health of migrants*. Retrieved from [http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/Migration\\_Initiatives2014\\_web.pdf](http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/Migration_Initiatives2014_web.pdf)
- Kawabata, M. (2009). *Social construction of health inequities: A critical ethnography on day labourers in Japan* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (NR59098)
- Keough, L. J. (2006). Globalizing 'postsocialism' mobile mothers and neoliberalism on the margins of Europe. *Anthropological Quarterly*, 79(3), 431-461.
- Kincheloe, J. L., & McLaren, P. (2005). Rethinking critical theory and qualitative research. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp. 303-342). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Kofman, E., Phizacklea, A., Raghuram, P., & Sales, R. (2000). *Gender and international migration in Europe: Employment, welfare and politics*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Koro-Ljunberg, M., & Greckhamer, T. (2005). Strategic turns labeled 'ethnography': From description to openly ideological production of cultures. *Qualitative Research*, 5(3), 285-306.
- Lather, P. (1991) *Getting smart: Feminist research and pedagogy with/in the postmodern*. New York, NY: Routledge.

- MacDonnell, J. A. (2014). Enhancing our understanding of emancipatory nursing: A reflection on the use of critical feminist methodologies. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 37(3), 271–280. doi:10.1097/ANS.0000000000000038
- Madison, D. S. (2012). *Critical ethnography: Method, ethics, and performance* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Maggs-Rapport, F. (2001). ‘Best research practice’: In pursuit of methodological rigour. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 35(3), 373–383.
- Mahon, P., & McPherson, G. (2014). Explaining why nurses remain in or leave bedside nursing: A critical ethnography. *Nurse Researcher*, 22(1), 8–13.
- Malkki, L. (1992). National geographic: The rooting of peoples and the territorialization of national identity among scholars and refugees. *Cultural Anthropology*, 7(1), 22–44.
- Malkki, L. (1995). Refugees and exile: From “refugee studies” to the national order of things. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 24, 495–523.
- Manias, E., & Street, A. (2000). Possibilities for critical social theory and Foucault’s work: A toolbox approach. *Nursing Inquiry*, 7(1), 50–60.
- Manias, E., & Street, A. (2001). Rethinking ethnography: Reconstructing nursing relationships. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 33(2), 234–242.
- Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (2011). *Designing qualitative research* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- McGuire, S., & Canales, M. K. (2010). Of Migrants and metaphors: Disrupting discourses to welcome the stranger. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 33(2), 126–142.
- McGuire, S. & Martin, K. (2007). Fractured migrant families: Paradoxes of hope and devastation. *Family & Community Health*, 30(3), 178–188.
- McLaren, P. (2001). Che Guevara, Paulo Freire, and the politics of hope: Reclaiming critical pedagogy. *Critical Methodologies*, 1(1), 108–131.
- McLaughlin, J. (2008). Gender, health and mobility: Health concerns of women migrant farm workers in Canada. *Health Studies*, Paper 1. Retrieved from [http://scholars.wlu.ca/brantford\\_hs/1](http://scholars.wlu.ca/brantford_hs/1)
- McLaughlin, J. (2009). *Trouble in our fields: Health and human rights among Mexican and Caribbean migrant farm workers in Canada* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (NR71364)
- Mill, J. E., Allen, M. N., & Morrow, R. A. (2001). Critical theory: Critical methodology to disciplinary foundations in nursing. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 33(2), 109–127.
- Mills, M. B. (2003). Gender inequality in the global labour force. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 32, 41–62.
- Oishi, N. (2005). *Women in motion: Globalization, state policies, and labor migration in Asia*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

- Parrado, E. A., & Flippen, C. A. (2005). Migration and gender among Mexican women. *American Sociological Review*, 70(4), 606-632.
- Parissopoulos, S. (2014). "Unmasking" a web of meanings: The value of critical ethnography in nursing research. *Health Science Journal*, 8(3), 296-297.
- Pheko, L. L. (2010). Gender, economic globalization, movement and citizenship. *Development*, 53(3), 402-406.
- Piper, N. (2003). Feminization of labor migration as violence against women. *Violence Against Women*, 9(6), 723-745.
- Piper, N. (2006). Gendering the politics of migration. *International Migration Review*, 40(1), 133-164.
- Preibisch, K. L. (2007). Local produce, foreign labor: Labor mobility programs and global trade competitiveness in Canada. *Rural Sociology*, 72(3), 418-449.
- Preibisch, K. L., & Encalada Grez, E. (2010). The other side of el otro lado: Mexican migrant women and labor flexibility in Canadian agriculture. *Signs*, 35(2), 289-316.
- Preibisch, K., & Hennebry, J. (2011). Temporary migration, chronic effects: The health of international migrant workers in Canada. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 183(9), 1033-1038. doi:10.1503 /cmaj.090736
- Preibisch, K., & Hennebry, J. L. (2012). Buy local, hire global: Temporary migration in Canadian agriculture. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.), *Legislated inequality: Temporary migration in Canada* (pp. 48-72), Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Preibisch, K., & Hermoso Santamaria, L. (2006). Engendering labour migration: The case of foreign workers in Canadian agriculture. In E. Tastsoglou & A. Dobrowolsky (Eds.), *Women, migration, and citizenship: Making local, national, and transnational connections* (pp.107-130). Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Pressley, L. (2005). *Whose knowledge is it anyway? Feminist epistemology and science: An annotated bibliography*. Retrieved from [http://laurenpressley.com/papers/feminist\\_epistemology.pdf](http://laurenpressley.com/papers/feminist_epistemology.pdf)
- Pyle, J. L. (2006). Globalization and the increase in transnational care work: The flip side. *Globalizations*, 3(3), 297-315.
- Pysklywec, M., McLaughlin, J., Tew, M., & Haines, T. (2011). Doctors within borders: Meeting the health care needs of migrant farm workers in Canada. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 183(9), 1039-1043. doi:10.1503/cmaj.091404
- Reyes Cruz, M., & Sonn, C. C. (2011). (De)colonizing culture in community psychology: Reflections from critical social science. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 47, 203-214. doi:10.1007/s10464-010-9378-x
- Runyon, A. S., & Marchand, M. H. (2000). Feminist approaches to global restructuring. In M. H. Marchand & A. S. Runyan (Eds.), *Gender and global restructuring: Sightings, sites and resistances* (pp. 225-230). London, UK: Routledge.

- Savage, J. (2006). Ethnographic evidence: The value of applied ethnography in healthcare. *Journal of Research in Nursing*, 11(5), 383-393.
- Scott-Samuel, A., Stanistreet, D., & Crawshaw, P. (2009). Hegemonic masculinity, structural violence and health inequalities. *Critical Public Health*, 19(3-4), 287–292.
- Sharma, N. (2012). The “difference” that borders make: “Temporary foreign workers” and the social organization of unfreedom in Canada. In P. T. Lenard and C. Staehle (Eds.), *Legislating inequality: Temporary labour migration in Canada* (pp. 26-47). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press.
- Sparks, A. (2001). Myth 94: Qualitative health researchers will agree about validity. *Qualitative Health Research*, 11(4), 538-552.
- Spitzer, D. (2012). Oppression and im/migrant health in Canada. In E. A. McGibbon (Ed.), *Oppression: A social determinant of health* (pp. 113-122). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.
- Steans, J. (2003). Gender inequalities and feminist politics in a global perspective. In E. Kofman & G. Youngs (Eds.), *Globalization: Theory and practice* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., pp. 123-138). London, UK: Continuum.
- Swigonski, M. E., & Raheim, S. (2011). Feminist contributions to understanding women’s lives and the social environment. *Journal of Women and Social Work*, 26(1), 10-21. doi:10.1177/0886109910392517
- Tedlock, B. (2003). Ethnography and ethnographic representation. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *Strategies of qualitative inquiry* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., pp. 165-213). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Thomas, J. (1993). *Doing critical ethnography*. Newbury Park, CA: SAGE.
- Thorne, S. E., Reimer Kirkham, S., & Henderson, A. (1999). Ideological implications of paradigm discourse. *Nursing Inquiry*, 6, 123-131.
- Vidich, A. J., & Lyman, S. M. (2003). Qualitative methods: Their history in sociology and anthropology. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The landscape of qualitative research: Theories and issues* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., pp. 55-129). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Walia, H. (2010). Transient servitude: Migrant labour in Canada and the apartheid of citizenship. *Race & Class*, 52(1), 71-84.
- Weaver, K., & Olson, J. K. (2006). Understanding paradigms used for nursing research. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 53(4), 459-469.
- Willis, J., Jost, M., & Nilakanta, R. (2007). *Foundations of qualitative research: Interpretive and critical approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

## **Chapter 2 - The Health of Women Temporary Agricultural Workers in Canada: A Critical Review of the Literature**

<sup>1</sup>It has been estimated that 214 million people are now international migrants (International Labour Organization [ILO], 2010). The number of women migrants is increasing at a faster pace than men, as more women are migrating independently and seeking employment (ILO, 2010; Oishi, 2005; Piper, 2008). Repeated relocation for temporary work, reflecting the intersection of economic globalization and local necessity, is becoming progressively widespread. Among high-income countries such as Canada, there is growing dependency on “low skilled” foreign workers and temporary contract work in a range of sectors (Sharma, 2006; Walia, 2010). These workers accept employment for long hours at minimal wages while engaging in demanding and often hazardous labour. Foreign workers accepted into employment programs must migrate alone and return to their country of origin at the end of their work contract before applying for another temporary stay. The health of those employed in this circular migration pattern is influenced by a variety of factors, including gendered roles and expectations, precarious migration status and working conditions, repeated separation from family and home, and the social determinants of health in both the sending and the receiving country (McGuire & Martin, 2007; McLaughlin, 2008; McLaughlin, 2009b).

Agriculture, representing approximately 7% of national GDP, is a major component of Canada’s economy and remains the country’s largest employer (Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 2015). Dependence on foreign workers to meet labour needs has become necessary as decreasing numbers of citizens and permanent residents are willing to accept the minimal wages and arduous realities of farmwork (Brem, 2006; Weston, 2007). Globally as well, the business of food production relies on inexpensive and easily replaceable labour, divided into gender-specific tasks (Becerril, 2007; Glass, Mannon, &

---

<sup>1</sup> A version of this chapter has been published:

Edmunds, K., Berman, H., Basok, T., Ford-Gilboe, M., & Forchuk, C. (2011). The health of women temporary agricultural workers in Canada: A critical review of the literature. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 43(4), 68–91.

Petrzelka, 2014; Mills, 2003; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Rojas Wiesner & Cruz, 2008).

The Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP), introduced by the federal government in 1966 to address a longstanding shortage of farm labour, is a set of formal bilateral agreements between Canada and the worker source nations of Mexico, Trinidad and Tobago, and Barbados, as well as the Organization of the Eastern Caribbean States (Brem, 2006). In 2012, over 25,000 workers from Mexico and several Caribbean countries participated in SAWP (Citizenship and Immigration Canada [CIC], 2013). Workers accepted into SAWP are eligible for employment for up to 8 months each year, and can return every year if offered an employment contract. Employer demand for workers recruited in the Stream for Lower-Skilled Occupations (S-LSO), (formerly the Low-Skill Pilot Project), resulted in 10,390 approved positions for low skilled temporary workers in agriculture (Employment and Social Development Canada, 2014). Temporary workers in S-LSO are from countries such as Guatemala, the Philippines, and Thailand (Pysklywec, McLaughlin, Tew, & Haines, 2011) and can be employed for up to 2 years, with the potential for limited contract extensions. People seek employment in both programs due to the scarcity of economic resources and adequately paying jobs in their home country. Despite the personal and family sacrifices, temporary work is regarded as an essential and often fortunate prospect, one that provides an income for current needs and future opportunities for workers' families and their children.

In recent years, the global feminization of labour, gendered approaches to the study of migration, and the vulnerabilities of women who are made invisible through isolated and temporary working conditions have received increased attention. However, the focus of investigation has been women migrants employed in feminized fields such as domestic labour and caregiving, rather than those employed in masculinized fields such as agriculture. Though women make up only 4% of temporary agricultural workers in Canada (Pysklywec et al., 2011), their numbers are increasing and there is a need for research "on migration to go beyond women-only focuses and situate gender and its intersectionality with other relations of power as constitutive elements of (im)migration, even in masculinized migration flows" (Preibisch & Hermoso Santamaria, 2006, p. 107).



Due in part to the relatively small numbers of women participating in temporary agricultural work, inquiry with this population has been lacking, especially with regard to their health while in Canada. Gender and international migration are increasingly significant determinants of women's health (Vissandjee, Thurston, Apale, & Nahar, 2007), as is precarious employment, which disproportionately affects women (Menendez, Benach, Muntaner, Amable, & O'Campo, 2007). Many Canadians, including nurses, are unaware of the large and growing number of temporary workers currently employed in this country; the global, national, and local contexts that shape the experiences of and affect the well-being of these workers; and the implications for the health of women agricultural workers.

### **Purpose**

The purpose of this review is to critically synthesize and analyze the theoretical and empirical literature on gendered and temporary migration in the context of globalization and the health of temporary agricultural workers, particularly women, in Canadian programs. The strengths and limitations of the current state of knowledge in these areas will be assessed and addressed in relation to research and policy recommendations.

### **Methods**

Multiple searches and search strategies were necessary to locate, assess, and integrate literature from diverse disciplines and sources. Through preliminary reading and collaboration among the five authors, significant contributors to the areas of interest were identified. The selected databases included CINAHL, Proquest Nursing, PubMed, PyschInfo, Sociological Abstracts, Web of Science, Scopus, and the University of Western Ontario Library Catalogue databases. English-language literature between 1993 and 2011 included quantitative and qualitative research articles; review and opinion articles; and books. Searches were also conducted within published reports on the websites of organizations with expertise on international migration (the ILO), global health (the World Health Organization [WHO]), and temporary work in Canada (Metropolis and the North-South Institute). Key search terms included gender, women, female, globalization, migration, migrant/temporary/seasonal, agricultural/farmworkers, work, health, immigrant health, determinants of health/social determinants of health, and

Canada. Included as exploration strategies were searches of relevant journals; article and book reference lists; and Google Scholar and general Internet searches using identified authors and search terms.

In order to provide an international overview of the structural concepts and issues of interest, we conducted a broad-based review of the theoretical literature on gendered migration and temporary work in the context of globalization. The review of the empirical literature was more focused on women engaged in temporary work in Canada. Included were theoretical sources relating to gender, globalization, and temporary work; sources pertaining to Canadian temporary worker statistics, programs, and gendered streaming; the gendered nature of women participating in SAWP; and research on the gendered experiences of leaving children behind, including research conducted in the worker source countries of Mexico and the Philippines. Excluded were sources for statistics and programs in other countries. Based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria and multiple search strategies, the initial yield of 264 abstracts resulted in 57 fully reviewed sources, with 32 included in this section.

In order to provide context for the analysis of knowledge pertaining to the health of women agricultural workers in Canada, the purpose of the review of theoretical conceptualizations of health was to provide a global context for definitions of health and then focus on Canadian literature pertaining to social determinants of health, gender, migration and work, particularly in the nursing literature. The purpose of the review of the empirical literature was to assess the breadth of research pertaining to adult migrant agricultural workers in North America. Of particular interest were agricultural workers in Canadian temporary work programs and the qualitative literature pertaining to the health of women agricultural workers in relation to the systems and structural forces affecting their lives. Excluded was the literature on migrant agricultural workers outside North America, the health status of children and families of workers, and the development of research instruments or procedures. From an initial yield of 646 abstracts, 86 sources were fully reviewed, with 53 selected for this article.

It is important to note however, that since this article was originally published in 2011, more research has been conducted and these articles have been incorporated into the findings.

## **Findings**

Theoretical and empirical findings are organized under two themes: gendered migration and temporary work in the context of globalization and health of temporary agricultural workers. Although there is considerable literature on international gendered migration and globalization and on the health of migrant agricultural workers in the United States, there are very few Canadian studies. Therefore the results of this review may well provide a useful base for future research.

The multidisciplinary searches produced five research and review publications related to the gendered constraints of female workers in SAWP: three book chapters (Becerril, 2007; Preibisch & Hermoso Santamaria, 2006; Rojas Wiesner & Cruz, 2008), one research article (Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010), and one unpublished master's thesis (Scantlebury, 2009). Six publications were found related to the health of temporary agricultural workers in Canada, none of which focused only on women: two research articles (Hennebry, 2010; Mysyk, England, & Avila Gallegos, 2009), one unpublished doctoral dissertation (McLaughlin, 2009b), one research report specifically based on that dissertation (McLaughlin, 2009a), and two research review articles (Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011; Pysklywec et al., 2011). Perhaps not surprisingly given the range of disciplinary approaches, interests, and expertise, there is a need for research that synthesizes a social determinants of health approach within the contexts of gendered migration, temporary work programs in Canada, and women's work in masculinized occupations such as agriculture. Such research could serve to more fully inform policy development and suggest recommendations that address women's experiences of health and work.

## **Gendered Migration and Temporary Work in the Context of Globalization**

**Theoretical knowledge and understandings.** The theoretical exploration of gendered migration within the context of globalization is characterized by examination of the

interactions and effects of gendered ideologies and hierarchies on globalization and the consequences for women (Chow, 2003; Keough, 2006; Kofman, Phizacklea, Raghuram, & Sales, 2000; Mills, 2003; Piper, 2006; Oishi, 2005; Rodriguez, 2010; Steans, 2003). In its most basic form, globalization “describes a constellation of processes by which nations, businesses and people are becoming more connected and interdependent via increased economic integration and communication exchange, cultural diffusion (especially of Western culture) and travel” (Labonte & Torgerson, 2005, p. 158). What is emphasized in the literature addressing gendered migration in the context of globalization, however, is that the process of globalization is occurring within a neoliberal political ideology (Chow, 2003; Keough, 2006; Rodriguez, 2010; Sharma, 2006; Stasiulis & Bakan, 2005). This ideology is based on the promotion of free and unregulated markets, where the role of the state is reduced in publicly funded programs and where individual autonomy and responsibility for one’s own success are accentuated. What is hidden within such an ideology is the reality that success for a few is possible only through the exploitation of many — individuals, countries, and regions (Chow, 2003). The consequences of international monetary policies based on these assumptions are exacerbated conditions of poverty, constrained economic growth, and state-supported migration from low-income countries as a means of generating revenue through remittances (Keough, 2006; Rodriguez, 2010; Stasiulis & Bakan, 2005). Yet the capitalistic forces of globalization are not inescapable, and, though so often represented as monolithic in the dominant discourse, are intertwined with contested and situated interests and expressions of agency and change (Barndt, 2008; Steans, 2003).

Gendered migration for low-skilled temporary work brings a complex mixture of potential benefits in the form of economic opportunity and autonomy and real constraints in the form of restricted, dangerous, and vulnerable work situations away from one’s family. An important contribution to the theoretical discussion of gendered migration is the identification of the feminization of labour, which refers both to the gendered nature of occupations and opportunities and to work that is devalued. The feminization of labour has resulted in international migration for work that is increasingly temporary, circular, and stratified and that contributes to violence against women (Piper, 2003). Stratification,

as defined by Piper (2008), accentuates the processes by which gender, race, citizenship, and skill level combine to place (and keep) workers in certain segments of employment. Ideologies of gendered work mean that female workers fill different positions to male workers, often because women are considered an inexpensive, compliant, and submissive workforce (Freeman, 2010; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Steans, 2003).

Research on women and migration commenced in the 1970s. Yet, as Piper (2006) asserts, the study of gender and migration is still accorded a marginalized place within the interdisciplinary field of migration studies. Globalization as a gendered phenomenon is neither well acknowledged nor well understood (Cachon, 2013; Chow, 2003; Parrado & Flippen, 2005; Oishi, 2005), particularly as it relates to repeated temporary work. Gender remains undervalued as an influential component at all levels of the migration process, although a gendered perspective is required for explanatory depth and enhances our understanding of the complexity and heterogeneity of migration (Davids & van Driel, 2005; Kofman et al., 2000). To assume that the study of migration and related policies is gender-neutral is to ignore women's specific and collective experiences.

**Empirical knowledge and understandings.** Empirical research into gendered migration in the context of globalization has been conducted in Asia (Oishi, 2005; Parrenas, 2005, 2008; Piper, 2008), Europe (Kofman et al., 2000), and Canada (Becerril, 2007; Preibisch and Hermoso Santamaria, 2006; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Rojas Wiesner and Cruz, 2008; Stasiulus & Bakan, 2005). In Canada, women from low-income countries are usually relegated to work that is designated as low skilled and that is largely unregulated (Gibb, 2010; Sharma, 2006). Most of the skilled temporary workers entering Canada come from the United States and Europe, while the low-skilled workers come from Mexico, the Caribbean (mainly men), and the Philippines (mainly women) and compete for jobs that are poorly paid and considered less desirable (Boyd & Pikkov, 2008). Women temporary migrants are more likely than men to be streamed into work that is considered low skilled (Sharma, 2006). Such is the case with the Canadian Live-In Caregiver Program; caregiving is classified as a low-skilled occupation, reflecting the gendered devaluing of caring work and of women's educational credentials (Stasiulus & Bakan, 2005). Gendered stereotyping of female workers, including temporary workers,

has identified women as more caring, docile, and reliable than men. In their research specifically looking at the gendered nature of work performed by women participating in SAWP, Becerril (2007), Preibisch and Hermosa Santamaria (2006), Preibisch and Encalada Grez (2010), and Rojas Wiesner and Cruz (2008) describe gendered ideologies whereby women are consigned to specific types of work “suited” to their aptitudes — tasks that require “special care,” such as packing fruit and vegetables.

As high-income countries have become increasingly protectionist, opportunities for low-skilled workers and their families to immigrate have decreased (Boyd & Pikkov, 2008; Sharma, 2012). Temporary worker programs are viewed as preferable because employment contracts are time-limited, yet renewable over many years, and entail little or no obligation by the employer or the host country once the contract has ended. For low-skilled workers, employment is confined to sectors where it is difficult to find local labour and where the work is not mobile, such as agriculture, construction, and hospitality (Preibisch, 2007). Migrant temporary workers are not granted the rights of citizenship and usually would not meet the Canadian requirements for skilled worker status leading to permanent residency (Goldring, Berinstein, & Bernard, 2009). However, they have become necessary labour for high-income countries, precisely because they are relegated to restrictive and constraining temporary contractual work (Basok, 2002; Walia, 2010).

A central topic in the literature is the experiences of women and their families when women migrate independently for work. The similarities and gender-based differences affecting women are both broadly based and particular to local circumstances. A number of studies found strong evidence of women accepting low-paying, low-skilled foreign contract work in order to provide for their families’ current needs and their children’s future (Becerril, 2007; Keough, 2006; McGuire & Martin, 2007; Parrenas, 2005; Pe-Pua, 2003; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Preibisch & Hermoso Santamaria, 2006; Scantlebury, 2009). Although it was difficult for mothers to leave (and return), differences were found in the gendered role expectations of men and women, both while with their families and while apart (Carling, Menjivar, & Schmalzbauer, 2012; Contreras & Griffith, 2012; Glass et al., 2014; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010). Migrant mothers

most often assumed the responsibility for arranging care for their children, usually by a female relative or a paid caregiver, thus taking on the contradictory role of providing economic support from a distance in order to provide reproductive care to their families back home (Carling et al., 2012; Contreras & Griffith, 2012; Paciulan & Preibisch, 2013; Scantlebury, 2009; Ziesman, 2013). McGuire and Martin (2007) describe this ambivalence for women as a paradox of hope and despair, where the economic benefits are intertwined with emotional suffering and physical separation. Families are placed at risk by the woman's absence, yet separation is seen as essential to their current and future economic security. Not surprisingly, ambivalence was also expressed by young adults, who as children had experienced parental migration for work (Parrenas, 2005; Scantlebury, 2009). While understanding the reasons for migration, they frequently stated that they had missed the enjoyment and stability of experiencing daily parenting.

Representations of women and mothers who migrate were found to be contradictory. Positive representations included providing economic support and material care for their children, extended families, and communities; negative representations included being absent and therefore unable to provide emotional care and becoming "corrupted" in their new lives through the potential for increased independence, assertiveness, and exposure to different values and standards regarding women's behaviour (Guevarra, 2006; Keough, 2006; Parrenas, 2005; Pyle, 2006). In the reviewed research, all family members were transformed by migration, yet the costs and burdens of maintaining a transnational family fell disproportionately on women. The act of migration can both destabilize and affirm the family, and also has the potential to perpetuate and/or challenge prevailing ideologies regarding gender and family configuration and function. Because they remain primarily responsible for family caretaking, migrant women "continue to shoulder the 'pains and gains' of simultaneous embeddedness in 'home' and 'host' countries, and the need for constant mobility in linking the two in order to sustain the family" (Yeoh, 2005, p. 65). Women workers remain disadvantaged in the labour market, caught between their reproductive and productive responsibilities and roles.

## **Health of Temporary Agricultural Workers**

**Theoretical knowledge and understandings of health.** While definitions of health may be numerous and varied, what is consistent is that to be healthy is valued as positive and desirable (Young & Wharf Higgins, 2011). Health is understood to be a holistic and inclusive process by Oxman-Martinez et al. (2005), who view this concept as socially and culturally constructed. Guruge and Khanlou (2004) and Lynam (2005) discuss health in terms of the intersectionality of multiple influences acting on and through micro, meso, and macro levels of society. Lynam also reminds us of the tensions between structural constraints and individual agency, and notes that the multiple influences on health include restrictions on choice when material resources are limited. According to WHO (2008), “the structural determinants and [social] conditions of daily life constitute the social determinants of health and are responsible for a major part of health inequities between and within countries” (p. 1). Indeed, the WHO Constitution asserts that health is a human right and that the attainment of the highest standard of health requires attention to the underlying determinants. It is now recognized that one of the most influential and pervasive determinants of health is gender, primarily the gendered relations of power, which include access to and control over health resources and which are related to the disparities in status between women and men (Karolinska Institutet, 2007; Marmot, 2007; Oxman-Martinez et al., 2005; WHO, 2008).

Women living in Canada within an immigration category that prohibits permanent residency are considered to have a precarious immigration status, which is an influential and complex determinant of equitable access to health care (Oxman-Martinez et al., 2005). As demonstrated in the nursing literature with regard to precarious migration, gender, mobility, and relocation, current discourses of health are congruent with a social determinants of health perspective (Oxman-Martinez et al., 2005; Thurston & Vissandjee, 2005; Vissandjee, Desmeules, Cao, Abdool, & Kazanjian, 2004; Vissandjee et al., 2007). These theoretical discussions are framed by an understanding of the contexts, intersections, and influences of such factors. However, migration is often conflated with culture and ethnicity, the result being that the existing diversity of migration pathways and experiences is disregarded or minimized. A social determinants of health perspective



is needed for a full understanding and analysis of gender, migration, and women's health, due to the contextual focus on the structures that shape and influence individuals' lives (Thurstun & Vissandjee, 2005; Vissandjee et al., 2004). Women carry an unfair health burden due to the intersections of gender, race, migration, globalization, economic disparities, and the strains of gendered work (Doyal, 2005; Falk-Rafael, 2006; Spitzer, 2005). Yet research "tends to look at the 'effects of migration on women' as opposed to the diverse ways that women, through migration, own, uphold, and mobilize resources for the welfare and well-being of their families" (Vissandjee et al., 2007, p. 229).

In their definition of globalization, Labonte and Torgerson (2005) emphasize the processes involved in order to highlight the social, political, economic, and environmental embeddedness of local actions. This is directly relevant to experiences of health, and Falk-Rafael (2006) and Labonte and Torgerson (2005) argue for the need to conceptualize and analyze global health as more than "a burden of disease"; attention needs to be paid to how locally experienced determinants of health in all countries are linked to the processes of globalization, shaping opportunities for health and health outcomes at different levels (Labonte, Mohindra, & Schrecker, 2011; Labonte & Torgerson, 2005; Marmot, 2007).

Research exploring the social determinants of health is limited, due partly to the prevalence of biomedical models and behavioural risk approaches that situate the individual as the focus for interventions (Marmot, 2007). Underlying these approaches are neoliberal assumptions and resulting economic policies that give primacy to individual autonomy and responsibility for health (WHO, 2007). Yet, while recognizing the influence of power on creating health inequities, WHO (2008) does not explicitly critique global systems based on these values (Green, 2010), and according to Raphael (2011) the public policy implications of addressing the structural inequities of power and health are in conflict with current government approaches in Canada. The complexity of a social determinants of health approach allows for nuanced understandings of health, the production of inequities, and multifaceted analytical frameworks. However, as Green (2010) observes, "we have a vast and growing body of evidence documenting inequalities, some evidence on the complex pathways which link social determinants to

biological mechanisms and health outcomes, but almost no evidence on ‘what works’ to reduce health inequity” (p. 2).

**Empirical knowledge and understandings of health.** The majority of research into the health of migrant agricultural workers has been conducted within quantitative biomedical, epidemiological, and population health “at risk” perspectives, has been cross-sectional, and has been conducted primarily with men. Most of the research has been carried out in the United States, and it makes an important contribution to our understanding of the health status, risks, concerns, and barriers for this population.

However, while the nature and conditions of agricultural work share many similarities in North America, almost half of the migrant farmworker population in the United States is without documentation (Hoerster et al., 2011) whereas most temporary agricultural workers in Canada are registered with federally sponsored programs (Goldring et al., 2009). Workers without documentation have restricted access to health care and other support programs (Hoerster et al., 2011). In Canada, employers are required to provide health insurance during the wait times for provincial coverage and most workers are eligible to be compensated for workplace injuries (Pysklywec et al., 2011). Health screening is a condition of employment. However, registered workers in Canada also face barriers to receiving comprehensive and appropriate health care as well as adequate compensation should an injury or illness occur, fear repatriation resulting in the loss of the economic gains that come with temporary employment, and are at risk for a variety of health conditions while in Canada and upon their return home (Hennebry, 2010; McLaughlin, 2009b; McLaughlin, Hennebry, & Haines, 2014; Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011; Preibisch & Otero, 2014).

The stressful conditions of migrant agricultural work are well documented; there is an extensive body of literature on the psychological stresses, occupational health risks, communicable disease risks, and barriers to health care pertaining to this population. The empirical literature describes migrant agricultural workers, both male and female, as at increased risk for substance abuse disorders (Borges, Medina-Mora, Breslau, & Aguilar-Gaxiola, 2007; Grzywacz, Quandt, Isom, & Arcury, 2007) and communicable diseases,

particularly tuberculosis and HIV/AIDS (Apostolopoulos et al., 2006; Gadon, Chierici, & Rios, 2001; Varela-Ramirez, Mejia, Garcia, Bader, & Aguilera, 2005; Wolffers, Fernandez, Verghis, & Vink, 2002). Occupational hazards associated with agricultural work include increased rates of musculoskeletal injury, eye and skin conditions, and pesticide exposure (Anthony, Martin, Avery, & Williams, 2010; Cooper et al., 2006; Culp & Umbarger, 2004; Farquhar et al., 2008; McLaughlin et al., 2014; Pysklywec et al., 2011; Quandt et al., 2010; Whalley et al., 2009). Repetitive strain and musculoskeletal injuries are the most commonly reported injuries among farmworkers, and self-care is the most commonly utilized management (Anthony, Martin, Avery, & Williams, 2010; Brock, Northcraft-Baxter, Escoffery, & Green, 2012; Horton & Stewart, 2012). Barriers to receiving sufficient, equitable, and comprehensive health services, including preventive and health promoting care, encompass cultural, linguistic, structural, legal, financial, and geographic factors (Arcury & Quandt, 2007; Hoerster et al., 2011; Mysyk et al., 2009; Narushima, McLaughlin, & Barrett-Greene, 2015; Orkin, Morgan, McLaughlin, Schwandt, & Cole, 2014; Pysklywec et al., 2011).

Psychological stress, mental health concerns, and considerable ambivalence are experienced by Mexican migrant farmworkers, arising from the pressures of migration whereby family responsibilities are in continuous competition with employment opportunities and prolonged absences (Clingerman, 2006; Grzywacz et al., 2006; Johnston & Herzig, 2006; Rodriguez, 1993; Sullivan & Rehm, 2005; Ward, 2010a, 2010b). Compared to their male counterparts, female migrant farmworkers have been found to have increased levels of depression (Mazzoni, Boiko, Katon, & Russo, 2007), loneliness, acculturative stress, obesity, and hypertension (Clingerman, 2006, 2007) and higher rates of skin reactions, heat exhaustion, physical injury, and diabetes (Anthony, Williams, & Avery, 2008). Poor health outcomes for all migrant agricultural workers are believed to arise from the interactions of migration, poverty, hazardous temporary work, communicable diseases, physical and psychological stress, and language barriers (Hansen & Donohoe, 2003; Svensson et al., 2013; Ward, 2010b). Loneliness and separation from families, difficulty accessing health care due to long working hours, poor working and living conditions, and poor understanding by health providers of the broad structural

forces that affect workers' lives result in complex health concerns and unmet physical and psychological needs (Johnston & Herzig, 2006; Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011). These findings have been confirmed in recent comprehensive investigations with men and women temporary agricultural workers in Canada, primarily employed through SAWP (Hennebry, 2010; McLaughlin, 2009a, 2009b; McLaughlin et al., 2014; Narushima et al., 2015; Orkin et al., 2014; Preibisch & Otero, 2014; Pysklywec et al., 2011).

The results of a limited number of qualitative studies enhance our understanding of women's health in the context of migration and work. The meaning of health for Hispanic female migrant farmworkers is explored in Rodriguez's (1993) ethnographic study with 32 women. The central theme identified was defining health as the ability to "create peace" in one's current situation, so that one can live in peace. Another dominant theme was the "culture of transience," which extended beyond ethnicity and geographic location. Transience results from working away from home, living in isolated conditions, and being uncertain about whom to trust in the event of problems with health, employment, or housing. Similarly, Clingerman (2006, 2007) found that "being at peace" was a dominant conceptualization. In this study, 21 Mexican and Mexican-American women engaged in migrant agricultural work were asked to describe their experiences of health. The word most frequently used to represent health was "peace" (*la paz*), which was related to the participants' religious and cultural beliefs as well as the importance of family and was recognized as a healthy transition response to their migration. For the women in these studies, health, which was contextualized through structural factors such as gendered roles and relations, migration, and economic and political dynamics, emerged as a multifaceted and holistic experience within transience/transition.

The only study to explicitly identify and explore personal agency was that conducted by McGuire (2006), who characterizes the discovery of the importance of agency for her participants as "serendipitous." This grounded theory study with 22 indigenous Oaxacan migrant women explored facilitators of and obstacles to health. The women demonstrated much personal agency and determination by making "constant references to the difficulty of their experiences, yet they continued on their immigrant trajectory buttressed by the smallest gains and improvements in their conditions of life and in hopes for their

children” (p. 373). This result is congruent with findings reported in the social sciences literature on gendered migration, a central theme of which is the situatedness of experience and expression of agency existing in tension with larger structural forces. Health concerns and vulnerabilities are heightened for women due to gendered relations, expectations, and ideologies. Though health was not the primary focus of their research, Preibisch and Encalada Grez (2010) found, through in-depth interviews with 16 female workers in SAWP, that women who arrived pregnant or became pregnant while in Canada were seen as problematic by employers and often had their work contracts terminated. In order to avoid this perceived difficulty, the program required the women to have a pregnancy test before departing for Canada. Female reproductive capabilities in combination with negative stereotyping of women’s sexual behaviour led to increased monitoring and surveillance of activities and relationships. Gendered stereotyping and lack of power also resulted in sexual harassment by co-workers, supervisors, and employers (Morales Waugh, 2010; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010). Reluctance to state the reason for reproductive or sexual health appointments; fear of repatriation; and lack of access to information, clinics, health-care providers, and transportation result in unmet needs and increased health risks (McLaughlin, 2008; McLaughlin, 2009b; Narushima et al., 2015; Organista, Organista, & Solof, 1998; Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011).

## **Discussion**

The various settings, systems, and processes of labour migration are reflected in the complex, and often conflicted and contested, relationships between gender and work. Consistent themes in the literature are the diversity of opportunities and constraints for women migrants and the interrelatedness of the health of individuals, their families, and transnational communities within local and global dynamics. However, there are striking differences in how the issues are framed, particularly between the social sciences and nursing. Issues related to temporary migrant workers and gender in the context of increasing globalization, neoliberalism, and structural economic disadvantage have been explored in the social sciences, principally in sociology. The relationships between personal agency, gendered expectations and ideologies, and systemic forces at home and in the host country are emphasized. However, in the social sciences literature the focus is

on women engaged in feminized occupations, such as nursing and domestic service, and until recently temporary and repeated relocation received less attention than permanent migration (Oishi, 2005). In contrast, the evolving nursing literature (Oxman-Martinez et al., 2005; Thurston & Vissandjee, 2005; Vissandjee et al., 2004, 2007), which explicitly identifies gender and migration as highly influential determinants of health, is not specifically linked to the processes and consequences of globalization or neoliberal assumptions of individualism. Emergent nursing research that explores conceptualizations of health with migrant farmworker women (Clingerman, 2006; Rodriguez, 1993) reflects health as inclusive and multifaceted but is not clearly framed within a gendered analysis. Nor, with the exception of work by McGuire (2006) and McGuire and Martin (2007), has research been specifically linked to the influence of neoliberal assumptions on economic globalization and on women's health through the need for and dangers of migration. The cited nursing literature remains limited and is concentrated among a small number of researchers.

### **Implications for Research**

In their discussion of seasonal agricultural workers, Rojas Wiesner and Cruz (2008) state that "more study is needed regarding the characteristics and working conditions of both male and female temporary workers in Canada, in order to identify the differences that account for disadvantage that women experience in employment opportunities as compared to men" (p. 209). Further research is also needed to more fully explore the strategies used and constraints experienced by all family members when women are required to migrate alone for work. There is a dearth of research with female agricultural workers in S-LSO, whose countries of origin are different from those of women in SAWP and whose continuous stays are longer. There is a need for research on the relationships among and processes entailed in the social determinants of health in general (Oxman-Martinez et al., 2005) and the interactions between social constructions of gender and the social determinants of health in particular (Karolinska Institutet, 2007). Research employing methodological and analytical frameworks that deepen our understanding of the relationships among globalization, gender, health, work, and power at all social levels could serve to advance knowledge and effect change at personal,

collective, and structural levels and to support the much-needed development of gender-sensitive approaches to women's health.

The biological and physiological characteristics arising from the sex of being male or female act in synergy with gender roles, relations, and the institutionalization of gendered hierarchies. While differences between male and female temporary agricultural workers have been noted, none of the research reviewed in this article has specifically and comprehensively included sex as a determinant of health. There is a need not only to integrate sex and gender in research inclusive of the social determinants of health and broad contexts of structure and policy (Benoit et al., 2009), but also to integrate sex and gender into occupational health research (Messing & Mager Stellman, 2006). As in the research pertinent to the health and experiences of agricultural workers, women farmworkers are also underrepresented in occupational health research (Andersson & Lundqvist, 2014; Habib & Fathallah, 2012).

The growing body of Canadian studies and reviews on the health of temporary agricultural workers have been conducted primarily by social scientists (Hennebry, 2010; McLaughlin, 2009a, 2009b; McLaughlin et al., 2014; Mysyk et al., 2009; Narushima et al., 2015; Orkin et al., 2014; Preibisch & Otero, 2014; Pysklywec et al., 2011). While an interdisciplinary approach to the health of temporary workers from a human rights and social determinants of health perspective is valuable and necessary, greater involvement by nurses and other health-care researchers and providers is needed. Inquiry from a strength-based approach is also called for, to explore how women's resiliencies and forms of resistance influence their health. The findings of such research could inform nursing education, practice, and administration, particularly with respect to preparing nurses to work and advocate with uprooted, mobile populations and those engaged in precarious, stressful, and physically demanding work, while also taking into consideration the contexts of globalization and gendered migration.

### **Implications for Policy Development**

There is a vital need for policy development that includes the participation of temporary workers and integration across local, national, and international levels. Until recently,

immigration policies focusing on the control of infectious diseases were a significant priority internationally, with little attention given to the global factors and relationships that determine health (MacPherson, Gushulak, & Macdonald, 2007). As identified by Hennebry (2010), McLaughlin (2009b) and Hennebry and McLaughlin (2012), provincial, national, and international structural elements of Canada's temporary agricultural programs have a greater influence on the health of workers than individual actions. Health policies and guidelines should require enforceable procedures regarding the recruitment of workers, their access to health care, occupational health and safety standards, including living conditions and personal safety, and mechanisms to address grievances and human rights violations. The importance of personal agency in health, resilience, and change should also be supported. Policies affect men and women differently (Piper, 2006) and should reflect the influences of gender and sex, which have been largely overlooked in Canada (Hankivsky, 2007) and in the country's temporary foreign worker programs. Also needed are policy and program planning and development for appropriate, gender-sensitive and equitable health care — including the establishment of mobile clinics and community-based support centres for migrant workers — and for increasing the structural responsiveness of health-care institutions to support nursing practice with this population.

## **Conclusion**

The many contradictions surrounding women's migration for agricultural work reveal outcomes arising from the convergence of structural and personal factors expressed through the dialectic between temporary work and globalization. Agricultural workers root and grow the food necessary for human survival, yet they are at increased risk for a variety of negative consequences for their own health and that of their families. The number of women engaged in temporary farm work in Canada is increasing, and these women experience significant health inequities due to systemic, institutionalized, and gendered constraints that make it difficult for them to challenge the social and structural circumstances of their lives. There is very little evidence regarding their conceptualizations of health and health status in Canada within the broader contexts of repeated and gendered migration. Research to inform policy development and practice



needs to explicitly acknowledge and explore the strengths and health-care needs of migrant farmworker women, as well as the barriers they face, within the intersecting forces of inequities, oppression, and social determinants of health at local, national, and global levels.

## References

- Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. (2015). *An overview of the Canadian agriculture and agri-food system: 2014*. Retrieved from <http://www.agr.gc.ca/eng/about-us/publications/economic-publications/alphabetical-listing/an-overview-of-the-canadian-agriculture-and-agri-food-system-2014/?id=1396889920372>
- Andersson, E., & Lundqvist, P. (2014). Gendered agricultural space and safety: Towards embodied, situated knowledge. *Journal of Agromedicine*, 19, 303–315. doi:10.1080/1059924X.2014.916644
- Anthony, M. J., Martin, E. G., Avery, A. M., & Williams, J. M. (2010). Self care and health-seeking behavior of migrant farmworkers. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 12, 634–639.
- Anthony, M., Williams, J. M., & Avery, A. M. (2008). Health needs of migrant and seasonal farmworkers. *Journal of Community Health Nursing*, 25(3), 153–160.
- Apostolopoulos, Y., Sonmez, S., Kronenfeld, J., Castillo, E., McLendon, L., & Smith, D. (2006). STI/HIV risks for Mexican migrant laborers: Exploratory ethnographies. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 8(3), 291–302.
- Arcury, T., & Quandt, S. (2007). Delivery of health care services to migrant and seasonal farmworkers. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 28, 345–363.
- Barndt, D. (2008). *Tangled routes: Women, work, and globalization on the tomato trail* (2nd ed.). Lanham, MD: Rowan & Littlefield.
- Basok, T. (2002). *Tortillas and tomatoes: Transmigrant Mexican harvesters in Canada*. Montreal, PC: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Becerril, O. (2007). Transnational work and the gendered politics of labour: A study of male and female Mexican migrant farm workers in Canada. In L. Goldring & S. Krishnamurti (Eds.), *Organizing the transnational: Labour, politics, and social change* (pp. 157–172). Vancouver, BC: UBC Press.
- Benoit, C., Shumka, L., Vallance, K., Hallgrímsdóttir, H., Phillips, R., Kobayashi, K., et al. (2009). Explaining the health gap experienced by girls and women in Canada: A social determinants of health perspective. *Sociological Review Online*, 14(5).
- Borges, G., Medina-Mora, M., Breslau, J., & Aguilar-Gaxiola, S. (2007). The effect of migration to the United States on substance use disorders among returned Mexican migrants and families of migrants. *American Journal of Public Health*, 97(10), 1847–1851.
- Boyd, M., & Pikkov, D. (2008). Finding place in stratified structures: Migrant women in North America. In N. Piper (Ed.), *New perspectives on gender and migration: Livelihood, rights and entitlements* (pp. 19–58). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Brem, M. (2006). *Migrant workers in Canada: A review of the Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program*. Retrieved from [http://www.nsi-ins.ca/english/pdf/MigrantWorkers\\_Eng\\_Web.pdf](http://www.nsi-ins.ca/english/pdf/MigrantWorkers_Eng_Web.pdf).

- Brock, M., Northcraft-Baxter, L., Escoffery, C., & Green, B. L. (2012). Musculoskeletal health in South Georgia farmworkers: A mixed methods study. *Work*, 43, 223–236. doi:10.3233/WOR-2012-1368
- Cachon, M. F. (2013). *Embodied cartographies of Mexican-Canadian transnationalism* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (NR79305)
- Carling, J., Menjivar, C., & Schmalzbauer, L. (2012). Central themes in the study of transnational parenthood. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(2), 191–217. doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2012.646417
- Chow, E. N. (2003). Gender matters: Studying globalization and social change in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. *International Sociology*, 18(3), 443–460.
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2013). *Canada facts and figures 2012. Immigration overview: Permanent and temporary residents*. Retrieved from [http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection\\_2013/cic/Ci1-8-2012-eng.pdf](http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2013/cic/Ci1-8-2012-eng.pdf)
- Clingerman, E. (2006). Conceptualizations of health among Mexican and Mexican American women employed in migrant farm work. *Hispanic Health Care International*, 4(1), 45–55.
- Clingerman, E. (2007). A situation-specific theory of migration transition for migrant farmworker women. *Research and Theory for Nursing Practice*, 21(4), 220–235.
- Contreras, R., & Griffith, D. (2012). Managing migration, managing motherhood: The moral economy of gendered migration. *International Migration*, 50(4), 51–66. doi:10.1111/j.1468-2435.2012.00771.x
- Cooper, S. P., Burau, K. E., Frankowski, R., Shipp, E. M., Del Junco, D. J., Whitworth, R. E., et al. (2006). A cohort study of injuries in migrant farm worker families in south Texas. *Annals of Epidemiology*, 16(4), 313–320.
- Culp, C., & Umbarger, M. (2004). Seasonal and migrant agricultural workers: A neglected workforce. *AAOHN Journal*, 52(9), 383–390.
- Davids, T., & van Driel, F. (2005). Gender and globalization: An analytical alliance. In T. Davids & F. van Driel (Eds.), *The gender question in globalization: Changing perspectives and practices* (pp. 217–228). Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Doyal, L. (2005). Understanding gender, health, and globalization: Opportunities and challenges. In I. Kickbusch, K. Hartwig, & J. List (Eds.), *Globalization, women, and health* (pp. 10–27). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Employment and Social Development Canada (2014). *Number of temporary foreign worker positions on positive Labour Market Impact Assessments (LMIA's) under the Agricultural Occupations*. Retrieved from [http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign\\_workers/lmo\\_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml](http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign_workers/lmo_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml)
- Falk-Rafael, A. (2006). Globalization and global health: Toward nursing praxis in the global community. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 29(1), 2–14.

- Farquhar, S., Samples, J., Ventura, S., Davis, S., Abernathy, M., & McCauley, et al. (2008). Promoting the occupational health of indigenous farmworkers. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 10, 269–280.
- Freeman, C. (2010). Myths of docile girls and matriarchs: Local profiles of global workers. In J. Goodman (Ed.), *Global perspectives on gender and work: Readings and interpretations* (pp. 289–303). London, UK: Rowan & Littlefield.
- Gadon, M., Chierici, R.-M., & Rios, P. (2001). Afro-American migrant farmworkers: A culture in isolation. *AIDS Care*, 13(6), 789–801.
- Gibb, H. (2010). Missing from temporary foreign worker programs: Gender sensitive approaches. *Canadian Issues: Temporary Foreign Workers*, Spring, 94–95. Retrieved from [http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/cdn\\_issues\\_CITC\\_mar10\\_e.pdf](http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/cdn_issues_CITC_mar10_e.pdf).
- Glass, C. M., Mannon, S., & Petrzela, P. (2014). Good mothers as guest workers: Constructing the trope of compliant maternity in Spain's strawberry industry. *International Journal of Sociology*, 44(3), 8–22. doi:10.2753/IJS0020-7659440301
- Goldring, L., Berinstein, C., & Bernard, J. K. (2009). Institutionalizing precarious migratory status in Canada. *Citizenship Studies*, 13(3), 239–265.
- Green, J. (2010). Editorial: The WHO Commission on Social Determinants of Health. *Critical Public Health*, 20(1), 1–4.
- Grzywacz, J. G., Quandt, S. A., Early, J., Tapia, J., Graham, C. N., & Arcury, T. A. (2006). Leaving family for work: Ambivalence and mental health among Mexican migrant farmworker men. *Journal of Migration and Minority Health*, 8(1), 85–97.
- Grzywacz, J. G., Quandt, S. A., Isom, S., & Arcury, T. A. (2007). Alcohol use among immigrant Latino farmworkers in North Carolina. *American Journal of Industrial Medicine*, 50, 617–625.
- Guevarra, A. R. (2006). Managing “vulnerabilities” and “empowering” migrant Filipina workers: The Philippines’ Overseas Employment Program. *Social Identities*, 12(5), 523–541.
- Guruge, S., & Khanlou, N. (2004). Intersectionalities of influence: Researching the health of immigrant and refugee women. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 36(3), 32–47.
- Habib, R. R., & Fathallah, F. A. (2012). Migrant women farm workers in the occupational health literature. *Work*, 41, 4356–4362. doi:10.3233/WOR-2012-0101-4356
- Hankivsky, O. (2007). Gender-based analysis and health policy: The need to rethink outdated strategies. In M. Morrow, O. Hankivsky, & C Varcoe (Eds.), *Women's health in Canada: Critical perspectives on theory and policy* (pp. 143–168). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Hansen, E., & Donohoe, M. (2003). Health issues of migrant and seasonal farmworkers. *Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved*, 14(2), 153–164.

- Hennebry, J. (2010). Not just a few bad apples: Vulnerability, health and temporary migration in Canada. *Canadian Issues: Temporary Foreign Workers*, Spring, 73–77. Retrieved from [http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/cdn\\_issues\\_CITC\\_mar10\\_e.pdf](http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/cdn_issues_CITC_mar10_e.pdf).
- Hennebry, J. L., & McLaughlin, J. (2012). “The exception that proves the rule”: Structural vulnerability, health risks, and consequences for temporary migrant farm workers in Canada. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.), *Legislated inequality: Temporary labour migration in Canada* (pp. 117-138). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press.
- Hennebry, J. L., McLaughlin, J., & Preibisch, K. (2015). Out of the loop: (In)access to health care for migrant workers in Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*. doi:10.1007/s12134-015-0417-1
- Hoerster, K. D., Mayer, J. A., Gabbard, S., Kronick, R. G., Roesch, S. C., Malcarne, V. L., et al. (2011). Impact of individual, environmental, and policy-level factors on health care utilization among US farmworkers. *American Journal of Public Health*, 101(4), 685–692.
- Horton, S., & Stewart, A. (2012). Reasons for self-medication and perceptions of risk among Mexican migrant farm workers. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 14, 664–672. doi: 10.1007/s10903-011-9562-6
- International Labour Organization. (2010). *International labour migration: A rights-based approach*. Retrieved from [http://www.ilo.org/public/libdoc/ilo/2010/110B09\\_59\\_engl.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/libdoc/ilo/2010/110B09_59_engl.pdf).
- Johnston, M., & Herzig, R. (2006). The interpretation of “culture”: Diverging perspectives on medical provision in rural Montana. *Social Science and Medicine*, 63, 2500–2511.
- Karolinska Institutet. (2007). *Unequal, unfair, ineffective and inefficient – gender inequity in health: Why it exists and how we can change it*. Retrieved from [http://www.who.int/social\\_determinants/resources/csdh\\_media/wgekn\\_final\\_report\\_07.pdf](http://www.who.int/social_determinants/resources/csdh_media/wgekn_final_report_07.pdf).
- Keough, L. J. (2006). Globalizing “postsocialism” mobile mothers and neoliberalism on the margins of Europe. *Anthropological Quarterly*, 79(3), 431–461.
- Kofman, E., Phizacklea, A., Raghuram, P., & Sales, R. (2000). *Gender and international migration in Europe: Employment, welfare and politics*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Labonte, R., Mohindra, K., & Schrecker, T. (2011). The growing impact of globalization for health and public health practice. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 32, 263–283.
- Labonte, R., & Torgerson, R. (2005). Interrogating globalization, health and development: Towards a comprehensive framework for research, policy and political action. *Critical Public Health*, 15(2), 157–179.

- Lynam, M. J. (2005). Health as a socially mediated process: Theoretical and practice imperatives emerging from research on health inequalities. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 28(1), 25–37.
- MacPherson, D. W., Gushulak, B. D., & Macdonald, L. (2007). Health and foreign policy: Influences of migration and population mobility. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 85(3), 200–206.
- Marentes, C. P. (2008). *Campesina cuentos: A rhetorical analysis of female farmworkers' narratives of marginalization, resistance, and empowerment* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses. (1456746)
- Marmot, M. (2007). Achieving health equity: From root causes to fair outcomes. *Lancet*, 370, 1153–1163.
- Mazzoni, S. E., Boiko, P. E., Katon, W. J., & Russo, J. (2007). Depression and disability in seasonal and migrant Hispanic agricultural workers. *General Hospital Psychiatry*, 29, 450–453.
- McGuire, S. (2006). Agency, initiative, and obstacles to health among indigenous immigrant women from Oaxaca, Mexico. *Home Health Care Management and Practice*, 18(5), 370–377.
- McGuire, S. (2014). Borders, centers, and margins: Critical landscapes for migrant health. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 37(3), 197–212.  
doi:10.1097/ANS.0000000000000030
- McGuire, S., & Martin, K. (2007). Fractured migrant families: Paradoxes of hope and devastation. *Family and Community Health*, 30(3), 178–188.
- McLaughlin, J. (2008). Gender, health and mobility: Health concerns of women migrant farm workers in Canada. *Health Studies*, Paper 1. Retrieved from [http://scholars.wlu.ca/brantford\\_hs/1](http://scholars.wlu.ca/brantford_hs/1)
- McLaughlin, J. (2009a). Migration and health: Implications for development. A case study of Mexican and Jamaican migrants in Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program. FOCAL, *Canadian Foundation for the Americas*. Retrieved from <http://www.focal.ca/pdf/Migrant%20Health%20McLaughlin%202009.pdf>
- McLaughlin, J. (2009b). *Trouble in our fields: Health and human rights among Mexican and Caribbean migrant farm workers in Canada* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (NR71364)
- McLaughlin, J., Hennebry, J., & Haines, T. (2014). Paper versus practice: Occupational health and safety protections and realities for temporary foreign agricultural workers in Ontario. *Perspectives interdisciplinaires sur le travail et la santé*, 16(2), Retrieved from <http://pistes.revues.org/3844>
- Menendez, M., Benach, J., Muntaner, C., Amable, M., & O'Campo, P. (2007). Is precarious employment more damaging to women's health than men's? *Social Science and Medicine*, 64, 776–781.

- Messing, K., & Mager Stellman, J. (2006). Sex, gender and women's occupational health: The importance of considering mechanism. *Environmental Research*, 101, 149–162.
- Mills, M. B. (2003). Gender inequality in the global labour force. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 32, 41–62.
- Morales Waugh, I. (2010). Examining the sexual harassment experiences of Mexican immigrant farm working women. *Violence Against Women*, 16(3), 237–261.
- Mysyk, A., England, M., & Avila Gallegos, J. A. (2009). A case for certified interpreters for participants in the Canada/Mexico Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program. *Human Organization*, 68(3), 318–327.
- Narushima, M., McLaughlin, J., & Barrett-Greene, J. (2015). Needs, risks, and context in sexual health among temporary foreign migrant farmworkers in Canada: A pilot study with Mexican and Caribbean workers. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10903-015-0189-x>
- Narushima, M., & Sanchez, A. (2014). Employers' paradoxical views about temporary foreign migrant workers' health: A qualitative study in rural farms in southern Ontario. *International Journal for Equity in Health*, 13 (65). doi:10.1186/s12939-014-0065-7
- Oishi, N. (2005). *Women in motion: Globalization, state policies, and labor migration in Asia*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Organista, P. B., Organista, K. C., & Solof, P. R. (1998). Exploring AIDS-related knowledge, attitudes, and behaviors of female Mexican migrant workers. *Health and Social Work*, 23(2), 96–103.
- Orkin, A. M., Morgan, L., McLaughlin, J., Schwandt, M., & Cole, D. (2014). Medical repatriation of migrant farm workers in Ontario: A descriptive analysis. *CMAJ Open*, 2(3), E192-E198. doi:10.9778/cmajo.20140014
- Oxman-Martinez, J., Hanley, J., Lach, L., Khanlou, N., Weerasinghe, S., & Agnew, V. (2005). Intersection of Canadian policy parameters affecting women with precarious immigration status: A baseline for understanding barriers to health. *Journal of Immigrant Health*, 7(4), 247–258.
- Paciulan, M., & Preibisch, K. (2013). Navigating the productive/reproductive split: Latin American transnational mothers and fathers in Canada's temporary migration programs. *Transnational Social Review: A Social Work Journal*, 3(2), 173-192. doi:10.1080/21931674.2013.10820763
- Parrado, E. A., & Flippen, C. A. (2005). Migration and gender among Mexican women. *American Sociological Review*, 70(4), 606–632.
- Parrenas, R. S. (2005). *Children of global migration: Transnational families and gendered woes*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Parrenas, R. S. (2008). *The force of domesticity: Filipina migrants and globalization*. New York, NY: NYU Press.

- Pe-Pua, R. (2003). Wife, mother, and maid: The triple role of Filipino domestic workers in Spain and Italy. In N. Piper & M. Roces (Eds.), *Wife or worker? Asian women and migration* (pp. 157–180). Lanham, MD: Rowan & Littlefield.
- Piper, N. (2003). Feminization of labor migration as violence against women. *Violence Against Women*, 9(6), 723–745.
- Piper, N. (2006). Gendering the politics of migration. *International Migration Review*, 40(1), 133–164.
- Piper, N. (2008). International migration and gendered axes of stratification. In N. Piper (Ed.), *New perspectives on gender and migration: Livelihood, rights and entitlements* (pp. 1–18). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Preibisch, K. L. (2007). Local produce, foreign labor: Labor mobility programs and global trade competitiveness in Canada. *Rural Sociology*, 72(3), 418–449.
- Preibisch, K. L., & Encalada Grez, E. (2010). The other side of el otro lado: Mexican migrant women and labor flexibility in Canadian agriculture. *Signs*, 35(2), 289–316.
- Preibisch, K., & Hennebry, J. (2011). Temporary migration, chronic effects: The health of international migrant workers in Canada. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 183(9), 1033–1038.
- Preibisch, K., & Hermoso Santamaria, L. (2006). Engendering labour migration: The case of foreign workers in Canadian agriculture. In E. Tastsoglou & A. Dobrowolsky (Eds.), *Women, migration, and citizenship: Making local, national, and transnational connections* (pp. 107–130). Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Preibisch, K., & Otero, G. (2014). Does citizenship status matter in Canadian agriculture? Workplace health and safety for migrant and immigrant laborers. *Rural Sociology* 79(2), 174–199. doi: 10.1111/ruso.12043
- Pyle, J. L. (2006). Globalization and the increase in transnational care work: The flip side. *Globalizations*, 3(3), 297–315.
- Pysklywec, M., McLaughlin, J., Tew, M., & Haines, T. (2011). Doctors within borders: Meeting the health care needs of migrant farm workers in Canada. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 183(9), 1039–1043.
- Quandt, S. A., Chen, H., Grzywacz, J. G., Vallejos, Q. M., Galvan, L., & Arcury, T. A. (2010). Cholinesterase depression and its association with pesticide exposure across the agricultural season among Latino farmworkers in North Carolina. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 118(5), 635–639.
- Raphael, D. (2011). A discourse analysis of the social determinants of health. *Critical Public Health*, 21(2), 221–236.
- Rodriguez, R. A. (1993). *Female migrant farmworkers: The meaning of health within the culture of transience* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (9417365)



- Rodriguez, R. M. (2010). *Migrants for export*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Rojas Wiesner, M. L., & Cruz, H. A. (2008). Gendered migrations in the Americas: Mexico as country of origin, destinations, and transit. In N. Piper (Ed.), *New perspectives on gender and migration: Livelihood, rights and entitlements* (pp. 189–245). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Scantlebury, T. (2009). *Shifting responsibilities in migrant matrifocal households: A look at transnational households in the Caribbean* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (MR52262)
- Sharma, N. (2006). *Home economics: Nationalism and the making of "migrant workers" in Canada*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Sharma, N. (2012). The "difference" that borders make: "Temporary foreign workers" and the social organization of unfreedom in Canada. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.), *Legislated inequality: Temporary migration in Canada* (pp. 26-47). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Spitzer, D. (2005). Engendering health disparities. *Canadian Journal of Public Health*, 96(S2), S78–S95.
- Stasiulis, D. K., & Bakan, A. B. (2005). *Negotiating citizenship: Migrant women in Canada and the global system*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Steans, J. (2003). Gender inequalities and feminist politics in a global perspective. In E. Kofman & G. Youngs (Eds.), *Globalization: Theory and practice* (2nd ed.) (pp. 123–138). London, UK: Continuum.
- Sullivan, M. M., & Rehm, R. (2005). Mental health of undocumented Mexican immigrants. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 28(3), 240–251.
- Svensson, M., Urinboyev, R., Wigerfelt, R., Svensson, A., Lundqvist, P., Littorin, M., & Albin, M. (2013). Migrant agricultural workers and their socio-economic, occupational and health conditions: A literature review. *SSRN Working Papers*, Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2297559>
- Thurston, W., & Vissandjee, B. (2005). An ecological model for understanding culture as a determinant of women's health. *Critical Public Health*, 15(3), 229–242.
- Varela-Ramirez, A., Mejia, A., Garcia, D., Bader, J., & Aguilera, R. (2005). HIV infection and risk behavior of Hispanic farm workers at the West Texas-Mexico border. *Ethnicity and Disease*, 15(4), S92–S96.
- Vissandjee, B., Desmeules, M., Cao, Z., Abdool, S., & Kazanjian, A. (2004). Integrating ethnicity and migration as determinants of Canadian women's health. *BMC Women's Health*, 4(S1), S32–S43.

- Vissandjee, B., Thurston, W., Apale, A., & Nahar, K. (2007). Women's health at the intersection of gender and the experience of international migration. In M. Morrow, O. Hankivsky, & C. Varcoe (Eds.), *Women's health in Canada: Critical perspectives on theory and policy* (pp. 221–243). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Walia, H. (2010). Transient servitude: Migrant labour in Canada and the apartheid of citizenship. *Race and Class*, 52(1), 71–84.
- Ward, L. S. (2010a). Farmworkers at risk: The costs of family separation. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 12, 672–677.
- Ward, L. S. (2010b). Psychosocial stress and health-related quality of life for Latino migrant farmworkers. *Southern Online Journal of Nursing Research*, 10(1). Retrieved April 8, 2011, from [http://snrs.org/publications/SOJNR\\_articles2/Vol10Num01Art07.html](http://snrs.org/publications/SOJNR_articles2/Vol10Num01Art07.html).
- Weston, A. (2007). *The changing context for Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program*. Retrieved from [http://www.nsi-ins.ca/english/pdf/economic\\_context%20\\_CSAWP.pdf](http://www.nsi-ins.ca/english/pdf/economic_context%20_CSAWP.pdf).
- Whalley, L. J., Grzywacz, J. G., Quandt, S. A., Vallejos, Q. M., Walkup, M., Chen, H., et al. (2009). Migrant farmworker field and camp safety and sanitation in Eastern North Carolina. *Journal of Agromedicine*, 14(4), 421–436.
- Wolffers, I., Fernandez, I., Verghis, S., & Vink, M. (2002). Sexual behaviour and vulnerability of migrant workers for HIV infection. *Culture, Health and Sexuality*, 4(4), 459–473.
- World Health Organization. (2007). *A conceptual framework for action on the social determinants of health*. Retrieved from [http://www.who.int/social\\_determinants/resources/csdh\\_framework\\_action\\_05\\_07.pdf](http://www.who.int/social_determinants/resources/csdh_framework_action_05_07.pdf).
- World Health Organization. (2008). *Closing the gap in a generation: Health equity through action on the social determinants of health*. Retrieved from [http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2008/9789241563703\\_eng.pdf](http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2008/9789241563703_eng.pdf).
- Yeoh, B. (2005). Transnational mobilities and challenges. In L. Nelson & J. Seager (Eds.), *A companion to feminist geography* (pp. 60–73). Malden, MA: Blackwell.
- Young, L. E., & Wharf Higgins, J. (2011). Concepts of health. In L. L. Stamler & L. Yiu (Eds.), *Community health nursing: A Canadian perspective* (3rd ed.) (pp. 76–88). Toronto, ON: Pearson.
- Ziesman, A. (2013). *``Will work for food``: Canada's agricultural industry and the recruitment of South East Asian temporary migrant workers* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from [https://atrium.lib.uoguelph.ca/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10214/6763/Ziesman\\_Alia\\_201305\\_MA.pdf?sequence=1](https://atrium.lib.uoguelph.ca/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10214/6763/Ziesman_Alia_201305_MA.pdf?sequence=1)

**Chapter 3 - “I Never Thought I Would Have to do This in Canada”:  
Acts of Agency and Resistance to Structural Violence by Women  
Temporary Agricultural Workers**

Global migration is increasing: It is estimated that 105 million people have migrated for work outside of their countries of origin (International Organization for Migration, 2013). Women’s participation in migration, either with their families or independently, and with varying degrees of choice in the need to relocate, is growing at a faster pace compared to men. Contributing to the pressures to migrate for work are the processes of economic globalization (Labonte, Mohindra, & Schrecker, 2011; McGuire, 2014) and the role of state intervention in the labour markets of many high-income countries, including Canada. These processes have created and sustained a growing demand for temporary foreign workers (Preibisch, 2012; Thomas, 2010). Temporary workers are recruited into jobs that are often classified as low skilled in sectors where the work cannot be physically moved or out-sourced, such as the construction and hospitality industries, agriculture, and care-giving (Preibisch, 2007). These international and national forces have created a largely invisible and disposable workforce, about which many Canadians remain unaware. In 2013, there were almost 300,000 temporary workers in Canada and more temporary workers were admitted than permanent immigrants for work (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 2014, 2015).

The international production of food is contingent upon low-cost and replaceable labour, segregated by gender and race into different types of work (Becerril, 2007; Glass, Mannon, & Petrzela, 2014; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Rojas Wiesner & Cruz, 2008). Agriculture, which has always been a significant component of the Canadian economy, has become increasingly complex and globally competitive. The Canadian agriculture and agri-food system, which includes primary agricultural activities such as farming, as well as related activities such as the processing, distribution and sale of agricultural products, accounts for 7.0% of the gross domestic product and is a major national employer (Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 2015).

There are several federal temporary foreign worker programs whereby potential employers recruit people for agricultural labour in Canada. The Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP), which was introduced in 1966, consists of formal bilateral agreements between Canada and the participating countries of Mexico, Jamaica, Trinidad and Tobago, Barbados, and the Organization of Eastern Caribbean States (Preibisch, 2012). In 2013, there were 34,045 approved employer requests for workers in SAWP (Employment and Social Development Canada [ESDC], 2014). Workers in SAWP can be employed for a maximum of 8 months per calendar year, and can return for an unlimited number of years, if an employment contract is offered.

Introduced in 2002, the federal Low-Skill Pilot Project, now known as the Stream for Lower-Skilled Occupations (S-LSO) allowed Canadian employers to recruit people from any country in the world and for any labour sector requiring temporary workers who were classified as low skilled. Since 2011 there has been a specific Agricultural Stream within S-LSO. In 2013, 10,390 employer requests were approved for low skilled temporary workers outside of SAWP engaged in agricultural work (ESDC, 2014). Temporary workers in S-LSO can be employed for up to 2 years, with the potential for limited contract extensions. Notwithstanding the individual and family sacrifices, prospective workers actively seek these contracts as a means of providing for their families in a context where employment opportunities and resources are scarce.

### **Significance**

Migration and relocation for work are increasingly significant determinants of women's health, especially given the escalation in global migration and temporary labour pools (Vissandjee, Thurston, Apale, & Nahar, 2007). The determinants that influence health and health risks are experienced locally. However, they are reflective of structures and dynamics at local, provincial, national, and global levels that for migrants, are often harmful and perpetuate exclusion (Sargent & Larchanché, 2011). While employer demand in Canada for temporary agricultural workers has been steadily increasing, as has women's participation in that sector (Preibisch, 2012), there is limited knowledge about the health of temporary agricultural workers in Canada (Pysklywec, McLaughlin, Tew, &

Haines, 2011), particularly among women (Edmunds, Berman, Basok, Ford-Gilboe, & Forchuk, 2011; Prebisch & Encalada Grez, 2010).

In order to challenge the pervasiveness of popular ideologies and discourses that shape and often limit our thinking about migrants, Anderson et al. (2009) emphasized the necessity of exploring and analyzing “contextual knowledge about material existence” (p. 285) for those who are constructed as “different”. Investigation of the relationships among health, structural violence, agency, and resistance for women temporary agricultural workers is needed to have a more comprehensive understanding of their everyday lives. The concept of structural violence, or the systematic processes whereby social structures and institutions produce inequities, which then cause harm to individuals, communities, and populations through economic, political and social disadvantage, provides a useful lens for researchers who wish to understand lived experiences of migrants and other minority groups (Farmer, 2003; Scott-Samuel, Stanistreet, & Crawshaw, 2009). McGuire and Canales (2010) assert that our nursing discourses are influenced by the larger social and political contexts that essentialize migrants. The multiplicity of experiences of migrants is not well represented in the nursing literature and the diversity of people with vastly differing migration pathways and experiences is often minimized. Research discussed in this Chapter therefore has the potential to inform nursing and related disciplines regarding a group of women, who are themselves diverse, experiencing precarious migration status and gendered and racialized employment.

### **Purposes of the Research**

The purposes of this critical ethnography were twofold:

1. to explore and describe women temporary agricultural workers’ experiences and meanings of health in the context of prolonged and repeated uprootedness.
2. to critically examine how the intersections of current gendered, global, political and economic conditions influenced their everyday lives and work.

The aim of this Chapter is to advance understanding of how the processes of gendered structural violence operating through regional, national and international contexts shaped the women participants’ health, agency and acts of resistance. Various aspects of this

context, including neoliberal globalization and temporary forms of migration are outlined. At the same time, this Chapter draws attention to migrants' agency and resistance to structural violence. The concept and meaning of uprootedness, the formation of transformed identities created within different contexts of displacement and settlement (Berman et al., 2009), will be the subject of Chapter 4. However, it is important to recognize that cycles of lengthy and recurrent separation from home and families, discussed in Chapter 4, contributed to the structural violence of these women's lives.

### **Conceptual Framework**

**Globalization and structural violence.** Globalization can be described as a series of processes that result in increased communication, connection, and interdependence among nations, businesses, and people (Labonte & Torgerson, 2005). Within the current economic context, globalization is based on the assumptions of neoliberalism (Baum & Fisher, 2010; Rodriguez, 2010), an ideology based on the desirability of free markets, economic deregulation, limits to the role of the state, and the importance of individual autonomy and responsibility for success. International monetary policies, which include the adoption of structural adjustment programs (SAPs) in low-income countries, have enforced significant reductions in government spending in areas such as health and education. Consequences have included reduced government infrastructure and services, as well as reduced employment in publicly funded positions (Baum & Fisher, 2010; Pfeiffer & Chapman, 2010; Phoko, 2010). Other consequences have been increased levels of poverty and unemployment, resulting in internal pressures for migration (Rodriguez, 2010; Stasiulis & Bakan, 2005; McGuire, 2014). "One of globalization's most substantial impacts on population health arises from its tendency to increase economic inequality, insecurity, and vulnerability" (Labonte et al., 2011, p. 270), outcomes that particularly affect low-income countries.

The assumptions of neoliberalism also promote a "time of looking away, a time of averting our gaze from the causes and effects of structural violence" (Farmer, 2003, p. 16). Encompassing the complex interactions between social systems, power, vulnerability and gender, the resulting inequities from structural violence do not just happen to occur. They are the harmful consequences arising from, created and maintained by these

interactions, which become taken for granted unless challenged (Morales & Bejarano, 2009). The concept of structural violence has relevance for local, national and global contexts as it “helps us to identify the organizational processes and practices that structure the allocation of resources and/or determine priorities that can create and sustain conditions of privilege or disadvantage” (Anderson et al., 2009, pp. 288-289). In countries where SAPs have been implemented, reduction to publicly provided services is a form of structural violence, which has resulted in outcomes that include increased morbidity and mortality (Pfeiffer & Chapman, 2010). Structural violence is often perceived as less visible and “unintended” when compared to interpersonal violence. Morales and Bejarano (2009) point out that gendered structural violence is not inadvertent, but is directly linked to systems of subjugation that play out in everyday lives.

The forces of globalization are not gender-neutral and the effects of SAPs have disproportionately affected women. These include reductions or eliminations in health care delivery services resulting in decreased access and lengthy waiting times that severely compromise maternal-child health (Pfeiffer & Chapman, 2010). Another outcome of neoliberal globalization is the feminization of labour, the concept used to refer to the increasing number of women in global labour markets and the effects of institutionalized gender roles and relations within occupations and work-sites, as well as work that is devalued (Glass et al., 2014). While temporary forms of migration restrict prospects for permanent immigrant status and maintain a globally stratified workforce, gendered ideologies and stereotypes of women as less expensive and more compliant, caring, and reliable position both women and men into differing work-related roles and expectations (Freeman, 2010; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Steans, 2003). Arising from the outcomes of economic globalization, employment opportunities are increasingly temporary, precarious, designated as low skilled, and contribute to violence against women in direct and indirect ways (Morales & Bejarano, 2009; Piper, 2003).

**Temporary migration and structural violence.** Unlike immigrants admitted as permanent residents, who have the right to choose where they live and work, temporary workers (who are non-citizens) are denied or have restricted rights relating to

employment, social welfare, and political activity. Due to their lack of political power, non-citizens are at risk of their interests and human rights being unnoticed or ignored (Basok & Carasco, 2010). Consistent with their immigration policy objectives, high-income receiving countries, such as Canada, have developed increasingly restrictive access to citizenship. These policies accomplish two objectives: opportunities for permanent immigration for low skilled workers and their families have decreased, while the endorsement and acceptance of large numbers of temporary workers has become a deliberate process to employ workers with limited rights for certain types of labour (McLaughlin, 2010; Preibisch, 2005; Preibisch, 2010; Sharma, 2012). Temporary workers have time-limited contracts with specific employers, which are difficult to change, and they provide inexpensive and often socially and geographically isolated labour, a situation characterized as “unfree” and as transient servitude (Basok, 2002; Vogel, 2011; Walia, 2010).

International migrant workers to Canada are required to have medical pre-screening and are likely to be healthy upon arrival. However, it is the often hazardous work they perform, particularly in jobs difficult to fill with local residents, such as agriculture, that place temporary workers in circumstances that compromise their health (Preibisch & Hennebry, 2011; Svensson et al., 2013). Common health issues among migrant farm workers include musculoskeletal injuries, eye and skin problems, sexual health conditions and mental health concerns. Language-related barriers, lack of transportation, long workdays and fear of employer reprisals can prevent access to and use of health care services (Edmunds et al., 2011; Narushima, McLaughlin, & Barrett-Greene, 2015; Orkin, Morgan, McLaughlin, Schwandt, & Cole, 2014; Pysklywec et al., 2011).

**Agency and resistance to structural violence.** Agency is the capacity and ability to make choices and act in the world. It exists in tension within the context of social structures such as class, race, gender and power relations. These structures shape and often constrain opportunities for individuals and groups to take action. Yet agency, is evident as women welcome, contest, and negotiate their options and identities in potentially oppressive circumstances (Marentes, 2008; Parson, 2010; Téllez, 2008). Resistance is often perceived to be actions that are overt, collective, and public. However,



more nuanced and gendered understandings of the nature and expressions of resistance are necessary to fully explore and appreciate the depth and richness of women's agency (Bell, 2001). This also requires broader and subtler definitions of political action. Women's negotiations with dominant power are often unseen and unrecognized, especially since these interactions may have the appearance or necessity of compliance, and the gains made through resistant and courageous acts may be to maintain existing resources and rights (Bell, 2001).

There is also diversity in women's expectations in the processes of change and enactment of new roles, as well as forms of adaptation and resistance. Women migrants have been portrayed as passive victims (Dobrowolsky & Tastsoglou, 2006; Kofman, Phizacklea, Raghuram, & Sales, 2000), reflecting gendered representations of women as docile and at the mercy of forces they are powerless to control or alter. Yet, women often engage in subtle resistance in public and private realms (Oishi, 2005). Because temporary foreign workers, particularly women, are a largely invisible population, it is easy to lose sight of acts agency and resistance, or to silence workers through the discourse of victimization. It is important not to underestimate the individual and collective resilience, creativity and agency that is demonstrated in everyday life (Bell, 2001), as well as to not discount the complexity of differing individual and collective choices, identities and experiences (Gaetano & Yeoh, 2010).

## **Methodology**

The critical social theories that underlie critical ethnography are based on the epistemological assumptions that all meanings and truth are socially constructed, negotiated, context dependent and influenced by historical circumstances (Guba & Lincoln, 2005). This means that boundaries in the organization of the everyday world often serve to conceal the repressive systems and discourses that function to marginalize. As stated by Madison (2012), "critical ethnography begins with an ethical responsibility to address processes of unfairness or injustice within a particular *lived* domain" (p. 5), through identifying and articulating systems of power and control that rest upon often unquestioned assumptions about a particular social world.

Feminist theoretical and research perspectives complement critical ethnography through examining gendered roles and expectations, valuing women's experiences, and explicitly emphasizing reflexivity throughout the research process (MacDonnell, 2014). The complexities of the interrelatedness of biological sex and the social constructions of gender are also an area of focus in feminist theorizing and research, making possible the deconstruction of traditional discourses of sex and gender roles (Richardson, 2010). This necessitates an analysis of historical forces as well as current conditions, assumptions, and contexts. Both sex and gender are multidimensional constructs: sex is biologically based and encompasses the effects and physiological expressions arising from anatomy, genetic composition and hormones (Johnson, Greaves, & Repta, 2007); gender is relational, socially situated in everyday circumstances and contested within interactions of power (Swigonski & Raheim, 2011).

Current feminist thinking calls our attention to recognizing and honouring the similarities and diversities of women's personal and collective experiences, agency, and aspirations (Swigonski & Raheim, 2011). Also important has been feminist exploration of globalization examining "the tension between the dominance of the state and economic forces and women's potential resistance...and [the] dialectic between "new" opportunities and oppressions" (Olesen, 2011, p. 130). However, there are many interrelated factors in both oppression and privilege and incorporating an intersectionality analysis strengthens critical and feminist approaches. "Intersectionality is concerned with understanding the multifaceted, complex, and interlocking nature of social locations and power structures and how these shape human lives" (Hankivsky, 2014, p. 255). Intersectionality enhances explorations of diversity, disadvantage and power at individual, collective and structural levels and has been used in feminist and migration research to explore and explain the experiences of people in particular circumstances (Bastia, 2014; Hankivsky, 2014; Olesen, 2011; Viruell-Fuentes, Miranda, & Abdulrahim, 2012).

## Research Methods

The site for this research was a southwestern Ontario municipality known for its high concentration of greenhouses, employing large numbers of temporary workers performing a variety of agricultural duties. There was also a range of community agencies and services pertinent to the interests of workers, and representing a diversity of perspectives. Entry into the field needed to be planned carefully. I was familiar with the proposed site, community services, and some of the stakeholders as I was a public health nurse based in this municipality until 2003, and was involved in many community immigrant initiatives. The study proposal, including procedures to recruit participants, obtain informed consent and protect confidentiality was approved by the Research Ethics Board at Western University (Appendix B). Initial contact in the setting was made through interviewing community residents with knowledge of the social and political context, and who had experience in advocacy, service delivery, or the administration of the relevant temporary worker programs. This included: seven people involved in three temporary worker support programs; the representative for Jamaican Liaison Services, and two religious leaders.

**Recruitment.** Because the women from Mexico had very limited English, a Spanish-speaking interpreter/translator with previous research experience was engaged. Recruitment flyers, the letter of information, the consent form, and the interview guidelines were translated into Spanish (Appendices C – K). Initially, the women worker participants were recruited through the posting of written information in English and Spanish and handing out individual flyers in public settings, such as community agencies and grocery stores. English and Spanish versions of the flyer were read on a local Spanish radio program and published in a newsletter produced by a migrant worker support centre. However, emphasis was on face-to-face recruitment in order to develop trust with the potential participants and community service providers. Due to the nature of in-depth exploration in qualitative inquiry, relatively small samples of information-rich participants were chosen through purposive and snowball sampling (Patton, 2002). Criteria for participants were: a) willing to share their realities and experiences; b) had current or past employment as a temporary agricultural worker in SAWP or L-SLO; c)

were able to speak English or Spanish; d) were over the age of 18; and e) were residing in southwestern Ontario. Data collection occurred over a twenty-month period through observational fieldwork, in-depth individual and group interviews in English or Spanish, and exploration of the systems, contexts, and processes related to temporary foreign agricultural workers.

While respecting and valuing the personal agency, choices, and diversity of participants in this inquiry, I needed to be aware of and sensitive to potential difficulties, as well as potential benefits. Consultation with service providers, advocates, and potential participants was useful to assist in identifying possible risks and concerns. There were well-grounded fears among the participants of becoming publicly associated with possible criticisms of their programs and working conditions, and the risk of employer reprisals resulting in loss of employment and premature repatriation (Basok, Bélanger, & Rivas, 2014; Preibisch, 2010). These factors made it imperative to enter into relational ethics with participants (MacDonald, 2007) by giving clear information about the nature and goals of this shared research without pressure, involving participants throughout the entire process without imposition, and confirming representation during the analysis, writing, and dissemination of the research.

**Interviews.** Semi-structured interviews (Appendix L) were conducted with women from Mexico (four participants), Jamaica (seven) and the Philippines (nine). The interviews ranged from one to two hours and it was the participants' choice to be interviewed individually or in small groups of two to four people. Participants ranged in age from 27 to 49 years. The women from Mexico and Jamaica had been employed in SAWP for up to eight months per year, from 2 to 12 years. The Filipina participants had been recruited through S-LSO and had been in Canada for two to three years; none of them had as yet returned to the Philippines to visit their families. The women in SAWP were all single, with the exception of one woman who was married, and all were mothers with children ranging in age from 3 to 23 years. Six of the Filipinas were married and had children ranging in age from 2 to 11 years; three of the Filipinas were single (never married) and did not have any children (Appendix M). The sample size reflected qualitative research sampling criteria whereby small numbers of participants usually

express the full range of data related to the topic of interest (Patton, 2002), and can provide the thick description necessary for ethnographic analysis and interpretation (Marshall & Rossman, 2011).

**Participant observation.** Participant observation is generally considered to be synonymous with fieldwork and involves more than the researcher's presence. It is a lengthy process and the intent is to be personally involved in the lives of the participants in order to come to understand their world, and ultimately to share the findings (Borbasi, Jackson, & Wilkes, 2005; Wolcott, 2005). In critical ethnography there is the expectation and purpose that the lived experiences of the participants will be connected to broader historical, political, social and economic contexts. Public spaces for observation fieldwork included locations where women temporary agricultural workers were likely to congregate when not working, such as grocery stores, cafés, banks, sidewalks, malls, churches, migrant worker health fairs and local migrant worker festivals and events. An interpreter accompanied me during field experiences where we were likely to encounter many Spanish-speaking workers. Participatory activities such as being invited to visit some of the workers' residences were limited to English speaking-participants who were not housed on their employers' work sites. As trust was gained and rapport developed through contact with participants, opportunities arose for participatory activities, such as being invited to Filipino church services. Fieldwork journals were used for recording observations and thoughts, and to ground the collection of data reflecting the social construction of meaning. Initial brief notes were recorded in the field to remind me about what had occurred. Expanded and detailed notes were written as soon as possible after each immersion in the field (Emerson Fretz, & Shaw, 2011). I commented on my impressions, personal experiences, and important events prior to analyzing the fieldnotes for further areas of reflection and significance.

**Photovoice.** Participant-produced photography is increasingly used in nursing research as a method to elicit meaning, and thereby promote understanding and social action through the empowerment of those involved (Catalani & Minkler, 2010). Through the photography of everyday life, health, and work realities, photovoice asks participants to identify, represent, and advocate for their community (Wang, 1999). There are many

reasons to include photovoice within critical ethnography. Photovoice opens up the possibilities for storytelling arising from visual subjects chosen by the participants, and can be particularly useful when language and/or literacy barriers exist (Berman, Ford-Gilboe, Moutrey, & Cekic, 2001; Leipert & Smith, 2008). As well as enhancing the depth and richness of data collection and analysis, photovoice provides an additional way for participants to choose how they represent their everyday lives, lives that I was limited in directly observing due to the restrictive nature of the participants' living and working conditions. Actual implementation of this component of data collection proved quite challenging. Of the 20 women interviewed, nine agreed to participate in photovoice; eight 27-exposure disposable cameras were distributed and one woman preferred to send her photos by e-mail. Due to their temporary stay and the sometimes unpredictable work hours of many of the participants, only three out of the eight disposable cameras were collected and follow-up interviews were difficult to arrange. Because of the limited number of photographs, this data is not included in the analysis.

### **Data Analysis**

Ethnographic analysis utilizes an iterative process “to detect and interpret thematic categorisations, search for inconsistencies and contradictions, and generate conclusions about what is happening and why” (Thorne, 2000, p. 69). Data analysis in critical ethnography reflects the purposes of the methodology, which are to expose and analyze the themes and processes associated with power relations through the lived experiences of the participants, and contribute to emancipatory knowledge (Baumbusch, 2011; Bransford, 2006; Manias & Street, 2001; Thomas, 1993). A critical theoretical perspective becomes the analytic lens through which the data are interpreted (Madison, 2012) providing insight arising from particular contexts (Aluwihare-Samaranayake, 2010).

Participant interviews were audiotaped and transcribed verbatim. For the purposes of consistency, a single Spanish-speaking interpreter participated in the interviews with the Mexican women and also completed those transcriptions (Squires, 2008, 2009; Wallin & Ahlström, 2006). Then, because English was the common language between the interpreter/ translator and me (KE), the Spanish sections of the transcripts were translated

into English (Farquhar et al., 2008; Squires, 2009). Ongoing dialogue took place between me and the interpreter/translator regarding the perspectives we brought to the research (Temple, 2002; Wong & Poon, 2010). Debriefing sessions followed the interviews and field work experiences, allowing for discussion and additional recording of reflections (Clingerman, 2006; Wallin & Ahlström, 2006).

Preliminary analysis of the transcripts and fieldnotes through marginal notes was done (Grbich, 2007; Liamputtong, 2009), then the interviews, fieldwork data and reflections were entered into Atlas.ti, to assist in the organization, coding, linking, and retrieval of the data (Frieze, 2012). Immersion in the data was a fluid process and enhanced the discovery of dynamic interactions, shifts and changes in the production of knowledge, and the processes of power and resistance. Analytical exploration for emerging categories, patterns and themes, and ultimately for the critique of relevant structures and systems occurred through cycles of coding (Saldaña, 2009; 2011), reflexively, and in collaboration with the participants and the interpreter/translator. To be critically reflexive meant recognizing the privileged role of research (and the researcher) in potentially facilitating liberation and/or sustaining oppression (Madison, 2012; Reyes Cruz & Sonn, 2011).

Thematic data analysis transpired through the reading and rereading of transcripts, fieldnotes and relevant documents, including the review of the literature (Edmunds et al., 2011) for deeper understanding and the discovery of ambiguities, contradictions and divergent perspectives (Madison, 2012). Particular attention was given to how dominant practices and contexts reproduced or sustained constraining systems and policies (Bransford, 2006; Grbich, 2007), and how participants represented their lives in the context of temporary work and/or distanced themselves from the representations of others while enacting agency (Cloyes, 2006).

## **Findings**

The findings related to structural violence and expressions of agency and resistance are framed within four themes:

1. No Choice But to Leave: The Context of Globalization, with the sub-theme of The Dialectic of Leaving and Staying
2. We Fear We May not Return Again: The Context of Temporary Agricultural Work, with the sub-themes of Constraints of the Temporary Worker Contracts and Permanent Immigration Status Denied: Gendered and Racialized Streaming
3. We Can't get Sick: The Context of Work and Health in Canada, with the sub-themes of The Stress of Being Strong and The Necessity of Staying Healthy
4. Taking Action: The Context of Agency and Resistance

### **No Choice But to Leave: The Context of Globalization**

*So I have no choice because I was thinking what if, what if my kids will go to college? What will I do and my, and my husband has no permanent work. We have to survive. So the mother instinct...my kids have to go to school, my kids [are] everything. I have to provide.*

For all of the women interviewed, the decision to seek temporary foreign work arose from the intersection between local necessity and global forces. As described in the cited globalization literature, they reported limited, poorly paid and often insecure employment in their countries of origin. Even when work was available (and for the married Filipinas when their husbands were employed as well), salaries were inadequate to support their families and children. A Filipina said: “*[I migrated] mainly because of financial situations, like you work there, you work like sometimes 5 days a week but then you still can't pay your own bills, like you work for yourself, how about your family ...?*” Another woman said: “*That's why we're here. Many people [in Mexico], a lot of work, but there are so many people, and they pay very little*”.

Current globalization practices exert economic pressure on both sending and receiving countries. According to the World Bank (2012), remittances to low-income countries (the monies sent home by workers who have migrated), were expected to be \$406 billion USD in 2012, an increase of 6.5% from 2011, and three times the amount of official development assistance. Remittances are increasingly essential not only for the financial security of families, but also as a necessary source of revenue for sending countries, as local economies deteriorate, opportunities for work become limited, and wages remain



low (Cohen, 2011). The Philippines, Mexico and Jamaica have long histories of promoting the international migration of their citizens for the remittances sent home. It is in the economic interests of both sending and receiving countries to encourage and institutionalize temporary migration, creating and maintaining global pools of segmented, relatively inexpensive and mobile labour to meet the needs of profit-driven free markets.

**The dialectic of leaving and staying.** All the participants with children spoke about their leaving as a necessary “sacrifice” as mothers providing for their children, albeit a sacrifice that came with great pain and at a very high cost. McGuire and Martin (2007) describe this as a paradox of hope and despair, where economic and material benefits are merged with emotional distress and geographical distance. The women framed their decisions to migrate as a reflection of maternal responsibility, which was expressed both in terms of meeting basic needs for food, such as bread and milk, and the purpose of their children achieving a better future. Their children’s education was a paramount goal for all the women who were mothers, as a Jamaican woman explained: *“It’s an opportunity...[We] come on the program, to manage circumstances back home, like children’s education...we want to achieve certain things for ourselves and our family”*. Some of the Jamaican women had attended an agricultural school sponsored by their government as preparation for applying to SAWP: *“[We went] back to school to give them [their children] a better education”*. Three of the participants had never been married and did not have children. For these women, responsibility for providing for their families, particularly their siblings’ education was also vital.

Traditional gendered ideologies are reinforced by constructing women who migrate independently as sacrificing for their families, especially their children. This serves the purpose of legitimizing state interests in the export of its female citizens for work. In the Philippines, the gendered construction of maternal care as sacrifice and responsibility has been successfully promoted by the federal government to make acceptable, encourage, and institutionalize the migration of women (Guevarra, 2006; Parreñas, 2005). While this construction may not be as explicitly or overtly endorsed in all sending countries, migrant women have internalized these gendered meanings of sacrifice and duty (Carling, Menjivar, & Schmalzbauer, 2012; Contreras & Griffith, 2012; Glass et al., 2014;

Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010). At the same time, the women participants saw themselves as contradicting the traditional role of being physically present to provide care and nurturing because of their independent migration and the productive work of contributing to the economic well-being of their families (Gardiner Barber, 2008; Carling et al., 2012).

As discussed by Marentes (2008), individuals “may embrace, oppose, or barter with the different “subject positions” available to them” (p. 76), defined within the contexts of their everyday lives. For some of the women interviewed, subverting gender roles through the lens of maternal responsibility included contesting the notion of women as weaker. A Filipina said:

*You are not called a woman if you don't do such things like being strong, calm, and accept things to work. Because we are not thinking of anything but for their [children's] goodness...and because they are our spirit, we are happy if our kids [look] happy. I'm stronger than my husband, I think. We are stronger to fight for the good of our family.*

A Mexican woman explained: “*In fact we women really are more responsible than the men because well if our children don't have bread...and if we don't have the means to get it, we have to work*”. However, as stated by Contreras and Griffith (2012) “the paradox of gender roles transgression is that while the women are in fact able to gain independence from male partners and become self-reliant breadwinners, they also reaffirm and reinforce traditional gender roles related to child rearing and parenting” (p. 61).

An important aspect of reinforcing traditional gender roles discussed in the literature and by the participants was the role of female relatives providing care for their children, even when husbands were present (Carling et al., 2012; Contreras & Griffith; 2012; Paciulan & Preibisch, 2013; Scantlebury, 2009). Reproductive work, which is traditionally done by women, is “the labor needed to sustain the [paid] labor force” (Parreñas, 2000, p. 561). Such work includes caring for family members, especially children, housework and preserving family connections. All of the women participants with children had support in their countries of origin from female relatives, most often their mothers. For the

Filipinas, it was their mothers and sisters, rather than their husbands' female relatives, who contributed to the reproductive care at home. One woman summed it up by referring to her mother's supportive role back home as: *"Mother is the best"*. Another said: *"My husband is just a driver, and...[my mother] will take care of my kids. She's always there every time they are sick, whatever they need my mother is always there"*. The Mexican and Jamaican women interviewed referred to support from both their mothers and sisters. Maternal responsibility for the women relatives in the countries of origin meant being actively present in order to support their absent daughters and sisters and care for the children left behind.

### **We Fear We May not Return Again: The Context of Temporary Agricultural Work**

*Because the threat is that we are not permanent [residents] here...Because we don't want to go back again to live with nothing...we are tired of thinking about poverty.*

For applicants to SAWP (the women from Jamaican and Mexico), approval for employment in the program was through a process managed by the Ministries of Labour in their home countries. Women (and men) from participating SAWP countries have only one destination - Canada. Participants in SAWP did not report any contact with third-party recruiters, who are agents based in the countries of origin of potential employees, and are hired by employers to recruit workers on their behalf. All the Filipinas interviewed, who were in S-LSO with less government oversight, reported exploitation by recruiters. These abuses included limited or misleading orientation in the Philippines regarding the Canadian temporary worker program to which they were applying, being charged unnecessary fees, i.e. fees for which the employer was responsible, and then being instructed *"not to tell anyone that we paid...such and such fees in the Philippines"*. The result was that they arrived in Canada thousands of dollars in debt.

The use of formal and informal networks and sources of information related to employment opportunities was evident for all the participants. The Filipinas in particular, spoke about the discussions they had had with families and friends (Gardiner Barber, 2008). This was due, in part, to a 'global sensibility' arising from the long history of migration from the Philippines to many countries in the world, an awareness of choices of countries and programs, and the perception of North America as the "best" destination.

One Filipina said: *“Everybody wanted to go out and come to Canada, but few are chosen. That’s what people say”*.

**Constraints of the temporary foreign worker contracts.** The nature and specifications of both temporary programs supplying migrant agricultural labour contributed to structural and gendered violence. Because SAWP is a set of binding bi-national agreements between Canada, Mexico and participating Caribbean countries, there is limited flexibility for the employers and the workers. This can sometimes be protective in that most of the obligations and expectations on both sides are clearly laid out, but also functions to maintain an oppressive system that controls the personal and work lives of employees. Other Canadian temporary foreign worker programs are not as prescribed for employers, which can lead to increased abuses of the system and the workers, particularly in recruitment (Ziesman, 2013). All low skilled workers in agriculture are subject to conditional and constraining contracts with one employer. This means that workers cannot obtain other employment in Canada unless the new employer has jobs that are classified for temporary foreign workers. As mentioned previously, workers have been characterized as “unfree” due to their lack of mobility rights and ineligibility for permanent residency (Basok, 2002).

Temporary agricultural workers in Canada are often fearful of losing employment either through dismissal and repatriation prior to the end of their contract, or not being offered reemployment (Basok et al., 2014; McLaughlin, 2010; Preibisch, 2010). The Jamaican women reported that they were not notified if their employers would request their renewal in SAWP for the following year until after they had completed their contract for the current year and were back home. Because of the importance of their economic contributions to their families this created a sense of apprehension and uncertainty while in Canada and upon their return. As summarized by a Mexican woman: *“Because we fear that we may not return again...You come here because you have a need”*. These factors result in pressure to become an “ideal worker”, those who “work hard, obey rules, and are completely flexible; they do not aspire to advance their position, develop personal or romantic relationships, or settle in Canada” (McLaughlin, 2010, p. 80). By becoming compliant in order to lessen the threat of repatriation for themselves, workers support and

participate in the power relations of the “deportation regime” (Basok et al., 2014). Among the women in S-LSO, there was confusion and lack of knowledge regarding contract renewal after two years. Some women used informal networks, including friends, for information; others were more overt in using formal sources of information and assistance, such as local Legal Aid Services. A Filipina said: “...*we have lots of questions about our situations, ...they [employers and agents] threaten us to send home...it’s just the thought that we, we have to pay our debts in coming here*”.

**Permanent immigration status denied: Gendered and racialized streaming.** In receiving countries such as Canada, migrant women are more likely than men to be streamed into lower skilled occupations, thus they are deskilled, with reduced opportunity to obtain employment for which they have been educated and qualify for permanent residency status (Benería, Deere, & Kabeer, 2012; Sharma, 2006; Stasiulis & Bakan, 2005). Deskilling was experienced by those participants with post-secondary education, which included most of the Filipinas. A Filipina who was a social worker reflected on her previous community development work, and said: “*So here...yeah, I’m working as a vegetable packer...not working with people anymore...yeah, I really miss my work*”. When we were discussing how women were streamed into low skilled temporary work she identified: “*I think that’s discrimination*”. Jamaican participants mentioned: “*We have some, some ladies here that went to university and so on, they work here*”.

Employers of temporary agricultural workers can request workers based on country of origin and gender (McLaughlin, 2010; Perry, 2012), thus gendered and racialized streaming was reflected in the place of employment and type of work. The Filipina participants were recruited en masse in a group of 30 for a vegetable packing house and noted that men and women performed different tasks, with the men’s work requiring more physical strength. The women were assigned to packing and weighing the produce, while the men loaded the skids. This operation also reflected racial streaming, with mainly Filipino men and women, some Mexican men and only a few Jamaican men. The Jamaican women also noted that the men had the heavier and more dangerous work at their site. Employees were mainly Jamaican, with more women than men in the greenhouses. The women were engaged in the harvesting and packing of tomatoes. As

one woman said: *“I dream of tomatoes, everyday tomatoes”*. The Mexican women interviewed reported doing the same work as the men at their place of employment. This could have been due to the structure of their place of work, which was a small farming and canning operation.

With the exceptions of the Live-in-Caregiver Program (LCP) and provincial nominee programs where temporary workers can be sponsored by employers to become permanent residents, most low skilled temporary workers will not qualify for permanent immigration status in Canada, regardless of years employed in this country (Gomez, 2011; Hennebry & McLaughlin, 2012; Preibisch, 2012). The Filipinas were aware that the LCP was categorized as a lower-skilled occupation in Canada’s job classification system, which reflects gendered values about the reproductive work usually performed by women. Because it is highly competitive to obtain a position in the LCP, successful applicants usually need to have professional qualifications such as being nurses and teachers, an aspect of the program that has been critiqued as deliberate deskilling (Gardiner Barber, 2008; Stasiulus & Bakan, 2005). The Filipina participants all reported that they believed they would have the same right to apply for permanent residency in Canada as the people (overwhelmingly women) who participate in the LCP. It was not until after they arrived in Canada that they discovered this would not be the case and felt they had been misled by the recruiters. *“It was only when we were here that we do, did some research... We cannot apply for permanent residency.” “They [recruiters] cheat you, it’s really disgusting”*. For the Filipinas, this was an issue of fairness and equity: *“Like we should be given same, same rights as the other immigrants... the nannies, they are under the low skilled, they can apply for permanent residency unlike us...”*.

All the Filipina participants desired permanent residency in Canada and temporary work was viewed as a strategy for that purpose. In addition to the economic security, permanent immigration status was seen as the long-term solution to reuniting their families. As expressed by one woman: *“[We will] have to start all over again, if we don’t have any future in here”*. Three of the four Mexican participants stated they would live in Canada, if given the opportunity. One of them said: *“...I would like to live here but with my children... I would like to live here because there are more possibilities, I think...for*

*my children to go to school and have me working*". The Jamaican women interviewed did not want to permanently relocate their families to Canada. However, they felt that their time spent employed in Canada should count toward a more secure immigration status and they were very aware of the labour and economic contributions they had been making as temporary foreign workers. One woman said: *"How many years we travel we don't get permanent, why?...And we spend a lot of money...in this country"*. The Jamaican participants wanted the choice and *"the right to decide"* to travel back and forth freely themselves, as well as the easing of visa requirements and restrictions so their family members could visit them in Canada.

### **We Can't get Sick: The Context of Work and Health in Canada**

*...nobody takes care of us so we need to take care of ourselves... we need to stay always healthy...*

Access to health care services was affected by the location of the participants' housing and ability to speak English. English was not the first language for any of the participants, though it was only the Mexican women who had very limited English-speaking and literacy skills. Some women reported that *"the employer doesn't care if you're sick"*. The women in SAWP were housed out of town in bunkhouses next to their work-sites. Asking their employers for transportation for medical needs could be challenging, although some women reported that transportation was readily provided by their employer for illnesses. However, if they were taken to the Emergency department of the local hospital the wait times were excessive. The Filipina participants were housed in the centre of the local town, close to a walk-in medical clinic with evening and weekend hours, and did not require transportation. Medical care was sought mainly for acute care episodes, though some of the participants engaged in health promotive actions at the walk-in clinic, such as Pap tests.

Ontario Health Insurance Plan (OHIP) coverage is provided for temporary workers, though unlike most new residents to Ontario who experience a three month waiting period, people employed in SAWP are eligible for OHIP coverage on arrival. In addition, some extended health benefits, such as payment for prescription medications, are provided by the employers. Employers of workers in S-LSO were required to purchase

private insurance until those employed were eligible for OHIP coverage (Hennebry & McLaughlin, 2012). However, extended health benefits were not provided to the participants in that program at the time of the interviews. Without extended health benefits, access to services provided by dentists and optometrists was limited due to the financial cost. Participants felt the quality of health care was generally good, with the exception of preventive and rehabilitation care for repetitive strain injuries (RSIs). OHIP coverage and benefits for all workers ceased when the employment contracts ended.

**The stress of being strong.** Participants described their health holistically; “*when you feel good about yourself...[health means] everything*”; in relation to their roles, “*being strong...taking care of your family*”; and pragmatically, “*we cannot be sick*”. Their determination to take care of themselves was tied to the economic necessity of preserving their employment, as was also found by Brock, Northcraft-Baxter, Escoffery and Green (2012) and Horton and Stewart (2012). As voiced by one participant: “*So I cannot decide to just go home. What will happen with my family if I go home?*”. Maintaining their health was perceived to be more difficult in Canada due to the emotional pressure and stress of thinking about their families and the long hours of work, which often resulted in physical pain. Jamaican women talked about not having the time to eat properly because too many people were scheduled for their lunch break at the same time. They believed stress could cause damage them “*inside*” and that “*no matter how strong we are, there are times stress get the better of us*”. The Jamaican women also raised the issue of limited sick benefits if they were ill while in Canada and some of the women expressed concern regarding the long-term effects of the chemicals used in the greenhouses. Some of the Filipina participants described the strain inherent in the unequal power relations between themselves and their employer’s agent: “*So it’s...stressful, and it could affect my health physically too. Can’t sleep. Cannot eat well.*”

**Living with injuries.** The majority of the participants in this research reported upper body RSIs, in the hands, wrists, arms and shoulders. They attributed their injuries to long hours of work and the constant and repetitive movements involved in packing vegetables or harvesting tomatoes. For those packing vegetables, pain was exacerbated by working in cool conditions; one participant mentioned that her hands were often numb



from the cold: *“I...use two or three gloves just to go away from the pain.”* Another woman said: *“I woke up...in the middle of the evening and like all my hand was so numb, and then I have to use my left hand to shake my right hand”*. When the women sought medical treatment, the advice given was primarily for symptom management. One woman said: *“I was told [by a physician] to put on wrist bands and soak in hot water when I get home from work”*. Some participants purchased arm or wrist braces themselves as these were not provided by the employers. Many used over-the-counter pain medications. Repetitive strain and musculoskeletal injuries are the most commonly reported injuries among farmworkers, and self-care is the most commonly utilized management (Anthony, Martin, Avery, & Williams, 2010; Brock et al., 2012; Horton & Stewart, 2012), though the occupational health of women engaged in agricultural work is under-studied (Andersson & Lundqvist, 2014; Habib & Fathallah, 2012).

Most of the participants were uncertain of the benefits available to temporary workers through the provincial Workplace Safety & Insurance Board and were unsure how to go about filing a claim. However, they were aware of the consequences of injuries and that compensation was limited. Participants knew colleagues who had been injured while working in Canada and were unable to continue their employment, *“No, after the [temporary foreign worker] program, they got damage and they [the employers] send them home.”* The structural violence inherent in the status of temporary workers, who are easily replaced and essentially disposable (Hennebry, McLaughlin, & Preibisch, 2015; Horton & Stewart, 2012; McLaughlin, Hennebry, & Haines, 2014; Preibisch & Otero, 2014), contributed to the compromised physical health and injuries experienced by the participants.

**The necessity of staying healthy.** Participants felt that they had no choice but to remain once they were employed in Canada as temporary foreign workers. They believed they were individually responsible for staying healthy and that it was critically important to do so. A Filipina participant said: *“because it is implanted on my mind that of course I wanted work, that I have to do [this]... I will help myself, and that I’m always doing what is...for me to go away from sickness”*. Yet in many cases they were dependent on the goodwill of employers to gain access to health care services. As stated by a Mexican

woman: “...since they [employers]... don’t want to take us to the doctor, then this is how we deal with it: we take a pill and move on.” All the participants expressed their agency when discussing the importance of maintaining their health through good nutrition, including taking vitamin supplements, getting enough sleep and staying active outside of work. Collective health promotive activities included talking to and supporting each other, having a sense of humour and being in regular communication with their families. One woman described the effects of sharing her experiences with her friends and colleagues as “*feeling lighter*”. For many of the participants religion was an important part of their lives: “*Yeah the friends I have and then..... my family, having communication every day with my family, that keeps me strong and then of course God is always there*”.

### **Taking Action: The Context of Agency and Resistance**

*Everybody has to decide for themselves [what actions to take or not take]. But we could also help ourselves too, not to hide from the truth, that we are afraid.*

All the women framed their decision to migrate to Canada as an act of agency within the options available to them, and expressed their resistance to conditions in their countries of origin by actively seeking temporary work. A Filipina said: “*It is my choice to come here and work*”, and for the Filipina participants there was a strong awareness of global employment possibilities. Some had relatives who had worked in other countries and two of the participants had previous experience working in Israel and Taiwan. A group of Jamaican women reflected upon the benefits of being employed as temporary foreign workers, which included opportunities for personal development framed by their economic contributions: “*You have a good experience. We get to meet other people....and a different exposure of [agricultural] production...We get to be more independent...Being here in [another] country...Making the money to go home* “. All the women demonstrated constant and unwavering perseverance to remain employed in order to provide for their families. Yet, the contradiction of agency for women temporary agricultural workers is that the independence achieved by their employment occurs within the context of confining and restrictive immigration status and work environments, and dependence on their employers for work, transportation and housing (Contreras & Griffith, 2012). Unequal power relations and the fear of potential reprisals were apparent in all aspects of

the women's lives.

The women interviewed were aware of the injustices in their lives relating to relocating independently for work, precarious immigration status, constraining work contracts, and the effects on their health. As found by Preibisch and Encalada Grez (2010), agency and resistance were expressed in a variety of ways, from private discussions in 'safe spaces' in which they supported each other, to public declarations of the unfairness embedded in temporary foreign worker programs. However, it was only some of the Filipina participants who engaged in overt public challenges to the systems of exploitation, such as meeting with advocacy and Legal Aid organizations, and participating in public demonstrations and media interviews. A Filipina, who had a background in community development felt strongly that she needed to be vocal, and said *"Especially when you feel, and you know that people are being oppressed, and you are doing nothing about it, it's....just accepting everything they [people in power] say"*. Being employed in S-LSO was the first time any of the Filipinas had worked in Canada and the collective resistance some felt was required to question their precarious work and immigration status was unanticipated. As expressed by one woman, reflecting upon her perception prior to arrival of Canada as a country with equitable immigration and employment standards, *"I never thought I would have to do this in Canada"*. Another woman said: *"It's so bad. Why are they doing that to the people who are putting food on your table?"*.

Not all of the Filipinas interviewed were as publicly (or privately) critical of their situation. A participant who was supportive of the actions being taken to contest their immigration status recognized that some of her colleagues *"had a different kind of thinking"*. The Mexican and Jamaican women interviewed, while not participating in collective public resistance, challenged conditions within their workplaces by questioning reduced hours of work on behalf of some of their colleagues, and *"looking out for one another"* when supervisors were present. Indeed, agreeing to be interviewed for this research was an act of agency and resistance with much at stake. When asked to comment on the interview, many of the participants stated that it was *"good to talk"* because of being able to share their experiences. Another dimension was the act of speaking to someone who was not a temporary worker. One woman said: *"At least we have*

*somebody outside our community... ”; another woman said: “it was good...because you could hear our questions...you heard our voices”. A Mexican woman commented: In my case, I feel good because I feel like I was able to get a few things off my chest...this tension of feeling ‘who can I talk to about what is happening here’...that there is somebody who listens to us.*

While the experiences and realities of oppression sustain marginalization and produce dominant discourses that limit enactments of agency and resistance, “women have the capacity to position themselves within discourses, choose from discursive positionings or indeed resist and create new discourses” (Pini, 2005, p. 3). As discussed by Morales and Bejarano (2009), unlike some structural violence positions that portray those experiencing violence as unaware of the systemic causes, the participants in this research were alert to the causes and outcomes of power differentials at all levels of their experiences. They acted individually and collectively demonstrating the force of agency in the context of existing and harmful public assumptions (Benbow, Forchuk, & Ray, 2011).

Diversity in the complex expressions of resistance was influenced by the countries of origin and the temporary foreign worker program of the participants. The Filipinas were educated in English, most had post-secondary education resulting in professional careers, and had the awareness that there were other choices for work globally. They were housed in town, which facilitated meeting with other workers and contact with members of an advocacy group planning a public protest. The program in which they were employed was relatively new and employed about equal numbers of men and women. In contrast, the women in SAWP were housed on their employer’s work-sites and geographically isolated. Language barriers existed for the Mexican women. Even though SAWP has been in existence since 1966, women from Mexico were not admitted into the program until 1989 and only 2 to 3% of workers are female (Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010). While both programs are paternalistic and exploitative, the gendered structured of oppression for women may be more entrenched in SAWP (Scantlebury, 2009).

## **Discussion**

Ethnographic inquiry focuses on meaning in context and the development of relationships with community members over time. A critical ethnographical approach informed by feminist and intersectional perspectives specifically includes the analysis of inequities at multiple levels that may act to limit knowledge and constrain choice, and the subsequent potential for transformation of participants' choices for action and change. Examining the structures, contexts and power relations of temporary agricultural work classified as low skilled revealed that the discourses surrounding gendered migration and temporary foreign workers served to reinforce some power relations (e.g. the roles of the state and the employers) and hide or distort others (e.g. gendered hierarchies of work that limit women's roles and opportunities).

The outcomes of globalization are often portrayed as inevitable in the dominant discourses controlled by those with economic and political power, yet there are many manifestations of contested and alternative interests expressed through personal and collective agency and resistance (Barndt, 2008; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Steans, 2003). Within the interrelated processes of systemic disadvantage resulting in structural violence, the participants conveyed both the imperative need to migrate and that their decisions represented more than economic survival for their families. Migration occurred so that their children could have an increased potential for educational and personal success currently, and in the future. There is a growing body of research exploring the experiences of women migrant farmworkers (Marentes, 2008; Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010; Scantlebury, 2009; Ziesman, 2013), a population often overlooked and considered invisible both globally and in the communities in which they are employed. This inquiry was the first Canadian research with women temporary agricultural workers in both SAWP and S-LSO specifically exploring the tensions, complexities and opportunities of expressing agency and resistance to structural violence, and the first nursing research with women temporary agricultural workers in Canada.

## **Limitations**

Even though the participants came from three countries and two temporary worker programs, it was a limitation of the research that the women who agreed to participate

came from similar groups employed at the same work-sites. Once a trusting relationship had been established with one participant from a particular group, the recruitment of other participants tended to be from that circle of acquaintances. Another limitation was the methodological issues created by language barriers and the use of an interpreter/translator, which could have lessened understanding of the nuances of meaning, and the analysis of the data (Squires, 2009). However, the ongoing dialogue and debriefing between me and the interpreter/translator also stimulated reflection of and insights to the interview and fieldwork experiences.

### **Implications for Research and Change**

Nurses in interdisciplinary partnership with communities need to contribute to the critical debate and advocacy that “is urgently required in Canada on the health implications of social and economic policies that render the health of populations of secondary importance to the economic system” (Alvaro et al., 2012, p. 98). Currently, funding and eligibility for the support services offered by immigrant settlement agencies does not extend to temporary foreign workers. To date, temporary workers are not included in federal health research, such as the Canadian Community Health Survey or the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada, which are rich sources of population health data. The social determinants of health affect men and women differently (Bierman et al., 2012), yet there is limited knowledge regarding how these determinants differentially affect men and women temporary agricultural workers. While access to health care is provided “on paper”, there are many barriers to health care and treatment for occupational health concerns that are not being addressed by federal and provincial governments (Hennebry et al., 2015; McLaughlin et al., 2014). Acknowledgement of and research concerning the intersections of gendered structural violence and the social determinants of health is required. While an interdisciplinary approach to the health of temporary workers from a human rights and determinants of health perspective is valuable and necessary, greater involvement by nurses and other health-care researchers and providers is needed. Inquiry from a strength-based approach is also called for, to more fully explore how women’s resiliencies and diverse forms of resistance influence their health, particularly within the contexts of specific temporary worker programs.

## **Conclusion**

Temporary agricultural work for the women participating in this research was seen as an important opportunity, albeit one that came with significant costs to personal health and well-being due to lengthy and recurrent separation from families and the physical strain of repetitive work. Restrictive employment contracts, financial deception by recruiters, and the wide-spread monitoring of activities at work and in employer-provided housing, led to acts of resistance. The degree to which these actions were covert or overt was influenced by the type of temporary worker program in which the women were registered, the geographical location of their residences, and their proficiency in English. Locally experienced structural violence, particularly affecting women, was embedded within regional, national and international contexts of globalization and linked to the political and economic organization of temporary employment, shaping both possibilities and constraints for agency and resistance. One of the many paradoxes in the migration of agricultural labour is that women and men must leave their countries, and in many cases the land that can no longer sustain them, to participate in the growing and distribution of food elsewhere in order to feed the families left behind. Temporary agricultural workers grow the food necessary for our existence, yet the business of food production relies on mobile, inexpensive and easily replaceable labour, while maintaining gendered hierarchies and ideologies of work.

## References

- Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. (2015). *An overview of the Canadian agriculture and agri-food system: 2014*. Retrieved from <http://www.agr.gc.ca/eng/about-us/publications/economic-publications/alphabetical-listing/an-overview-of-the-canadian-agriculture-and-agri-food-system-2014/?id=1396889920372>
- Aluwihare-Samaranayake, D. S. (2010). Interpretation: A political and social practice. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 33(3), 256-268.
- Alvaro, C., Jackson, L. A., Kirk, S., McHugh, T. L., Hughes, J., Chircop, A., & Lyons, R. F. (2011). Moving Canadian governmental policies beyond a focus on individual lifestyle: Some insights from complexity and critical theories. *Health Promotion International*, 26(1), 91-99.
- Anderson, J. M., Rodney, P., Reimer-Kirkham, S., Browne, A. J., Basu Khan, K., & Lynam, M. J. (2009). Inequities in health and healthcare viewed through the ethical lens of critical social justice: Contextual knowledge for the global priorities ahead. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 32(4), 282-294.
- Andersson, E., & Lundqvist, P. (2014). Gendered agricultural space and safety: Towards embodied, situated knowledge. *Journal of Agromedicine*, 19, 303-315. doi:10.1080/1059924X.2014.916644
- Anthony, M. J., Martin, E. G., Avery, A. M., & Williams, J. M. (2010). Self care and health- seeking behavior of migrant farmworkers. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 12, 634-639.
- Barndt, D. (2008). *Tangled routes: Women, work, and globalization on the tomato trail* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Lanhan, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Basok, T. (2002). *Tortillas and tomatoes: Transmigrant Mexican harvesters in Canada*. Montreal, PC: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Basok, T., Bélanger, D., & Rivas, E. (2014). Reproducing deportability: Migrant agricultural workers in south-western Ontario. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 40(9), 1394-1413. doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2013.849566
- Basok, T., & Carasco, E. (2010). Advancing the rights of non-citizens in Canada: A human rights approach to migrant rights. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 32(2), 342-366. doi:10.1353/hrq.0.0150
- Bastia, T. (2014). Intersectionality, migration and development. *Progress in Development Studies*, 14(3), 237-248. doi: 10.1177/1464993414521330
- Baum, F., & Fisher, M. (2010). Health equity and sustainability: Extending the work of the Commission on the Social Determinants of Health. *Critical Public Health*, 20(3), 311-322.
- Baumbusch, J. L. (2011). Conducting critical ethnography in long-term residential care: Experiences of a novice researcher in the field. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 67(1), 184-192. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2010.05413.x



- Becerril, O. (2007). Transnational work and the gendered politics of labour: A study of male and female Mexican migrant farm workers in Canada. In L. Goldring & S. Krishnamurti (Eds.), *Organizing the transnational: Labour, politics, and social change* (pp.157-172). Vancouver, BC: UBC Press.
- Bell, B. (2001). *Walking on fire: Haitian women's stories of survival and resistance*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Benbow, S., Forchuk, C., & Ray, S. L. (2011) Mothers with mental illness experiencing homelessness: A critical analysis. *Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing*, 18(8), 687-695. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2850.2011.01720.x
- Benería, L., Deere, D. D., & Kabeer, N. (2012). Gender and international migration: Globalization, development, and governance. *Feminist Economics*, 18(2), 1-33. doi: 10.1080/13545701.2012.688998
- Berman, H., Alvernaz Mulcahy, G., Forchuk, C., Edmunds, K., Haldenby, A., & Lopez, R. (2009). Uprooted and displaced: A critical narrative study of homeless, aboriginal, and newcomer girls in Canada. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 30(7), 418-430.
- Berman, H., Ford-Gilboe, M., Moutrey, B., & Cekic, S. (2001). Portraits of pain and promise: A photographic study of Bosnian youth. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 32(4), 21-41.
- Bierman, A. S, Johns, A., Hyndman, B., Mitchell, C. Degani, N., Shack, A. R.,...Parlette, V. (2012). Social determinants of health and populations at risk. In A. S Bierman (Ed.), *Project for an Ontario women's health evidenced-based report: Volume 2, Chapter 12* (pp. 1-187). Toronto, ON: St. Michael's Hospital and the Institute for Clinical Evaluation Sciences. Retrieved from <http://powerstudy.ca/wp-content/uploads/downloads/2012/10/Chapter12-SDOHandPopsatRisk.pdf>
- Borbasi, S., Jackson, D., & Wilkes, L. (2005). Fieldwork in nursing research: Positionality, practicalities and predicaments. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 51(5), 493-501.
- Bransford, C. L. (2006). The use of critical ethnography in managed mental health care settings. *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*, 33(4), 173-191.
- Brock, M., Northcraft-Baxter, L., Escoffery, C., & Green, B. L. (2012). Musculoskeletal health in South Georgia farmworkers: A mixed methods study. *Work*, 43, 223–236. doi:10.3233/WOR-2012-1368
- Carling, J., Menjivar, C., & Schmalzbauer, L. (2012). Central themes in the study of transnational parenthood. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(2), 191-217. doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2012.646417
- Catalani, C., & Minkler, M. (2010). Photovoice: A review of the literature in health and public health. *Health Education & Behavior*, 37(3), 424-451. doi: 10.1177/1090198109342084

- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2014). *Canada facts and figures 2013. Immigration overview: Temporary residents*. Retrieved from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/2013-Facts-Temporary.pdf>
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2015). *Canada facts and figures 2014. Immigration overview: Permanent residents*. Retrieved from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/2014-Facts-Permanent.pdf>
- Clingerman, E. (2006). Conceptualizations of health among Mexican and Mexican American women employed in migrant farm work. *Hispanic Health Care International*, 4(1), 45-55.
- Cloyes, K. G. (2006). An ethic of analysis: An argument for critical analysis of research interviews as ethical practice. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 29(2), 84-97.
- Cohen, J. H. (2011). Migration, remittances, and household strategies. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 40, 103–14. doi: 10.1146/annurev-anthro-081309-145851
- Contreras, R., & Griffith, D. (2012). Managing migration, managing motherhood: The moral economy of gendered migration. *International Migration*, 50(4), 51-66. doi:10.1111/j.1468-2435.2012.00771.x
- Dobrowolsky, A., & Tastsoglou, E. (2006). Crossing boundaries and making connections. In E. Tastsoglou & A. Dobrowolsky (Eds.), *Women, migration, and citizenship: Making local, national, and transnational connections* (pp.1-35). Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Edmunds, K., Berman, H., Basok, T., Ford-Gilboe, M., & Forchuk, C. (2011). The health of women temporary agricultural workers in Canada: A critical review of the literature. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 43(4), 68–91.
- Emerson, R., Fretz, R., & Shaw, L. (2011). *Writing ethnographic fieldnotes* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Employment and Social Development Canada. (2014). *Number of temporary foreign worker positions on positive Labour Market Impact Assessments (LMIA's) under the Agricultural Occupations*. Retrieved from [http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign\\_workers/lmo\\_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml](http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign_workers/lmo_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml)
- Farmer, P. (2003). *Pathologies of power: Health, human rights and the new war on the poor*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Farquhar, S., Samples, J., Ventura, S., Davis, S., Abernathy, M., & McCauley, L.,...Shadbeh, N. (2008). Promoting the occupational health of indigenous farmworkers. *Journal of Immigrant & Minority Health*, 10, 269-280.
- Freeman, C. (2010). Myths of docile girls and matriarchs: Local profiles of global workers. In J. Goodman (Ed.), *Global perspectives on gender and work: Readings and interpretations* (pp. 289-303). London, UK: Rowan & Littlefield.
- Friese, S. (2012). *Qualitative data analysis with ATLAS.ti*. London, UK: SAGE.

- Gaetano, A. M., & Yeoh, B. S. A. (2010). Introduction to the special issue on women and migration in globalizing Asia: Gendered experiences, agency, and activism. *International Migration*, 48(6), 1-12. doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2435.2010.00648.x
- Gardiner Barber, P. (2008). The ideal immigrant? Gendered class subjects in Philippine–Canada migration. *Third World Quarterly*, 29(7), 1265–1285. doi:10.1080/01436590802386385
- Glass, C. M., Mannon, S., & Petrzela, P. (2014). Good mothers as guest workers: Constructing the trope of compliant maternity in Spain’s strawberry industry. *International Journal of Sociology*, 44(3), 8–22. doi:10.2753/IJS0020-7659440301
- Gomez, T. (2011). Low-skill temporary work and non-access to permanent residence. Ottawa, ON: FOCAL.
- Grbich, C. (2007). *Qualitative data analysis: An introduction*. London: SAGE.
- Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). Paradigms and perspectives in contention. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp.191-216). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Guevarra, A. R. (2006). Managing ‘vulnerabilities’ and ‘empowering’ migrant Filipina workers: The Philippines’ Overseas Employment Program. *Social Identities*, 12(5), 523-541. doi:10.1080/13504630600920118
- Habib, R. R., & Fathallah, F. A. (2012). Migrant women farm workers in the occupational health literature. *Work*, 41, 4356-4362. doi:10.3233/WOR-2012-0101-4356
- Hankivsky, O. (2014). Rethinking care ethics: On the promise and potential of an intersectional analysis. *American Political Science Review*, 108(2), 252-264. doi:10.1017/S0003055414000094
- Hennebry, J. L., & McLaughlin, J. (2012). “The exception that proves the rule”: Structural vulnerability, health risks, and consequences for temporary migrant farm workers in Canada. In P. T. Lenard & C. Strachle (Eds.), *Legislated inequality: Temporary labour migration in Canada* (pp. 117-138). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press.
- Hennebry, J. L., McLaughlin, J., & Preibisch, K. (2015). Out of the loop: (In)access to health care for migrant workers in Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*. doi:10.1007/s12134-015-0417-1
- Horton, S., & Stewart, A. (2012). Reasons for self-medication and perceptions of risk among Mexican migrant farm workers. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 14, 664–672. doi:10.1007/s10903-011-9562-6
- International Organization for Migration (2013). *Migration initiatives 2014: Health of migrants*. Retrieved from [http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/Migration\\_Initiatives2014\\_web.pdf](http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/Migration_Initiatives2014_web.pdf)

- Johnson, J. L., Greaves, L., & Repta, R. (2007). *Better science with sex and gender: A primer for health research*. Vancouver, BC: Women's Health Research Network.
- Kofman, E., Phizacklea, A., Raghuram, P., & Sales, R. (2000). *Gender and international migration in Europe: Employment, welfare and politics*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Labonte, R., Mohindra, K., & Schrecker, T. (2011). The growing impact of globalization for health and public health practice. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 32, 263–283.
- Labonte, R., & Torgerson, R. (2005). Interrogating globalization, health and development: Towards a comprehensive framework for research, policy and political action. *Critical Public Health*, 15(2), 157–179.
- Liamputtong, P. (2009). Qualitative data analysis: Conceptual and practical considerations. *Health Promotion Journal of Australia*, 20(2), 133-139.
- Leipert, B., & Smith, J. (2008). Using photovoice to explore rural older women's health promotion needs and resources. In P. Armstrong & J. Deadman (Eds.), *Women's health: Intersections of policy, research, and practice* (pp. 135-150). Toronto: Women's Press.
- MacDonald, H. (2007). Relational ethics and advocacy in nursing: Literature review. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 57(2), 119–126. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2006.04063.x
- MacDonnell, J. A. (2014). Enhancing our understanding of emancipatory nursing: A reflection on the use of critical feminist methodologies. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 37(3), 271–280. doi:10.1097/ANS.0000000000000038
- Madison, D. S. (2012). *Critical ethnography: Method, ethics, and performance* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Manias, E., & Street, A. (2001). Rethinking ethnography: Reconstructing nursing relationships. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 33(2), 234-242.
- Marentes, C. P. (2008). *Campesina cuentos: A rhetorical analysis of female farmworkers' narratives of marginalization, resistance, and empowerment* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses. (1456746)
- Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (2011). *Designing qualitative research* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- McGuire, S. (2014). Borders, centers, and margins: Critical landscapes for migrant health. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 37(3), 197-212. doi:10.1097/ANS.0000000000000030
- McGuire, S., & Canales, M. K. (2010). Of Migrants and metaphors: Disrupting discourses to welcome the stranger. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 33(2), 126–142.
- McGuire, S., & Martin, K. (2007). Fractured migrant families: Paradoxes of hope and devastation. *Family & Community Health*, 30(3), 178-188.

- McLaughlin, J. (2010). Classifying the “ideal migrant worker”: Mexican and Jamaican transnational farmworkers in Canada. *Focaal—Journal of Global and Historical Anthropology*, 57, 79–94. doi:10.3167/fcl.2010.570106
- McLaughlin, J., Hennebry, J., & Haines, T. (2014). Paper versus practice: Occupational health and safety protections and realities for temporary foreign agricultural workers in Ontario. *Perspectives interdisciplinaires sur le travail et la santé*, 16(2), Retrieved from <http://pistes.revues.org/3844>
- Morales, M. C., & Bejarano, C. (2009). Transnational sexual and gendered violence: An application of border sexual conquest at a Mexico-US border. *Global Networks*, 9(3), 420-439.
- Narushima, M., McLaughlin, J., & Barrett-Greene, J. (2015). Needs, risks, and context in sexual health among temporary foreign migrant farmworkers in Canada: A pilot study with Mexican and Caribbean workers. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10903-015-0189-x>
- Oishi, N. (2005). *Women in motion: Globalization, state policies, and labor migration in Asia*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Olesen, V. (2011). Feminist qualitative research in the millennium’s first decade: Developments, challenges, prospects. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research* (4<sup>th</sup> ed., pp. 129-146). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Orkin, A. M., Morgan, L., McLaughlin, J., Schwandt, M., & Cole, D. (2014). Medical repatriation of migrant farm workers in Ontario: A descriptive analysis. *CMAJ Open*, 2(3), E192-E198. doi:10.9778/cmajo.20140014
- Paciulan, M., & Preibisch, K. (2013). Navigating the productive/reproductive split: Latin American transnational mothers and fathers in Canada’s temporary migration programs. *Transnational Social Review: A Social Work Journal*, 3(2), 173-192. doi:10.1080/21931674.2013.10820763
- Parreñas, R. S. (2000). Migrant domestic workers and the international division of reproductive labor. *Gender & Society*, 14(4), 560-581. doi:10.1177/089124300014004005
- Parreñas, R. S. (2005). *Children of global migration: Transnational families and gendered woes*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Parson, N. (2010). “I am not [just] a rabbit who has a bunch of children!”: Agency in the midst of suffering at the intersections of global inequalities, gendered violence, and migration. *Violence Against Women*, 16(8), 881-901. doi:10.1177/1077801210376224
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

- Perry, J. A. (2012). Barely legal: Racism and migrant farm labour in the context of Canadian multiculturalism. *Citizenship Studies*, 16(2), 189-201. doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2012.667611
- Pfeiffer, J., & Chapman, R. (2010). Anthropological perspectives on structural adjustment and public health. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 39, 149-165.
- Pheko, L. L. (2010). Gender, economic globalization, movement and citizenship. *Development*, 53(3), 402-406.
- Pini, B. (2005). Farm women: Driving tractors and negotiating gender. *International Journal of Sociology of Agriculture and Food*, 13(1), 1-12. Retrieved from <http://ijsaf.org/archive/13/1/pini.pdf>
- Piper, N. (2003). Feminization of labor migration as violence against women. *Violence Against Women*, 9(6), 723-745.
- Preibisch, K. (2005). Gender transformative odysseys: Tracing the experiences of transnational migrant women in rural Canada. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 24(4), 91-97.
- Preibisch, K. (2007). Local produce, foreign labor: Labor mobility programs and global trade competitiveness in Canada. *Rural Sociology*, 72(3), 418-449.
- Preibisch, K. (2010). Pick-your-own labor: Migrant workers and flexibility in Canadian agriculture. *International Migration Review*, 44(2), 404-441. doi:10.1111/j.1747-7379.2010.00811.x
- Preibisch, K. (2012). Migrant workers and changing work-place regimes in contemporary agricultural production in Canada. *International Journal of Sociology of Agriculture and Food*, 19(1), 62-82.
- Preibisch, K. L., & Encalada Grez, E. (2010). The other side of el otro lado: Mexican migrant women and labor flexibility in Canadian agriculture. *Signs*, 35(2), 289-316.
- Preibisch, K., & Hennebry, J. (2011). Temporary migration, chronic effects: The health of international migrant workers in Canada. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 183(9), 1033-1038. doi:10.1503 /cmaj.090736
- Preibisch, K., & Otero, G. (2014). Does citizenship status matter in Canadian agriculture? Workplace health and safety for migrant and immigrant laborers. *Rural Sociology* 79(2), 174-199. doi: 10.1111/ruso.12043
- Pysklywec, M., McLaughlin, J., Tew, M., & Haines, T. (2011). Doctors within borders: Meeting the health care needs of migrant farm workers in Canada. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 183(9), 1039-1043. doi:10.1503/cmaj.091404
- Reyes Cruz, M., & Sonn, C. C. (2011). (De)colonizing culture in community psychology: Reflections from critical social science. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 47, 203-214. doi:10.1007/s10464-010-9378-x
- Richardson, S. S. (2010). Feminist philosophy of science: History, contributions, and challenges. *Synthese*, 177, 337-362. doi: 10.1007/s11229-010-9791-6

- Rodriguez, R. M. (2010). *Migrants for export*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Rojas Wiesner, M. L., & Cruz, H. A. (2008). Gendered migrations in the Americas: Mexico as country of origin, destinations, and transit. In N. Piper (Ed.), *New perspectives on gender and migration: Livelihood, rights and entitlements* (pp. 189-245). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Saldaña, J. (2009). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Saldaña, J. (2011). *Fundamentals of qualitative research: Understanding qualitative research*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Sargent, C., & Larchanché, S. (2011). Transnational migration and global health: The production and management of risk, illness, and access to care. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 40, 345-361.
- Scantlebury, T. (2009). *Shifting responsibilities in migrant matrifocal households: A look at transnational households in the Caribbean* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (MR52262)
- Scott-Samuel, A., Stanistreet, D., & Crawshaw, P. (2009). Hegemonic masculinity, structural violence and health inequalities. *Critical Public Health*, 19(3-4), 287-292.
- Sharma, N. (2006). *Home economics: Nationalism and the making of 'migrant workers' in Canada*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Sharma, N. (2012). The "difference" that borders make: "Temporary foreign workers" and the social organization of unfreedom in Canada. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.), *Legislated inequality: Temporary migration in Canada* (pp. 26-47). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Squires, A. (2008). Language barriers and qualitative nursing research: Methodological considerations. *International Nursing Review*, 55(3), 265-273.
- Squires, A. (2009). Methodological challenges in cross-language qualitative research: A research review. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 46, 277-287.
- Stasiulis, D. K., & Bakan, A. B. (2005). *Negotiating citizenship: Migrant women in Canada and the global system*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Steans, J. (2003). Gender inequalities and feminist politics in a global perspective. In E. Kofman & G. Youngs (Eds.), *Globalization: Theory and practice* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., pp. 123-138). London, UK: Continuum.
- Svensson, M., Urinboyev, R., Wigerfelt, R., Svensson, A., Lundqvist, P., Littorin, M., & Albin, M. (2013). Migrant agricultural workers and their socio-economic, occupational and health conditions: A literature review. *SSRN Working Papers*, Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2297559>

- Swigonski, M. E., & Raheim, S. (2011). Feminist contributions to understanding women's lives and the social environment. *Journal of Women and Social Work*, 26(1), 10-21. doi:10.1177/0886109910392517
- Téllez, M. (2008). Community of struggle: Gender, violence, and resistance on the U.S./Mexico border. *Gender & Society*, 22(5), 545-567.
- Temple, B. (2002). Crossed wires: Interpreters, translators, and bilingual workers in cross-language research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 12(6), 844-854.
- Thomas, D. (2010). *Foreign nationals working temporarily in Canada*. (Catalogue no. 11-008-X). Retrieved from <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11-008-x/2010002/article/11166-eng.pdf>
- Thomas, J. (1993). *Doing critical ethnography*. Newbury Park, CA: SAGE.
- Thorne, S. (2000). Data analysis in qualitative research. *Evidence Based Nursing*, 3, 68-70.
- Viruell-Fuentes, E. A., Miranda, P. Y., & Abdulrahim, S. (2012). More than culture: Structural racism, intersectionality theory, and immigrant health. *Social Science & Medicine*, 75, 2099-2106. doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2011.12.037
- Vissandjee, B., Thurston, W., Apale, A., & Nahar, K. (2007). Women's health at the intersection of gender and the experience of international migration. In M. Morrow, O. Hankivsky, & C. Varcoe (Eds.), *Women's health in Canada: Critical perspectives on theory and policy* (pp. 221-243). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- Vogel, R. D. (2011). Transient servitude and work in the twenty-first century. *WorkingUSA: The Journal of Labor and Society*, 14, 393-409.
- Walia, H. (2010). Transient servitude: Migrant labour in Canada and the apartheid of citizenship. *Race & Class*, 52(1), 71-84.
- Wallin, A-M., & Ahlström, G. (2006). Cross-cultural interview studies using interpreters: Systematic literature review. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 55(6), 723-735.
- Wang, C. C. (1999). Photovoice: A participatory action research strategy applied to women's health. *Journal of Women's Health*, 8(2), 185-92.
- Wong, J. P-H., & Poon, M. K-L. (2010). Bringing translation out of the shadows: Translation as an issue of methodological significance in cross-cultural qualitative research. *Journal of Transcultural Nursing*, 21(2) 151-158. doi:10.1177/1043659609357637
- Wolcott, H. (2005). *The art of fieldwork* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press.
- World Bank (2012). *Migration and development brief 19: Migration and Remittances Unit, Development Prospects Group*. Retrieved from <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPROSPECTS/Resources/334934-1288990760745/MigrationDevelopmentBrief19.pdf>



Ziesman, A. (2013). *``Will work for food``: Canada's agricultural industry and the recruitment of South East Asian temporary migrant workers* (Master's thesis).

Retrieved from

[https://atrium.lib.uoguelph.ca/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10214/6763/Ziesman\\_Alia\\_201305\\_MA.pdf?sequence=1](https://atrium.lib.uoguelph.ca/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10214/6763/Ziesman_Alia_201305_MA.pdf?sequence=1)

## **Chapter 4 - Intentional Uprootedness:**

### **Women Temporary Agricultural Workers in Canada**

Global mobility due to environmental change, conflict and the need for employment is increasing. There are 232 million international migrants world-wide (International Organization for Migration [IOM], 2014), of whom 105 million have migrated for work outside their countries of origin (IOM, 2013). The numbers of women migrating independently for work has also risen, bringing new potential for empowerment as well as new responsibilities and obligations (IOM, 2014). The global pressures of economic globalization and state intervention in labour markets have contributed to both the need for people from low-income countries to migrate for work, and the growing demand by high-income countries to intentionally utilize temporary foreign workers in a variety of sectors (Labonte, Mohindra, & Schrecker, 2011; Hennebry, McLaughlin & Preibisch, 2015). In 2013, there were almost 300,000 temporary workers in Canada and more temporary workers were admitted than permanent immigrants for work (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 2014, 2015).

The temporary agricultural workforce in Canada is heavily masculinized, though the number of women workers is increasing. Agricultural production in Canada represents almost 7.0% of the gross domestic product and is a major employer (Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 2015) relying on temporary foreign workers. The Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP), which was established in 1966, is a series of formal bilateral agreements between Canada and 11 participating Caribbean countries, (Employment and Social Development Canada [ESDC] (2015). In 2013, there were 34,045 approved employer requests for workers in SAWP (Employment and Social Development Canada [ESDC], 2014). In this program, workers can be employed for an unrestricted number of years, for up to eight months per calendar year. In 2002, the federal Low Skilled Pilot Project was introduced. Recruitment by Canadian employers for workers in jobs designated as low skilled was not limited to specific countries or labour sectors (Preibisch & Hennebry, 2012). A Stream for Lower Skilled Occupations (S-LSO) has since replaced the pilot project. Workers in this program can be offered a 24 month contract, with the potential for limited extensions before they are required to leave

Canada. In 2012, 10,390 employer requests were approved for agricultural workers in S-LSO (ESDC, 2014). Due to the lack of available employment in the workers' countries of origin, temporary contracts are valued and sought in order to provide for current and future family needs.

### **Purposes of the Research**

The purposes of this critical ethnography were:

1. to explore and describe women temporary agricultural workers' experiences and meanings of health in the context of prolonged and repeated uprootedness
2. to critically examine how the intersections of gendered relations within global, political and economic conditions influenced their everyday lives and work.

The concept of uprootedness refers to dislocation within different contexts of displacement and settlement (Berman et al., 2009). This concept is particularly relevant for low skilled temporary workers, who must migrate alone, and who experience relocation within cycles of lengthy and recurrent separation from home and families.

### **Significance**

Apfelbaum (2000) asserted that as a result of political catastrophes and economic realities, the latter part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century was the "era of uprootedness". This era has continued into the 21<sup>st</sup> century due to our increasing global mobility. Matters of migration call our attention to "both the social structure of national societies and the life strategies of individual actors" (Andreotti, Le Gales, & Fuentes, 2013, p. 42). The international movement of people, particularly refugees, has been conceptualized as the "problem" of those who are torn, damaged, and external to their proper spatial location (Malkki, 1992). Dominant social discourses regarding different types of migrants and the element of "choice" in decisions to relocate "have dichotomized this phenomenon into voluntary and involuntary categories that deny the historical and structured economic privations that breed the need to migrate" (McGuire & Georges, 2003, p. 190). Migrant experiences of uprootedness are essentialized and framed as conditions characterized by often devastating personal loss, or as freely selected individual options. These characterizations function to negate the contexts of history and existing structural influences, drawing our attention away from the larger forces at play (Malkki, 2007).

The entrenchment of economic globalization has intensified the need for large, itinerant workforces (Sharma, 2012). There is limited research regarding how health is influenced by the personal and collective uprootedness of temporary work (Downe, 2006). Women in migrant agricultural work experience significant health inequities due to systemic and structural barriers (Edmunds, Berman, Basok, Ford-Gilboe, & Forchuk, 2011). We know little about how women temporary workers in this sector experience their migration and gendered work in Canada (Scantlebury, 2009; Ziesman, 2013). There is also limited evidence regarding these women's health, particularly related to how they make sense of their lives within the constraints and opportunities of their immigration and employment status (Edmunds, et al., 2011; Prebisch, & Encalada Grez, 2010).

Given the rich conceptual and metaphorical history of uprootedness in the social sciences and the increased awareness of the importance of place in studies of culture and health (Poland, Lehoux, Holmes, & Andrews, 2005), there is a need to discover the meanings and implications of uprootedness on health, and the relationships among nursing theory, practice, and current conceptualizations of those who are uprooted. The concept of uprootedness is currently underutilized in the nursing literature as it relates to the lived experience of migrants. Listening to how people create meaning within displacement can lead to a much richer, layered, and multi-dimensional understanding of similar and diverse migration experiences, including the contexts of power that surround and are embedded in local, national and international discourses.

### **The Concept of Uprootedness**

Uprootedness is often used as a metaphor to frame the experiences of those who are displaced by anticipated or unanticipated events. Explication and research into the concept of uprootedness can be found in the anthropology (Becker & Beyene, 1999; Downe, 2006; Malkki, 1992, 1995; Silverstein, 2004), social psychology (Apfelbaum, 2000), sociology (Andreotti et al., 2013), women's studies (Ahmed, Castaneda, Fortier, & Sheller, 2003), and nursing literature (Berman et al., 2009). The experiences and meanings of uprootedness have been explored with diverse populations in varied locations. These include: refugees in the United States, Tanzania, and France (Becker & Beyene, 1999; Malkki, 1992, 1995; Silverstein, 2004); sex trade workers in Canada and

the Caribbean (Downe, 2006); Aboriginal, homeless, and immigrant girls in Canada (Berman et al., 2009); and upper middle class managers in Europe (Andreotti et al., 2013).

Apfelbaum (2000) depicted uprootedness as a form of oppression, whereby people were silenced after often forced and irreversible separation from existing connections to place and space. In one of the richest analyses, Malkki (1992, 1995) discussed how arborescent, or tree-oriented, language has led to conceptualizations of uprootedness as being torn, ruptured from one's "natural" identity, and culturally and nationally disconnected. Like Silverstein (2004) and Apfelbaum (2000), Malkki (1995) linked how images of the sedentary nature of roots, which are then severed, produced universalized and essentialized conceptualizations of refugees as people who are traumatized and damaged, and where displacement irrevocably leads to a loss of culture and identity. The state of being uprooted became characterized as a usually permanent displacement and disruption from one's usual home and community.

Rootedness then meant to become someone who was planted and grounded in a particular physical space and whose identity came from that association. This interpretation results in fixed boundaries that can both strengthen the relationships among some groups of people, while maintaining the marginalization of others. However, Malkki's (1992) ethnographic fieldwork with Hutu refugees in Tanzania revealed some of the complexities through which people undertake ways of reconstructing "home" and rootedness. Her research demonstrated how diverse experiences of exile shaped distinct reconstructions of identity and boundaries, and was valuable in illustrating that different identities can be constructed within differing locations of displacement.

As Ahmed et al. (2003) emphasized, we need to look beyond dichotomized constructions of uprooted/rooted and consider the multiplicity of experiences, contexts and systemic forces that influence the movement of people. The transformation of identity through developing relationships in new locations was demonstrated in the work by Downe (2006) and Berman et al. (2009). Downe conducted her narrative analysis with young women who were engaged in cross-border sex work. Her participants had cultivated the ability to be "at home" in geographically diverse places through the relationships they

established with each other. Similarly, Berman et al. (2009) in their critical narrative study with Aboriginal, homeless and newcomer young women, found that within a diversity of experiences of uprootedness, participants negotiated often dangerous spaces in order to discover new ways of forging connections and a sense of belonging.

In their study with urban middle class managers, Andreotti et al. (2013) also found experiences of relocation to be nuanced and multifaceted. Their research did not support the assumption that increasing global mobility necessarily results in a decreased sense of belonging to the communities and countries of origin. Instead, the participants maintained their attachment and sense of rootedness and connection to their homes and neighbourhoods. The concept of “elective belonging” was useful whereby “increased mobility, along with the capacity to access a range of social spaces and networks, considerably expands the playing field of possibilities in terms of how individuals experience their sense of belonging to, and negotiate their involvement in, a given locality” (Andreotti et al., 2013, p. 44). There was a dynamic relationship between transnationalism and rootedness. These findings were congruent with Malkki’s (1992) and Patchett’s (2013) assertions regarding the usefulness of conceptualizing roots, rather than being sedentary and fixed, as having the properties of rhizomes. That is, roots can change and develop by altering their physical location, and can form connections in both expected and unexpected ways.

Dominant themes of uprootedness in the reviewed literature included: the contribution of escalating global mobility to increasing uprootedness and dislocation; and that adaptive and dynamic identities, which are subject to a multiplicity of past and present attachments and external influences, are formed through these experiences. The development of active strategies in order to reconstruct individual and collective identities is shaped by the opportunities, constraints and contexts of the current circumstances. To date, the conceptual development of uprootedness has mainly occurred in the social sciences literature. One article from nursing (Berman et al., 2009) conceptualized uprootedness through a critical-feminist lens, and similar to the uprootedness literature in the social sciences, emphasized personal and collective agency, diversity of experiences and the influences of structures and systems. Yet in much of the nursing literature, the

complexity and variety of experiences of migration, culture and relocation, both within and among groups of people, remains minimized.

### **Methodology**

Within a critical theoretical approach, this research utilized the methodology of critical ethnography. Epistemological assumptions of critical social theories include: that relations of power grounded in social and historical contexts underlie all knowledge, and that experiences of the lived world and its interactions are always complex (Kincheloe, McLaren, & Steinberg, 2011). Ethnography and critical ethnography involve the study of culture. However, “whereas an aim of ethnography is to describe and interpret culture, critical ethnography aims to change it, by analyzing hidden agendas, ‘taken for granted’ assumptions and working towards disrupting the status quo” (Baumbusch, 2011, p. 185). There is a focus on revealing how the structures, policies and discourses that oppress and maintain marginalization are concealed within social and institutional settings. The purpose of critical ethnography is to describe, analyze and then attend to the injustices arising from the often unexamined and existing power relations within a particular context (Madison, 2012).

Incorporating feminist perspectives within this methodology contributed to: valuing women’s lived experiences as authentic and important; a strengthened emphasis on continuous reflexivity; examination of power relations within multiple systems of oppression; the creation of collaborative relationships between the participants and the researcher throughout the research process; and valuing the diversity inherent in multiple perspectives (Campbell & Wasco, 2000; Lather, 1991; Marshall & Rossman, 2011). This diversity is anticipated, sought, and valued in critical ethnography (Madison, 2012) and is strengthened through the use of a feminist lens. Like gender, culture is grounded in history, yet is situated in the current location; it is complex, fluid, contested, and imbued with power and discursive relations (Reyes Cruz & Sonn, 2011; Wong & Poon, 2010). According to Browne et al. (2009), culture is a “dynamic, power laden process created by people in relation to one another, their environments, and sociopolitical and historical contexts” (p. 173). Culture influences and is influenced in return by the embodied experiences of place and space (Andrews, 2003; Low, 2009), and cultural experiences of

health are embedded in the local power relations in which they occur (Poland et al., 2005).

### **Research Methods**

The research was conducted in southwestern Ontario, in a setting with high numbers of temporary foreign workers engaged in a range of agricultural tasks. Data collection occurred over a twenty-month period through participant-observation fieldwork, in-depth individual and group interviews, and exploration of the systems, contexts, and processes related to the temporary worker programs of interest. The study proposal was approved by the Research Ethics Board at Western University (Appendix B) and included procedures to recruit participants, obtain informed consent, protect confidentiality, and to utilize interpreters/translators. Flyers for recruitment, the letter of information, consent form, and interview guidelines were available in English and Spanish (Appendices C - K), and an interpreter was present during the recruitment of and interviews with Spanish-speaking participants. In order to identify potential risks and concerns of being interviewed for the research, consultation took place with service providers, community advocates and potential participants.

There are ethical challenges in conducting qualitative research arising from the purposes and expectations of both the researcher and participants (Eide & Kahn, 2008). Even in studies with little or no risk, people may feel it is too onerous to take part (Moore & Miller, 1999), or may mistrust the purposes of the researcher (Cooper et al., 2004). The majority of participants in this research were particularly sensitive about speaking about their lives in Canada and entering into a collaborative research relationship given well-founded fears of retribution, which could result in loss of employment and premature repatriation (Preibisch, 2010). These factors made relational ethics, which focus on the experience of relationships within a context of mutual respect and engagement, particularly important (Bearskin, 2011; MacDonald, 2007). Strategies employed to foster a “relational ethic” included giving clear information about the nature and goals of the research and involving participants throughout the entire process without pressure or imposition. The growth of relationships, co-construction of knowledge during interviews and data analysis, and hopes for the impact of the research occurred and evolved over



time and within the broader sociopolitical context of the temporary worker programs and the setting. Therefore, ongoing consent was appropriate for this inquiry (Kaiser, 2009; Madison, 2012) and encouraged mutual participation. At subsequent interviews after the initial written consent had been given, discussion took place with all participants to reconfirm their willing and informed involvement.

Purposive and snowball sampling were used during the recruitment process, which took place over 20 months, reflecting the length of time needed to gain trust and establish relationships among different groups of women workers. A total of 20 women participated in semi-structured interviews lasting one to two hours, either individually or in groups of two to four people (Appendix L). The participants included: four women from Mexico, seven women from Jamaica and nine women from the Philippines; their ages ranged from 27-49 years. Employed within SAWP, the women from Mexico and Jamaica had been working in Canada for up to eight months per year, over a period of 2 to 12 years. All the women in SAWP were mothers, with children aged 3 to 23 years. The Filipina participants were employed through what is now S-LSO. They had been in Canada from two to three years and had not yet returned to the Philippines to visit their families. Three of the Filipina participants had never been married and did not have children; six Filipinas were married and had children aged 2 to 11 years (Appendix M).

### **Data Analysis**

Data analysis in qualitative research begins with and is maintained during data collection, writing and reporting of the research (Carter & Little, 2007). In ethnography, forms of analysis need to reflect the diversity and significance of social and cultural expressions (Atkinson & Delamont, 2005). The primary goals of critical ethnographic analysis are to connect the lived experiences of participants to issues of power inherent in broader political and social structures and contribute to emancipatory knowledge (Mahon & McPherson, 2014; Thomas, 1993). It is the investigation and interpretation of culture in order to analyze and critique established social conditions and ideologies (Koro-Ljunberg & Greckhamer, 2005).

Thematic analysis “provides a rich and detailed, yet complex, account of the data” (Vaismoradi, Turunen, & Bondas, 2013, p. 400) due to the focus on layers of context, from which patterns are identified, and ultimately, underlying themes (Joffe & Yardley, 2004; Saldaña, 2011). All Interviews were audiotaped and transcribed verbatim. A Spanish-speaking interpreter/translator with previous research experience was recruited and participated in the interviews with the Mexican women, completed the transcriptions in the languages used and then translated the Spanish text into English (Squires, 2008, 2009; Wong & Poon, 2010). In keeping with the interpreter/translator’s active role in the construction of knowledge during the interviews, she collaborated in the data analysis through meetings to review transcripts and debrief fieldwork experiences. The interview transcripts were entered into the Atlas.ti qualitative software program, along with my reflections and observational data from fieldnotes in order to facilitate the organization, coding and retrieval and analysis of the data (Frieze, 2012; Grbich, 2007). Through the linking and relinking of the data during cycles of coding, the processes of power relations were explored. I engaged in critical reflexivity throughout the research process as I examined how my position, role and assumptions could influence relationships, my representation of the research and change (Madison, 2012; MacDonnell, 2014; McCabe & Holmes, 2009).

## **Findings**

The findings related to experiences of uprootedness and health within the context of Canadian temporary agricultural programs are framed within three themes:

1. The Certainty of Uncertainty: Creating and Maintaining Uprootedness, with the subthemes of Living with Precarious Work and The Ambiguities of Being Apart.
2. Competing Commitments: Self, Family and Uprootedness, with the subthemes of The Necessity of Overcoming and Finding Health in Displacement.
3. Becoming Rooted: Connection and Disconnection, with the subthemes of Meanings of Home and Community and The Paradox of Connection.

### **The Certainty of Uncertainty: Creating and Maintaining Uprootedness**

*Hopefully, hopefully I can have my vacation because my kids, they're longing for me ...I will be there [home] and I just think, that it's o.k. that I can see them...And leave again, I don't know how many years more.*

Designed and endorsed by the Canadian government, the structure and constraints of temporary foreign worker programs for low skilled workers deliberately create and sustain recurrent physical and emotional uprootedness (Barnes, 2013; Preibisch & Hennebry, 2012; Sharma, 2012). Contracts with a designated employer strengthen the social boundaries of marginalization through “unfree” mobility, entrenched servitude, and unequal power relations (Basok, 2002; Foster & Taylor, 2013). Even though men and women temporary foreign workers in Canada undertake a “planned” form of repeated uprootedness in that they actively apply for employment opportunities, workers’ lives are governed by constant uncertainty reinforced by the economic need to find employment outside of their countries of origin and the time-limited contracts of temporary work. For the participants in this study, their experiences initially involved doubt about what to expect when they first arrived for work. One woman said:

*It is because, it's like probably at first when you are just about to start, you don't know what is going to take place, or how are you going to adjust to it...*

**Living with precarious work.** The conditions under which the agricultural temporary foreign worker programs were organized caused tension with regard to contract renewal. All the participants expressed uncertainty about continued employment and possible renewal within their programs, related to being dependent on having a work contract specific to one “named” employer. While it was not impossible to change employers, the workers had to find another employer who would be eligible (by having positions designated for people with temporary work permits), and who would agree to hire them. For the women in SAWP, uncertainty was maintained regarding contract renewals when the women returned home every year. They were not informed for a number of weeks if they would be offered work by their employers for the subsequent year. As expressed by a Jamaican woman “*And if they call you back...That we can come back*”. The Filipinas in S-LSO knew that their two-year contracts could be renewed once, and then they would have to leave Canada for four years before applying for another temporary contract. Their

uncertainty was related to the potential for contract renewal while in Canada, heightened by frequently changing program policies and guidelines.

As documented elsewhere (Basok, Bélanger, & Rivas, 2014; Hennebry & McLaughlin, 2012), the potential for repatriation before the work contract ended was a continuous means of employer control and discipline. The women interviewed in SAWP all knew other workers who had questioned the terms of their working conditions and had been repatriated or not offered contract renewals by their employers. A woman in S-LSO expressed her fear of refusing overtime hours “....*they say, oh you will not be renewed if you will not [work overtime] ...you have to because you are afraid to be fired... You’re afraid to be sent back home*”. An added pressure for the Filipinas interviewed was that they had arrived in Canada thousands of dollars in debt to third-party recruiters in the Philippines, whom the employers had hired as their representatives. Participants reported wide-spread financial abuse, such as being required to pay fees to the recruiters that they later discovered the employers had already paid. Compared to workers who are employed in the more structured bilateral agreements that exist in SAWP, many people in the less regulated S-LSO temporary worker programs arrive in Canada with significant debts (Preibisch & Hennebry, 2012; Ziesman, 2013).

**The ambiguities of being apart.** Temporary foreign workers in low skilled programs in Canada are required to migrate without their families, unlike those who are classified as high skilled and whose family members can be issued work permits (Lenard & Straehle, 2012). Migrating alone meant workers were separated from family members in their countries of origin, and the restrictive terms of the contracts in limiting mobility also made it difficult for workers to visit relatives in other regions of Canada. In addition to the stresses arising from family separation, participants expressed doubt about their work and lives in Canada. As discussed by Becker and Beyene (1999), “not knowing” about the future contributed to the difficulties and stresses of creating meaning in the new location.

Though all the participants expressed how difficult it was to be apart from their children and families, the uncertainty of separation and the high emotional cost it entailed was

more pronounced for the Filipinas, who had younger children compared to the Mexican and Jamaican women, and were away for longer continuous periods of time. As said by a Filipina:

*I always dream of to be, to be with my family”...life’s very short...then how many years you been apart from your family, there’s a lot of things you don’t cope...it’s very hard...Maybe sometimes I talk to myself...this is the last time [leaving for work].*

At the time of the interviews some of the Filipina participants were preparing for their first trip home since arriving in Canada, an event that required much planning due to the distance, expense and loss of work income. They were responsible for paying their airfare for vacations and were planning to take their two weeks paid vacation for that year and two weeks unpaid leave. Preferred vacation time to attend an important family event was denied by one woman’s employer due to business needs.

The only participants to talk explicitly about the uncertainty and worry of reconnection with their families and how their children would react were the Filipinas. They expressed great anticipation about going home after the time apart and much sorrow over the length of time away. The Filipinas with very young children were unsure of how their children had changed and how they would behave, despite frequent contact through the internet and Skype. One woman talked about being with her children and wondered “*But I will see what happened to them...Maybe they are talking to me nicely at the internet. I don’t know, I will be there and see...*”. Referring to her youngest child who was less than two years of age when the participant left for Canada, and at the time of return would be almost five: “*...so that’s why I am excited I will be there on February, to let us know each other... I don’t know if she will come to me or what... But she’ll learn*”.

### **Competing Commitments: Self, Family and Uprootedness**

*Of course. It’s really difficult because when you are, when you are from work you go home, you can’t see your kids who hug you, play with you, even that can remove your tiredness, right? But the thing is we have to accept everything, ...[our] absence.*

The requirements, structures and contexts of SAWP and S-LSO, as well as the countries of origin of the participants, resulted in some similar and different life experiences and circumstances. The participants’ childhoods were marked by growing up with their

extended families in mainly rural areas. Most were relatively non-mobile, though some of the Filipinas moved to cities for their post-secondary education. Family structure differed, as the participants from Mexico and Jamaica were all single, with the exception of one woman who was married. Six of the nine Filipina participants were married, and were apart from their husbands as well as their children. Regardless of the temporary foreign worker program and marital status, children at home were supported by the woman's mother and/or other female relatives.

The women interviewed conveyed much ambivalence and continuing regret about being separated from their families. A Mexican woman explained *"Because the children are so far away and sometimes they get sick. One would like to be with them, take care of them, but it's impossible because one has to work in order to have money"*. Leaving independently for work was seen as a necessary maternal responsibility and caring sacrifice, yet all were aware of the emotional consequences for themselves and their family members. Being absent was challenging; several of the Jamaican women expressed that they would sometimes prefer to work less than the maximum of eight months per calendar year allowed in the SAWP contracts, and one woman said *"I miss home....we should be there"*.

Relocation and resettlement is a process of transition between the expectations before arrival and the experiences after (Anderson, et al., 2010; Dam, 2012). All the participants discussed how painful it was to be apart from their children, especially when they were young. There was recognition that the first year away was the hardest: *"Mentally, that first year, it was only God that kept me...it was the longest year of my life"*. The sorrow of missing the physical presence of their children included acknowledgement of the necessity of being away for work and the enduring ache of recurring separations:

*My friends told me it's the very hardest thing to come back [after a visit home]. It's very happy that you will go, and be with them, but when you leave, when you leave, that's the hardest thing to, accept maybe. Again, I have to do it and I have to accept it.*

Some of the women in SAWP made sense of their yearly and recurrent uprootedness by saying *"No problem [going back and forth] ... doing it over and over... Because at least you get the chance to go home"*.

**The necessity of overcoming.** For the participants, overcoming involved redefining and transforming their identities through “repositioning” themselves in their lives in Canada (Anderson et al., 2010). The women’s ability to provide economic security for their families was a major factor. One woman, in describing her early difficult adjustment said: *“But we overcome it after days, weeks, especially when we got our first salary...”*. Another woman explained her employment as *“making the money to go home”*. There was a transition from accepting the necessity of migrating for temporary work to taking pride in the positive outcomes of their financial contributions. Several statements illustrate the process towards a more affirmative sense of themselves and their work:

*They [her children] are good there and I am good here...Because we are not thinking of anything but for their goodness, for their good, and because...we are happy if...our kids happy.*

*And it’s a part of my happiness that they feel comfortable too...my family...because I send them money to, to for their needs.*

*We are excited to work and excited to know that things are being cared for.*

Only one participant specifically reflected on her perceptions of differences between gendered roles in Canada and at home. When asked about her experience as a woman in SAWP she said: *“You feel like a man, it feels like it gives you the power of a man... When I’m here. When I am in Jamaica, the feminine part is good.”*. Benefits of their employment included living in another country, meeting different people, gaining new skills, and becoming more independent. One woman said *“it feels good...Yes, I am proud...to say I can do this, and I am not ashamed to, of what I am doing”*.

Many of the participants talked about the role of making deliberate decisions to move beyond simply accepting their lives in Canada: *“You set one side of your mind and said here is home...I am going to try to make it as comfortable as possible”, “[we have to] condition our mind....you have to adjust yourself”*. The participants’ experiences reproduce the process described by Molony (2010) in her qualitative metasynthesis:

Acknowledging the need to relocate by recognizing a need that is not met in the current setting, developing rationale for a move, making/participating in the decision, and developing positive expectations for the future each facilitate forward movement in the ability to “uproot” the self from one location and begin to invest in another. (p. 304)

Social support from other women workers was essential in maintaining their resolve. As described by Berman et al. (2009), Downe (2006) and Ziesman (2013), finding and nurturing sources of support with each other in the new location was a way to find solidarity and hope. Religion was an important foundation of strength for most of the women. Sharing experiences with families back home, friends in their new community and in other locations in Canada was vital to all.

**Finding health in displacement.** Health was holistically described by the participants as “*everything*”, and being healthy included feeling energized, strong, and happy. As summarized by one woman: “*When you say being healthy, you are physically sound, mentally sound, spiritually sound, emotionally sound... All the aspects of life are good... Yeah, you feel comfortable - worrying nothing*”. Another woman said: “*Yes, the idea is when I wake up and I feel really healthy and strong, you feel like you would work all day*”. Even with the support of co-workers, all the participants described feeling individually responsible for maintaining their health in order to remain employed and provide for their families. One woman said health involved “*Making the right choices for you, your destiny in life*”.

To be unhealthy meant not being able to cope, being unhappy, physically inactive, and frequently becoming ill. The examples given by the participants reflected being responsible for the decisions and actions of everyday life: “*When you cannot cope with everyday life, you’re not healthy, because if you’re healthy you have to deal with everything*”. There was recognition of the complexities of taking care of their health while employed as temporary workers. As found by Narushima and Sanchez (2014), the women living in housing provided by their employers experienced surveillance of their activities and health as “workers' private life becomes public, making their personal health a business-related concern” (p. 1). There was also some concern about the negative effects to their health from agricultural work due to the high incidence of repetitive strain injuries and fears about long-term exposure to the chemicals used in the greenhouses. All the women spoke about the costs to personal health due to the stress of separation from families and their living conditions.



When asked to describe the healthiest people they knew, the women identified people, including relatives, who were older than themselves. Health meant being physically active and alert, being rooted and participating in one's community, remaining close to family members, caring for others and taking care of themselves. When participants' mothers or grandmothers were used as examples, health was achieved through traditional gendered and social roles. One woman said of her mother: *"she always tells us that as long as I'm with my grandchildren, I'm happy and as long I take care... of your kids I'm happy"*. Those who were considered to be unhealthy neglected to take care of themselves and could be living in poverty. The state of being unhealthy was also linked to people who were "loners" and isolated, those who were unrooted in the community surrounding them and described as *"Be alone, they are unhealthy"*. There was recognition that an unhealthy person may not have been cared for properly by others, and through misfortune may be unable to provide for themselves: *"Maybe that person have to be begging...something to get a proper meal"*. Membership in and identification with social groups is strongly associated with improved health and well-being (Canevello & Crocker, 2011; Greenaway et al., 2015). Canevello and Crocker (2011) described people who have the goal of supporting others as believing "that it is possible for both people in a relationship to have their needs met and that it is important for people to look out and care for each other" (p. 348). The examples given by the participants illustrate how meaningful engagement within strong social networks promoted both personal and interpersonal health, and contributed to the perceived risks of being alone.

The themes expressed in the descriptions of being healthy and unhealthy were reflected in the participants' understandings of their own health. While articulating the responsibility to maintain their health in order to take care of their families, all the women identified the importance of being "surrounded" by the support of each other *"whatever way we can"... "and if one is sick I will look out for that one"*, a collective encouragement that reinforces individual agency and resilience (Downe, 2006). One woman said that sharing experiences and giving advice to each other *"makes you strong, of course. [It] helps..."*. Improvements in technology play an important role in maintaining migrants' relationships in multiple places (Gustafson, 2014). The

participants' ability to stay connected to their children, families and friends in order to enhance their everyday lives and health in Canada was essential. As said by a Mexican woman *"We talk on the phone a lot with our family...Yes, so that we feel a little calmer"*. A Filipina said – *"I give myself like having fun in the Facebook chat with my friends and my family"*. While internet access had improved in Jamaica and Mexico, participants from those countries, who tended to be older, used phone cards and cell phones to talk to their families frequently, if not daily. The Filipinas were more technologically proficient with computers and it was much less expensive for them to use the internet, including Skype.

### **Becoming Rooted: Connection and Disconnection**

*There are Filipino communities...like the retirees in [a nearby city], they come and visit us...They bring us to their houses [and] we have a Christmas party....They organize parties for us, so then it's like when you come home, then [we] miss our families much more because...we're reminded of...[home in the Philippines]*

The ability to form connections with the southwestern Ontario community in which the research was based was influenced by the physical location of the workers' residences and proficiency in English. In SAWP, employers are required to provide housing, usually in bunkhouses that are built close to the work-sites. There are often crowded living conditions offering limited privacy inside, and very little outdoor space, such as lawns, that are suitable for recreation or socializing. Often housed kilometers away from the nearest town, workers are geographically separated and physically removed from nearby communities. These limiting and isolating residential spaces imposed boundaries of disconnection, while at the same time reinforcing power relations and blurring the public and private lives of the workers for employers (Narushima & Sanchez, 2014; Preibisch, 2010). The women in SAWP from Jamaica had been educated in English, though their first language was patois. The Mexican women spoke Spanish and some regional dialects. Their formal education had been in Spanish and they spoke little English, limiting their ability to interact with the wider community.

Employers in S-LSO are not required to provide housing, though for the women in S-LSO it was more convenient when they first arrived in Canada to live in employer-owned

houses. This arrangement provided the means for S-LSO employers to also monitor the women's private lives. The Filipinas in S-LSO lived in housing close to the centre of the community and their employers provided transportation to the work-site. All the women spoke Tagalog in addition to various regional dialects. However, their formal education had been in English, including their post-secondary studies. Physically living in town, combined with high literacy in English meant increased opportunities for interactions with permanent residents.

**Meanings of home and community.** Home can be considered to be a place of safety, comfort, security and togetherness (Molony, 2010). Homes exist in a physical space, but are also socially constructed experiences of being rooted in places that extend beyond geography and time (Easthope, 2004; McEwen, 2014). There was a sense of longing expressed by the participants arising from both the physical and emotional separation from their families. Home meant being part of a family and being present, described as: *"home is where family is"* and *"you are there"*. One woman said: *"Home is really, it should be comfortable, happy and enjoy... whatever you have, whether it is great or small, where you find peace. That's what home means to me"*. One woman anticipated returning home as healing and said *"I really mend at home when I'll be there"*.

Many of the women used the word *"comfortable"* to explain their feelings of home and described the employer-provided housing in both SAWP and S-LSO as *"not really"* being a home because they were *"too crowded"*. While some of the women acknowledged that where they lived in Canada was a second home, the use of the word home was tenuous when they referred to their Canadian residences. One woman described her meaning of home in Canada as *"something vague"* and *"not complete"*. However, for the Filipina and Mexican participants, Canada could be home if all family members were allowed to immigrate permanently and everyone could be together. For the Jamaican women, home meant *"going home to Jamaica"*. Those women spoke about how they felt more at ease in Jamaica and how paradoxically, *"where we spend less time there, we feel more comfortable"*. The meaning of "home" in Canada meant making the best of the circumstances in which the participants were living, and as found by Downe

(2007), all the women exhibited much resiliency in making their Canadian homes a source of collective support and sharing of experiences.

Being a member of a community also meant feeling comfortable, as well as accepted and connected to others. Community was embodied in place and space, described as: *“people surrounded by...”* and *“how [people] interact with each other”*. There was a sense that a community was more than the sum of its parts; that it meant the residents of that community were actively *“helping each other”* and that *“community builds the people”*. All the women felt they had *“both communities to deal with”*, and considered themselves to be a part of their communities in both Canada and their countries of origin. However, feelings of belonging to a community, even when absent, were much stronger for their countries of origin. Feelings of belonging to a Canadian community were limited by their temporary status, employment work contracts and long work hours. The Jamaican women had been employed only in the community where the research took place, whereas the Mexican women, who felt the least connection to that community, had all been employed through shorter-term SAWP contracts in other regions of Canada. Religion was important for many of the participants in their home countries, and their connection to community in Canada was enhanced through religious activities and church attendance.

The participants in this research did not report the experiences of exclusion and alienation in public spaces described in the research by Berman et al. (2009) and Caxaj and Berman (2010). When asked about their experiences as women temporary foreign workers as they were walking in town or engaged in activities like buying groceries, all the women discussed positive encounters and of feeling accepted and at ease. They stated they had no perceptions of being “different” because of their status as temporary workers from other countries. The Mexican and Jamaican women had been coming to Canada as part of SAWP for a number of years. For the Filipinas, who were all employed in Canada for the first time, their acceptance was unanticipated:

*The first time we came here I really appreciate people who are living here, because it's just like we are all the same. They say hello, hi, whoever you are and it's a great thing ....[because] we felt like at the very start, we felt like just being...*

*small... But that it makes us greater. It makes us strong that the people here says hello, hi, how are you? Yeah we really wanted that...*

*But lots of people here are nice...We didn't expect that kind of.... acceptance, we thought there would be discrimination or treated badly at the start but...They are friendly here...[it helps]. Yeah, because at least you don't feel being isolated.*

For the women, “community” meant being connected to something greater than their families and homes. Despite feeling comfortable in public spaces, they were restricted from full participation in the life of their Canadian community.

**The paradox of connection.** Feeling connected to one's home and community of origin is not a simple process and the act of returning home is more complicated than merely going back to where one belongs (Malkki, 1995). Place is a social construct influenced by current lived experiences and broader contexts (Easthope, 2009). Wherever the location, home is both a place and a process, shaped by relations of power and the structural forces of migration (Molony, 2010; Reinders & van der Land, 2008). Returning migrants are themselves changed, attaching “new meanings to culture, identity, home and place in their country of origin” (de Bree, Davids, & de Haas, 2010, p. 490), and requiring the renegotiation of feelings of belonging. To become settled and rooted in a new location challenges the cultural and national essentialisms that if you have been uprooted you do not belong. Connection and disconnection are not linear, but dialectical (Berman et al. 2009), and the paradox of being connected in multiple locations means being simultaneously disconnected, which is sometimes reinforced in unanticipated ways. For example, being invited to dinners and parties with local residents was appreciated by the participants, but were potent reminders of the family dinners and important occasions from which the women workers were absent.

*Because I left my baby [when she was] just one year and eight months. She doesn't know me. You know one time...[her nursery school teacher] told them to draw the happy family...then [the teacher] said “why don't you show me your paper?”...The thing is, when the teacher saw it....it's just her daddy and her two elder sisters and her just holding one another,...and at the top she draw a [woman] with a square in front of her....And when the teacher ask her “what is this?” – “She is my mommy. I do not see her, I just see her on the laptop”...You know the first time I heard... I cried for this. Oh I cried. It really hard because I*

*just hear from the radio, or just watching the TV [about the difficulties of being separated from children], but...I didn't think it will happen to me...*

As discussed previously, the use of technology was an important personal and collective strategy for overcoming separation, maintaining family ties and forging new connections during the participants' time in Canada. Yet technology can also isolate and divide, as illustrated in the quote above. The mother who was drawn in a corner of the family picture surrounded by a computer screen felt she was maintaining a strong connection to her children through Skype and did not expect to be represented as symbolically removed from her family.

According to Andreotti et al. (2013) "rootedness is high when individuals use local facilities and services and integrate well into formal and informal local networks" (p. 46). Temporary foreign workers are constructed as "alienated others" (Caxaj & Berman, 2010) in national discourses and experience a social location marked by race, gender, language, housing, country of origin and immigration status. The constraints of temporary contracts for workers in programs classified as low skilled create barriers to inclusion. Workers are required to be very mobile migrating for work, but have severely restricted mobility once employed. Their status as non-citizens maintains boundaries of exclusion from the services and networks of the larger society (Foster & Taylor, 2013). Yet those imposed boundaries of being temporary foreign workers strengthened the support and sense of connection that the women felt towards each other.

Women in temporary agricultural programs are subject to increased gender-based employer surveillance of their private lives compared to men (Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010). However, the participants felt comfortable in the public spaces of their Canadian community. There are dominant negative discourses portraying male temporary agricultural workers as being an overwhelming presence and potential threat to the way of life in rural Canadian communities (Bauder, 2008; Scantlebury, 2009; Binford and Preibisch, 2013). There are few women temporary foreign workers in agriculture compared to men and they are therefore less visible in public spaces. It may be that gendered perceptions of women as non-threatening, the small numbers female workers and their temporary stay contributed to the participants' positive perceptions and experiences.

## Discussion

Temporary foreign worker programs provide a labour force comprised of people who are physically disconnected from their countries of origin. Like refugees, temporary foreign workers are essentialized; unlike refugees, the personal and collective identities of temporary foreign workers are not considered damaged as much as they are ignored. Discounting the political and economic histories of both the programs and the workers involved creates the representation of people who are indistinguishable and decontextualized (Apfelbaum, 2000), with the result that temporary workers are regarded as being interchangeable and replaceable (McLaughlin, 2010; Preibisch & Otero, 2014). Employers and workers know that if contracts are terminated and workers are sent home, there are many others waiting to apply to these programs. Temporary foreign workers are only “here to work”, before leaving and then repeating the cycle.

Internationally and nationally, the structures and terms of temporary foreign worker programs entrench control of the workers, maintain uncertainty within recurring uprootedness, and encompass one large “system of oppression” (Berman et al., 2009). Essentialist “visions of an identity that can only be whole and well when rooted in a territorial homeland .... makes obvious the need to control the movement of people ‘out of place’, and thus acts to naturalize technologies of power” (Malkki, 1995, pp. 511-512). When home and homeland become the language of territory it is in the interests of nation states to maintain the arborescent language of fixed roots (Patchett, 2013) in order to legitimize “the politics of belonging”, that include “selective immigration policies, citizenship arrangements and return migration policies – that aim to mark the boundaries of those who do and do not belong to a certain group” (de Bree et al., 2010, p. 491). For temporary foreign workers, to belong is to be controlled by the state (Anderson, 2001). Uprootedness for the participants in this research was regulated by those who had the power to offer or withhold the right to be in Canada and was experienced within the context of psychological and residential uncertainty, an uncertainty that was constant given the women’s precarious work and lack of secure immigration status.

As identified elsewhere (Ahmed et al., 2003; Andreotti et al., 2013; de Bree et al., 2010; Berman et al., 2009; Downe, 2006, 2007; Malkki, 1992), the experiences of the participants in this research challenge the dichotomy of being either uprooted or rooted. Embedded in their strength, agency and the tensions of their everyday lives the women spoke of rootedness and positive connections in their countries of origin and in Canada. For those participants who engaged in public demonstrations challenging their structural inequities, rootedness was expressed as resistance to the oppression of invisibility and silencing through fear and uncertainty. However, as explored in this research and discussed by others (Hennebry et al., 2015; Taylor and Foster, 2015), the structures, policies, power relations and circular migration of temporary worker programs promote disengagement and exclusion. Within the culture created in context of their deliberate marginalization in Canada, the experiences of home and community for the women interviewed were lived through a dialectic of connection and isolation.

### **Limitations**

As an outsider, my entry into groups of workers depended on establishing trust with one or two people, who then referred me to co-workers they felt would be receptive to being interviewed. This limitation may have resulted in a lack of diversity in the experiences and meanings of life and work in Canada among women temporary agricultural workers. The use of an interpreter/translator extended the length of the interviews, making them more tiring for the participants, and may have resulted in the loss of some of the nuances expressed by the Spanish-speaking women. It was also limitation that I was unable to interview women from other South Asian countries, such as Thailand and Viet Nam, due to the difficulties of finding interpreters and time needed to establish relationships with different groups of workers.

### **Implications for Research and Change**

There is a continued need for gendered migration research, with a focus on women's agency, strengths, perseverance and resiliencies. "Women and gender remain at the margins of agricultural policy" (Sachs & Alston, 2010, p. 282), are rarely mentioned in the official reports of temporary agricultural work, and remain a minority in the masculinized labour sector of agriculture in Canada. Because varied experiences of



uprootedness shape different reconstructions of identity and place (Malkki, 1992), more research with temporary agricultural workers is needed in different settings and with diverse participants, especially with South Asian workers, who are recent migrants to Canada due to the newer temporary agricultural streams in addition to SAWP (Ziesman, 2013). Also needed is increased research related to the meanings and transitions of post-return belonging (de Bree et al., 2010), particularly within the context of circular uprootedness. While the research by Andreotti et al. (2013) illuminated some of the processes of simultaneous rootedness, the middle class participants in their research did not face the same structural inequities and lack of choice that is the reality for temporary workers in low skilled occupations. Circular and repeated uprootedness changes everyone; not only the people migrating, but also the families and communities left behind. And often overlooked, the “differential exclusion” experienced by temporary foreign workers affects employers, work-sites, and the communities to which the workers migrate (Andreotti et al., 2013; Foster & Taylor, 2013; Narushima & Sanchez, 2014).

Migration and employment policies that create and sustain inequities affect health and well-being. Transforming the constant uncertainty and precariousness that characterizes the lives of temporary foreign workers means that nurses must become involved in advocating for change, an activity “universally considered a moral obligation in nursing practice” (MacDonald, 2007, p. 119). Given that “temporary” workers have intentionally and deliberately become a permanent and enduring fixture in the Canadian labour market, increased access is needed to the health care and social settlement services available to other immigrants, as are pathways to permanent residency. Nurses need to be aware that increasing access to services is a difficult undertaking due to the many levels of political and legislative responsibilities (Barnes, 2013). However, there have been successes with innovative and much-needed access to health and social services at local levels (Hennebry et al., 2015), and working with community and immigrant advocacy groups can be an effective way for nurses to contribute their knowledge and expertise (McGuire, 2014).

## Conclusion

Global determinants of health are reflected in everyday lives, and equally, the locally situated and gendered experiences of temporary foreign workers are nested in broader national and international contexts. The everyday lives and experiences of temporary workers remain largely hidden from most Canadians and give rise to the need to make many relationships more explicitly visible. These include: the intersections of political and economic interests at local, national and international levels; the role and responsibility of the state in migration and the health of migrants; and, among experiences of health, health promotion and nursing care of those who are temporary residents. Fixed dichotomies of being designated as either uprooted or rooted create and sustain categories of connection and marginalization. They influence who is considered deserving of the rights of citizenship or permanent residency, and who will be excluded. Looking beyond these dichotomies means recognizing and exploring diverse migration pathways, and the experiences and consequences of current structural systems. For low skilled temporary foreign workers the processes of uprooting and rooting take place within power relations that sustain uncertainty and inequities.

There are many paradoxes in relation to women's migration for agricultural work: that they care for their children and families by leaving them; that the international mobility of global migration results in restricted geographical mobility as employees; and, that temporary foreign workers are engaged in the rooting and growing of our food while being relegated to repeated and prolonged personal uprootedness. Varied outcomes arise from the convergence of structural and individual factors expressed through and because of temporary uprootedness. Relocation for agricultural work entails both vulnerabilities due to isolated and often dangerous work, and opportunities for economic success, empowerment, and the development of personal autonomy and agency. Nevertheless, many migrant women cannot both live with their families and support them "and their 'commute' entails a cost that we have yet to fully comprehend" (Ehrenreich & Hochschild, 2002, p. 3).

## References

- Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. (2015). *An overview of the Canadian agriculture and agri-food system: 2014*. Retrieved from <http://www.agr.gc.ca/eng/about-us/publications/economic-publications/alphabetical-listing/an-overview-of-the-canadian-agriculture-and-agri-food-system-2014/?id=1396889920372>
- Ahmed, S., Castaneda, C., Fortier, A-M., & Sheller, M. (2003). Introduction: Uprootings/regroundings. Questions of home and migration. In S. Ahmed, C. Castaneda, A-M. Fortier, & M. Sheller (Eds.). *Uprootings/regroundings: Questions of home and migration* (pp. 1-19). Oxford, UK: Berg.
- Anderson, J. M., Reimer, J., Khan, K. B., Simich, L, Neufeld, A., Stewart, M., & Makwarimba, E. (2010). Narratives of “dissonance” and “repositioning” through the lens of critical humanism: Exploring the influences on immigrants’ and refugees’ health and well-being. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 33(2), 101–112.
- Anderson, P. (2001). ‘You don’t belong here in Germany...’: On the social situation of refugee children in Germany. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 14(2), 187-199.
- Andreotti, A., Le Gales, P., Fuentes, F. J. M. (2013). Transnational mobility and rootedness: The upper middle classes in European cities. *Global Networks*, 13(1), 41–59.
- Andrews, G. J. (2003). Locating a geography of nursing: Space, place and the progress of geographical thought. *Nursing Philosophy*, 4, 231-248.
- Apfelbaum, E. R. (2000). And now what, after such tribulations? Memory and dislocation in the era of uprooting. *American Psychologist*, 55(9), 1008-1013.
- Atkinson, P., & Delamont, S. (2005). Analytic perspectives. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp. 821-840). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Barnes, N. (2013). Is health a labour, citizenship or human right? Mexican seasonal agricultural workers in Leamington, Canada. *Global Public Health: An International Journal for Research, Policy and Practice*, 8(6), 654-669. doi:10.1080/17441692.2013.791335
- Basok, T. (2002). *Tortillas and tomatoes: Transmigrant Mexican harvesters in Canada*. Montreal, PC: McGill-Queen’s University Press.
- Basok, T., Bélanger, D., & Rivas, E. (2014). Reproducing deportability: Migrant agricultural workers in south-western Ontario. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 40(9), 1394-1413. doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2013.849566
- Bauder, H. (2008). Foreign farm workers in Ontario (Canada): Exclusionary discourse in the newsprint media. *Journal of Peasant Studies*, 35(1) 100-118. doi:10.1080/03066150801983287
- Baumbusch, J. L. (2011). Conducting critical ethnography in long-term residential care: Experiences of a novice researcher in the field. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 67(1), 184–192. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2010.05413.x

- Bearskin, R. L. B. (2011). A critical lens on culture in nursing practice. *Nursing Ethics*, 18(4), 548–559. doi:10.1177/0969733011408048
- Becker, G., & Beyene, Y. (1999). Narratives of age and uprootedness among older Cambodian refugees. *Journal of Aging Studies*, 13(3), 295-314.
- Berman, H., Alvernaz Mulcahy, G., Forchuk, C., Edmunds, K., Haldenby, A., & Lopez, R. (2009). Uprooted and displaced: A critical narrative study of homeless, aboriginal, and newcomer girls in Canada. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 30(7), 418-430.
- Binford, L., & Preibisch, K. (2013). Interrogating racialized global labor supply: Caribbean and Mexican workers in Canada's SAWP. In L. Binford, *Tomorrow we're all going to harvest: Temporary foreign worker programs and neoliberal political economy* (pp. 93-115). Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.
- Browne, A. J., Varcoe, C., Smye, V., Reimer-Kirkham, S., Lynam, J., & Wong, S. (2009). Cultural safety and the challenges of translating critically oriented knowledge in practice. *Nursing Philosophy*, 10, 167-179.
- Campbell, R., & Wasco, S. M. (2000). Feminist approaches to social science: Epistemological and methodological tenets. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 28(6), 773-791.
- Canevello, A., & Crocker, J. (2011). Interpersonal goals and close relationship processes: Potential links to health. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 5(6), 346–358. doi:10.1111/j.1751-9004.2011.00356.x
- Carter, S., & Little, M. (2007). Justifying knowledge, justifying method, taking action: Epistemologies, methodologies, and methods in qualitative research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 17(10), 1316-1328.
- Caxaj, C. S., & Berman, H. (2010). Belonging among newcomer youths: Intersecting experiences of inclusion and exclusion. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 33(4), E17–E30.
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2014). *Canada facts and figures 2013. Immigration overview: Temporary residents*. Retrieved from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/2013-Facts-Temporary.pdf>
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2015). *Canada facts and figures 2014. Immigration overview: Permanent residents*. Retrieved from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/2014-Facts-Permanent.pdf>
- Cooper, S. P., Heitman, E., Fox, E. E., Quill, B., Knudson, P., Zahm, S.,... Ryder, R. (2004). Ethical issues in conducting migrant farmworker studies. *Journal of Immigrant Health*, 6(1), 29-39.
- Dam, H., & Eyles, J. (2012). "Home tonight? What? Where?" An exploratory study of the meanings of house, home and family among the former Vietnamese refugees in a Canadian city. *Forum: Qualitative Research*, 13(2), Art. 19. Retrieved from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/1696/3386>

- de Bree, J., Davids, T., & de Haas, H. (2010). Post-return experiences and transnational belonging of return migrants: A Dutch–Moroccan case study. *Global Networks*, 10(4), 489-509.
- Downe, P. (2006). Two stories of migrant sex work, cross-Border movement and violence. *Canadian Woman Studies/Les Cahiers de la Femme*, 25(1/2), 61-66.
- Downe, P. (2007). Strategic stories and reflexive interruptions: Narratives of a “safe home” amidst cross-border sex work. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 13(4), 554-572.
- Easthope, H. (2004). A place called home. *Housing, Theory and Society*, 21(3), 128–138. doi:10.1080/14036090410021360
- Easthope, H. (2009). Fixed identities in a mobile world? The relationship between mobility, place, and identity. *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power*, 16, 61–82. doi:10.1080/10702890802605810
- Edmunds, K., Berman, H., Basok, T., Ford-Gilboe, M., & Forchuk, C. (2011). The health of women temporary agricultural workers in Canada: A critical review of the literature. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 43(4), 68–91.
- Ehrenreich, B., & Hochschild, A. R. (Eds.) (2002). *Global women: Nannies, maids and sex workers in the new economy*. New York, NY: Metropolitan Books.
- Eide, P., & Kahn, D. (2008). Ethical issues in the qualitative researcher-participant relationship. *Nursing Ethics*, 15(2), 199-207. doi:10.1177/0969733007086018
- Employment and Social Development Canada. (2014). *Number of temporary foreign worker positions on positive Labour Market Impact Assessments (LMIA's) under the Agricultural Occupations*. Retrieved from [http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign\\_workers/lmo\\_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml](http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign_workers/lmo_statistics/annual-agriculture.shtml)
- Employment and Social Development Canada (2015). *Temporary foreign workers: Hiring seasonal agricultural workers*. Retrieved from [http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign\\_workers/agriculture/seasonal/index.shtml](http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign_workers/agriculture/seasonal/index.shtml)
- Foster, J., & Taylor, A. (2013). In the shadows: Exploring the notion of “community” for temporary foreign workers in a boomtown. *Canadian Journal of Sociology/Cahiers Canadiens de Sociologie*, 38(2), 167-190.
- Friese, S. (2012). *Qualitative data analysis with ATLAS.ti*. London, UK: SAGE.
- Grbich, C. (2007). *Qualitative data analysis: An introduction*. London, UK: SAGE.
- Greenaway, K. H., Haslam, S. A., Cruwys, T., Branscombe, N. R., Ysseldyk, R., & Heldreth, C. (2015). From “We” to “Me”: Group identification enhances perceived personal control with consequences for health and well-being. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 109(1), 53–74. doi.org/10.1037/pspi0000019
- Gustafson, P. (2014). Place attachment in an age of mobility. In L. S. Manzo & P. Devine-Wright (Eds.). *Place attachment: advances in theory, methods and applications* (pp. 37-48). New York, NY: Routledge

- Hennebry, J. L., & McLaughlin, J. (2012). "The exception that proves the rule": Structural vulnerability, health risks, and consequences for temporary migrant farm workers in Canada. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.). *Legislated Inequality: Temporary migration in Canada* (pp. 117-138). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Hennebry, J. L., McLaughlin, J., & Preibisch, K. (2015). Out of the loop: (In)access to health care for migrant workers in Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*. doi:10.1007/s12134-015-0417-1
- International Organization for Migration (2013). *Migration initiatives 2014: Health of migrants*. Retrieved from [http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/Migration\\_Initiatives2014\\_web.pdf](http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/Migration_Initiatives2014_web.pdf)
- International Organization for Migration (2014). *A New global partnership for development: Factoring in the contribution of migration*. Retrieved from [http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/MRS50\\_20May2014.pdf](http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/MRS50_20May2014.pdf)
- Joffe, H., & Yardley, L. (2004). Content and thematic analysis. In D. F. Marks & L. Yardley (Eds.). *Research methods for clinical and health psychology* (pp. 56-69), London, UK: SAGE
- Kaiser, K. (2009). Protecting respondent confidentiality in qualitative research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 19(11), 1632-1641. doi: 10.1177/1049732309350879
- Kincheloe, J. L., McLaren, P., & Steinberg, S. (2011). Critical pedagogy and qualitative research: Moving to the bricolage. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research* (4<sup>th</sup> ed., pp. 163-177), Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Koro-Ljunberg, M., & Greckhamer, T. (2005). Strategic turns labeled 'ethnography': From description to openly ideological production of cultures. *Qualitative Research*, 5(3), 285-306.
- Labonte, R., Mohindra, K., & Schrecker, T. (2011). The growing impact of globalization for health and public health practice. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 32, 263–283.
- Lather, P. (1991) *Getting smart: Feminist research and pedagogy with/in the postmodern*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Lenard, P. T., & Straehle, C. (2012). Introduction. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.). *Legislated inequality: Temporary migration in Canada* (pp. 3-25), Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Low, S. M. (2009). Towards an anthropological theory of space and place. *Semiotica*, 175, 21–37. doi:10.1515/semi.2009.041
- MacDonald, H. (2007). Relational ethics and advocacy in nursing: Literature review. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 57(2), 119–126. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2006.04063.x

- MacDonnell, J. A. (2014). Enhancing our understanding of emancipatory nursing: A reflection on the use of critical feminist methodologies. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 37(3), 271–280. doi:10.1097/ANS.0000000000000038
- Madison, D. S. (2012). *Critical ethnography: Method, ethics, and performance* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Mahon, P., & McPherson, G. (2014). Explaining why nurses remain in or leave bedside nursing: A critical ethnography. *Nurse Researcher*, 22(1), 8-13.
- Malkki, L. (1992). National geographic: The rooting of peoples and the territorialization of national identity among scholars and refugees. *Cultural Anthropology*, 7(1), 22-44.
- Malkki, L. (1995). Refugees and exile: From “refugee studies” to the national order of things. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 24, 495-523.
- Malkki, L. (2007). Commentary: The politics of trauma and asylum: Universals and their effects. *Ethos*, 35(3), 336-343.
- Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (2011). *Designing qualitative research* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- McCabe, J. L., & Holmes, D. (2009). Reflexivity, critical qualitative research and emancipation: A Foucauldian perspective. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 65(7), 1518–1526. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2009.04978.x
- McEwen, J. W. (2014). *Sense of place, place attachment, and rootedness in four West Baton Rouge Parish, Louisiana bars* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from <http://etd.lsu.edu/docs/available/etd-07022014-162438/unrestricted/McEwenDiss.pdf>
- McGuire, S. (2014). Borders, centers, and margins: Critical landscapes for migrant health. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 37(3), 197-212. doi: 10.1097/ANS.0000000000000030
- McGuire, S., & Georges, J. (2003). Undocumentedness and liminality as health variables. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 26(3), 185–195.
- McLaughlin, J. (2010). Classifying the “ideal migrant worker”: Mexican and Jamaican transnational farmworkers in Canada. *Focaal—Journal of Global and Historical Anthropology*, 57, 79–94. doi:10.3167/fcl.2010.570106
- Molony, S. L., (2010). The meaning of home: A qualitative metasynthesis. *Research in Gerontological Nursing*, 3(4), 291-307. doi:10.3928/19404921-20100302-02
- Moore, L. W., & Miller, M. (1999). Initiating research with doubly vulnerable populations. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 30(5), 1034-1040.
- Narushima, M., & Sanchez, A. (2014). Employers' paradoxical views about temporary foreign migrant workers' health: A qualitative study in rural farms in southern Ontario. *International Journal for Equity in Health*, 13 (65). doi:10.1186/s12939-014-0065-7

- Patchett, E. (2013). Roma, rhizomes and roots in rough soil: Cultivating trans-territoriality in law and film. *The Australian Feminist Law Journal*, 39, 57-78.
- Poland, B., Lehoux, P., Holmes, D., & Andrews, G. (2005). How place matters: Unpacking technology and power in health and social care. *Health and Social Care in the Community*, 13(2), 170-180.
- Preibisch, K. (2010). Pick-your-own labor: Migrant workers and flexibility in Canadian agriculture. *International Migration Review*, 44(2), 404-441. doi:10.1111/j.1747-7379.2010.00811.x
- Preibisch, K. L., & Encalada Grez, E. (2010). The other side of el otro lado: Mexican migrant women and labor flexibility in Canadian agriculture. *Signs*, 35(2), 289-316.
- Preibisch, K., & Hennebry, J. L. (2012). Buy local, hire global: Temporary migration in Canadian agriculture. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.), *Legislated inequality: Temporary migration in Canada* (pp. 48-72), Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Preibisch, K., & Otero, G. (2014). Does citizenship status matter in Canadian agriculture? Workplace health and safety for migrant and immigrant laborers. *Rural Sociology*, 79(2), 174-199. doi:10.1111/ruso.12043
- Reinders, L., & van der Land, M. (2008). Mental geographies of home and place: Introduction to the Special Issue. *Housing, Theory and Society*, 25(1), 1-13. doi:10.1080/14036090601150998
- Reyes Cruz, M., & Sonn, C. C. (2011). (De)colonizing culture in community psychology: Reflections from critical social science. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 47, 203-214. doi:10.1007/s10464-010-9378-x
- Sachs, C., & Alston, M. (2010). Global shifts, sedimentations, and imaginaries: An introduction to the special issue on women and agriculture. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 35(2), 277-287.
- Saldaña, J. (2011). *Fundamentals of qualitative research: Understanding qualitative research*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Scantlebury, T. (2009). *Shifting responsibilities in migrant matrifocal households: A look at transnational households in the Caribbean* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (MR52262)
- Sharma, N. (2012). The "difference" that borders make: "Temporary foreign workers" and the social organization of unfreedom in Canada. In P. T. Lenard & C. Straehle (Eds.), *Legislated inequality: Temporary migration in Canada* (pp. 26-47). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Silverstein, P. A. (2004). Of rooting and uprooting: Kabyle habitus, domesticity, and structural nostalgia. *Ethnography*, 5(4), 553-578.
- Squires, A. (2008). Language barriers and qualitative nursing research: Methodological considerations. *International Nursing Review*, 55(3), 265-273.



- Squires, A. (2009). Methodological challenges in cross-language qualitative research: A research review. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 46, 277-287.
- Taylor, A., & Foster, J. (2015). Migrant workers and the problem of social cohesion in Canada. *Journal of International Migration & Integration*, 16, 153-172.  
doi:10.1007/s12134-014-0323-y
- Thomas, J. (1993). *Doing critical ethnography*. Newbury Park, CA: SAGE.
- Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H., & Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing and Health Sciences*, 15, 398-405. doi:10.1111/nhs.12048
- Wong, J. P-H., & Poon, M. K-L. (2010). Bringing translation out of the shadows: Translation as an issue of methodological significance in cross-cultural qualitative research. *Journal of Transcultural Nursing*, 21(2) 151-158.  
doi:10.1177/1043659609357637
- Ziesman, A. (2013). *``Will work for food``: Canada's agricultural industry and the recruitment of South East Asian temporary migrant workers* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from  
[https://atrium.lib.uoguelph.ca/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10214/6763/Ziesman\\_Alia\\_201305\\_MA.pdf?sequence=1](https://atrium.lib.uoguelph.ca/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10214/6763/Ziesman_Alia_201305_MA.pdf?sequence=1)

## **Chapter 5: Conclusion**

### **“Trying to Get to the Bigger Things” – Opportunities for Change**

Temporary foreign agricultural workers in federal programs have been coming to Canada since 1966, when 264 men from Jamaica were accepted into the Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program (SAWP) (Preibisch, 2007). As a public health nurse working and living in a rural area of southwestern Ontario, I witnessed the extensive growth of local greenhouse and farming businesses into global corporations, and the increasing reliance by employers on temporary workers from a variety of countries in SAWP and what is now the Stream for Lower-Skilled Occupations (S-LSO). Employers prefer temporary workers as they “are here to work”, and are tied to constraining contracts that limit their work choices and mobility while in Canada. Temporary agricultural workers are markedly visible in rural communities when engaged in activities such as their weekly grocery shopping, and are decidedly invisible when they are working long hours and housed near their employers’ farms, greenhouses or packing plants. I became interested in exploring the perspectives and experiences of women workers who are repeatedly separated from their families, as well as the systems and structures of Canadian temporary work programs, which function to maintain boundaries of exclusion. The health of temporary agricultural workers in Canada has been understudied, particularly of women workers, who are much fewer in number compared to men.

The final chapter of this dissertation is organized to first present a discussion of validity and rigour, then a brief summary of key findings, and finally, to discuss challenges and opportunities for change and the implications for research, advocacy, policy and nursing practice.

#### **Validity**

Validity needs to be assessed within the context of the purposes and circumstances of the research (Maxwell, 2005; Oleson, 2005; Whittemore, Chase & Mandle, 2001), and be further appraised with regard to if and how the phases of the research are congruent with the research design (Holloway & Todres, 2003). Evaluation of validity rests on the consistency and coherence that “the kind of knowledge generated in the results...does

what it said it would do under the aims of the project” (Holloway & Todres, 2003, p. 347). Validity is made plausible by the evidence gathered through the methods (Maxwell, 2005; Morse, 2015; Whittemore et al., 2001). In this inquiry, validity transpired through prolonged engagement in the field, dialogical relationships with participants, the use of multiple data sources and continuous reflexivity (Carter & Little, 2007; Guba & Lincoln, 2005; Madison, 2012). This research reflects the alignment of critical and feminist theoretical perspectives with congruent methodology, methods and analysis.

Sources of data included a multidisciplinary review of the literature, review of relevant documents such as temporary foreign worker program policies and guidelines, participant-observation fieldwork, recording and reflection of fieldnotes and semi-structured interviews. Diversity was sought in the countries of origin of the women workers and their program of employment. Women agricultural workers in SAWP and S-LSO from Mexico, Jamaica and the Philippines were the primary participants. Additional interviews were conducted with community residents who were engaged with and advocating for the temporary agricultural worker population. These methods enhanced the opportunities for in-depth and rich data collection and to seek both convergence and divergence of meaning. Sampling, data collection, analysis and writing were continuous and iterative (Carter & Little, 2007; Madison, 2012).

Using the characteristics of crystals as a metaphor for validity assists researchers, participants and the audience perceive the fluid and dynamic interweaving of processes throughout the iterative phases of the research (Guba & Lincoln, 2005). Crystals are ever-changing prisms that “reflect external realities and refract within themselves” (Richardson & Adams St. Pierre, 2005, p. 963). Standpoints, motivations and beliefs are not fixed and static. The concept of crystallization was congruent with my methodology in that knowledge was assumed to be co-constructed within a specific context of time and place. Validity and reflexivity contributed to the empirical rigour of the research by enhancing understanding of the data and authentic representation of the complexity of the inquiry.

### **Research Findings and Contributions**

The lives of the participants as described in Chapters 3 and 4 reflect the processes that decontextualize the experiences of temporary foreign workers and maintain the boundaries of who ‘belongs’ and who does not. As Malkki (1995) wrote about refugees, “this floating world without the gravities of history and politics ...can ultimately become a deeply dehumanizing environment” (p. 518). Similarly to refugees, discourses about temporary foreign workers represent them as “out of place” and excluded from the mainstream (Foster & Taylor, 2013). Structural violence, power relations, and imposed uncertainty were evident and operating at local, national and global levels, during all steps of application, hiring and contract renewal for employment, and in their work experiences. Much energy was expended by the women to preserve the “mindset” needed to make sense of uprootedness from their homes and families. Diverse opportunities and constraints arose from expressions of personal agency, economic autonomy, experiences of migration, and systemic factors. Structural context and personal agency were interconnected, and reflected the organizational and subjective elements of empowerment, uprootedness and health.

The voices of temporary workers are often concealed or ignored. Yet, the women demonstrated much strength and perseverance. This research contributes nuanced descriptions of personal and collective expressions of agency and resistance, and of forging connections within layers of constraining systems and barriers. Despite the risks of participating in the research, the women wanted to talk and wanted someone to listen. For them it was clear that being interviewed was a powerful opportunity to explicitly discuss their experiences related to temporary agricultural work, and also points to the need for safe spaces to be heard. As illustrated in Chapter 3, it was a positive and welcome encounter to have a citizen take an interest in their lives in Canada and the systems under which they were recruited and employed.

**Experiences of health.** For all the women in this research health was understood and discussed holistically, encompassing all aspects of their lives. Participants recognized their individual responsibility and the necessity of staying healthy in order to maintain employment. For some, promoting their health meant engaging in acts of advocacy and

public resistance regarding the restrictive terms of their work contracts. An important component of health was sustaining existing interpersonal relationships in their countries of origin and making new connections in Canada. As discussed in Chapter 4, information and communication technologies (ICTs) were essential in maintaining relationships with families, yet could separate and isolate the participants in unanticipated ways. The women interviewed conveyed much ambivalence and continuing regret about being separated from their families. Social support from other women workers was crucial for well-being. However, due to the gendered and racialized segregation of assignments that exist in Canadian temporary agricultural work, supportive networks could also isolate and maintain the boundaries of division, as they tended to be with women temporary workers from the same countries of origin.

Health was also grounded in their gendered roles as women migrant workers. Traditional gender norms have been found to be reinforced, rather than lessened, through temporary migration, both for the women who leave for work and their female relatives in the countries of origin engaged in caring for the children left behind (Parreñas, 2010; Scantlebury, 2009). Yet women who migrate for agricultural work have been “...seen both by their employers and their home communities as unusual participants by virtue of their apparent transgression of gender norms as international migrants” (Preibisch & Encalada Grez, 2010, p. 290). Counteracting this perceived transgression may have contributed to the emphasis by the women interviewed to frame their migration within established gendered norms as an act of maternal “sacrifice”. The Mexican women and some of the Filipinas spoke about women being emotionally stronger and more responsible than men, especially with regard to their children. All the participants framed their employment and the monetary contribution to their families as an extension of their role of being the primary caregivers for their children, even during maternal absence.

**Contributions to nursing.** The Canadian Nursing Association and the provincial and territorial nursing organizations have policy statements regarding valuing cultural diversity, sensitivity and competence. However, the culture of original heritage is often emphasized rather than the changed cultural identities that are created through experiences such as migration. This research explored the ways in which the nature,

fluidity, and dynamic qualities of uprootedness can capture the fullness of the migration experience and guide discovery of the complex meanings of displacement, identity, boundaries and relocation. This inquiry was the first Canadian research with women temporary workers in both SAWP and S-LSO specifically exploring the tensions, opportunities and complexities of their lives and health while engaged in agricultural work, and to my knowledge, the first nursing research with women temporary agricultural workers in Canada. Drawing from interdisciplinary literature, critical, feminist and intersectional theoretical perspectives, this inquiry was positioned within the contexts of gendered migration, globalization and social determinants of health. This research advances understanding of the processes and intersections influencing the health and well-being of women employed in temporary agricultural work in Canada, and contributes to the conceptual development of uprootedness that is prolonged and repeated.

### **Challenges and Opportunities for Change**

**Implications for research.** Barriers existed for the women workers that limited their participation in the research. I was expecting that recruitment would be a lengthy process due to the fear of possible reprisals and the time required to establish rapport and trust with both gatekeepers and participants. Potential participants were extremely cautious about talking with me, due to their concern of placing their employment at risk. Although they were assured of confidentiality, all the participants requested that I not attempt to interview their employers. Even when the women were receptive, their work hours were long, sometimes variable on short notice, and included shift work. With little time off for leisure, it was difficult to schedule interview appointments. Researchers need to be aware of and committed to the sustained and flexible involvement in the field and local communities that is necessary to build and maintain trusting relationships.

There is a need for more gendered research with women temporary agricultural workers regarding their health care needs, including occupational health research (Habib & Fathallah, 2012). Most of the participants had experienced repetitive strain injuries in their upper bodies, particularly their hands and wrists, and were not able to access the appropriate treatment and care. Those who participate in temporary worker programs are

changed by their migration and work experiences. However, research is also needed to investigate how Canadian communities are changed by temporary workers and how to create the supportive environments needed for workers, community residents and employers to participate in and advocate for more comprehensive health care (Narushima & Sanchez, 2014). With increasing access to multiple forms of ICTs, inquiry is necessary to explore how technology both helps and hinders connection among families who are geographically separated. ICTs also fostered contact among the women workers while in Canada and could be a valuable tool to communicate health care information and support change.

Research is also needed to explicitly situate and analyze the broader sociopolitical contexts for displacement and relocation (Berman et al., 2009), including critical analysis of how existing power relations and inequities sustain marginalization. Without recognition of the historical and political contexts at play, and the systemic forces and power relations inherent in temporary worker programs, the impacts on the workers and their families affected by recurring and prolonged uprootedness are largely concealed. The complex and fluid experiences of uprootedness and rootedness grounded in larger contexts require further investigation. Exploring the intersections of globalization, uprootedness, gender, precarious migration, and health is necessary in order to advance knowledge and change at personal, collective and structural levels (Anderson, 2000; Oxman-Martinez et al., 2005).

Like the concept of uprootedness, the concept of liminality originated in anthropology, and both have been utilized in a variety of disciplines to guide discovery about the experiences of transition and change, as well as the complex meanings of displacement, identity, boundaries and relocation. In liminality, one is suspended in social space, disrupted “betwixt and between” past and future social positions (Turner, 1969). Being liminal can also lead to “communitas”, which refers to the collective and supportive relationships formed among people who find themselves in similar situations. While the social support from similar others can be nurturing, being in a suspended social space can also maintain isolation. Liminality has been used as a framework to describe the experiences of migrants with precarious status, including the effects on health (Baird &

Reed, 2015; Hennebry, McLaughlin, & Preibisch, 2015; McGuire & Georges, 2003; Menjívar, 2006). The similarities and differences between uprootedness and liminality related to being “out of place” and “neither here nor there”, and the subsequent experiences of rootedness, integration, and health warrant further exploration, particularly for those in low skilled temporary work, who are indefinitely excluded from fully belonging to the communities and countries in which they are employed.

**Implications for advocacy.** Transformative change for participants, which is a goal in critical research (Davidson et al., 2006), has been slower and more restrained than I had initially anticipated. Upon reflection, this is not surprising given the complexity and interrelatedness of the layers of structural violence and the subtle ways resistance and agency often need to be expressed. Extended work hours, precarious immigration and employment status, and their temporary stay in Canada hindered engagement in public and collective actions for most of the participants.

However, the women interviewed were aware of the injustices of their contracts, valued the contributions they were making to their families and to their Canadian communities, and were supportive of the long-term goals of the research. They were also aware of the broader systemic implications of the research as illustrated in this exchange with a group of women from Jamaica:

*What are you doing, writing a book?*

KE: No.... I have to do [research papers] for school...

*What kind of benefit can you get out of it?*

KE: ...what I hope...is to talk to [stakeholders]... and say, this is what the women here are telling me... And the benefit is...

*Trying to get to the bigger things.*

KE: [Yes]...So when I write up what you’ve told me, that doesn’t end for me, it’s about continuing to talk to [others] about what people are telling me about what they need...

*O.k., that’s o.k. with me.*

KE: That’s o.k. with you?

*If you can do it, then do what you can do.*

The continued engagement of researchers, health care providers and community advocates is fundamental in supporting private and public expressions of agency and resistance during the incremental and often subtle emancipatory changes that occur over time (Anderson et al., 2009; Vaughn, 2014).



Throughout the duration of this research, many opportunities arose for me to be involved in local and regional initiatives such as: liaising with health and social care providers and other researchers, participating in migrant worker health fairs, and providing feedback to a district health planning authority. However, these activities often felt disjointed. It was challenging to keep the assertion “think global - act local” in perspective when it was increasingly evident that so much needs to be done at so many levels. Operationalizing critical theory into action and advocacy is complicated, particularly when taking into account the many layers of political and economic contexts and the complexities of power relations.

Intentionally participating in networks within and across communities, promoting diversity in knowledge translation and dissemination, involvement in intersectoral and interdisciplinary collaboration and supporting transformative action are strategies that are required for change. Participating in such efforts requires shifting “the focus from advocacy as ‘speaking on behalf of’ to rigorous reflexive analysis that decenters dominant discourses to open up the possibility for those who have been marginalized to exercise human agency and work alongside researchers toward social justice for all” (Reimer-Kirkham & Anderson, 2010, p. 196). Engaging people in dialogue, being specific about challenges and opportunities, and promoting change at many levels is crucial for success (Anderson et al., 2009; Browne et. al., 2009).

**Implications for policy.** The effects of globalization have resulted in increasingly precarious work that is low-waged. For the participants, the necessity for seeking temporary work arose from the diminished economic conditions in their countries of origins. Once migration has occurred, the increasingly protectionist immigration policies of high-income countries, as reflected in the Canadian immigration status of temporary foreign workers, has relegated and stereotyped people employed in these programs as transitory strangers. Canadians “are encouraged by the structure of [temporary worker programs] to commodify foreign workers and see them as valuable to the economy but undesirable as members of a community” (Foster & Taylor, 2013, p. 183). Workers are explicitly designated as “foreign”, a designation maintained over time as temporary workers in low skilled occupations in Canada are rarely eligible for citizenship. However,

the opportunity for foreign workers to seek employment in Canada is portrayed as freely planned and freely chosen.

It is necessary to contest the neo-liberal values and assumptions about “evidence” in evidence-based policies and become skilled in redefining the “problem”, shaping and influencing how issues are framed (Freudenberg & Tsui, 2014; Nelson, 2013; Pellegrini Filho, 2011). It is also necessary to include the participation of those who are usually not invited to contribute to policy discussions, yet are the most directly affected. Temporary workers bring significant individual and collective strengths to Canada and make important personal and financial contributions. Current representations of temporary foreign workers in Canada need to be challenged to counter prevailing discourses of temporary workers being a valuable source labour in certain sectors, but as a social and economic threat to communities (Foster & Barnetson, 2015). Immigration policies require changes to include: a pathway to permanent residency for low skilled temporary workers, eligibility for settlement services, and less restrictive employment contracts.

Extensive policy changes are needed to address the lack of health and social services for temporary foreign workers. The services that do exist are not well coordinated (Hennebry et al., 2015). This fragmentation is related to the multiple levels of government involved, each with their own mandates, that temporary workers are not eligible for the same government-funded supports as permanent residents, and their invisibility as non-citizens (Bail et al., 2012). To date, many of the programs that improve access to health care have been community initiatives arising from local advocacy (Hennebry et al., 2015).

Integrated efforts and alliances are needed to work with municipal, provincial and national levels of government in order to assess gaps and promote solutions.

**Implications for nursing practice and education.** Nurses at many levels of practice could utilize the knowledge generated from this research to become involved in planning and lobbying for appropriate and relevant health care, including migrant worker clinics and community-based support centres. Increasing the structural responsiveness of health care institutions in relation to the issues and stresses of agricultural and transitory work is another important area. Nurses in primary care practice settings are likely to come into

contact with temporary agricultural workers when episodic care for illness or injury is sought, often through walk-in clinics or emergency departments. Nurses in areas such as public health and community mental health may not ordinarily provide care for temporary workers, who are often unaware of these services. Heightened awareness of the need to promote available services, and of effects of gender, uprootedness and temporary migration on the health of these workers may encourage nurses to probe further in their assessments, to provide more comprehensive, anticipatory, and preventive care, and to advocate and collaborate with women who migrate for economic opportunities not available in their countries of origin.

As stated by McGuire (2014) “Migration scholars recognize and attempt to increase awareness that one of the most critical issues of the 21<sup>st</sup> century is migration, and hence its salience to nurses who care for migrants and immigrants in numerous health care settings” (p. 198). In addition to informing practice, this research also contributes to nursing education, particularly with respect to preparing nurses to work with the increasing numbers of uprooted, mobile populations, and those employed in stressful and physically demanding temporary agricultural work. Nurse educators need to have the theoretical background to guide students in connecting critical and feminist research to practice grounded in advocacy and social justice. In order to advance nursing practice, education, policy development and further research, explicit acknowledgement is needed that the strengths, resiliencies and barriers to health experienced by migrant farmworker women engaged in temporary work are embedded within gendered and intersecting inequities at regional, national and global levels. Research exploring the health of temporary workers in Canada is limited, especially from nursing. Increased research and activism from nurses and others involved in health care in order to explore current practice and generate recommendations for improvement, remains essential.

## **Conclusion**

Participants in this research recognized the injustices of having to leave home in order to support their families and in the working conditions they encountered, yet strongly considered their employment in Canada as a necessary maternal responsibility and caring “sacrifice”. They described uncertainty about initially not knowing what their work and

living arrangements would entail, and the necessity of maintaining a “mindset” to adjust to prolonged and repeated separation from their children, families and countries of origin. Systematic and continuous uncertainty arose from their precarious employment and immigration status. Health was defined holistically with emphasis on the need to remain healthy for temporary work and be strong for their families.

Inquiry through a critical-feminist lens provided the foundation for the critique of intersecting conditions under which constraints as well as opportunities occurred, choices were made and agency expressed. In this inquiry, particular attention was paid to the influences of gender, recurrent migration, uprootedness and temporary agricultural work on women’s health. Congruent with nursing’s traditions of social justice, advocacy and empowerment, and concerned with countering subjugation and the redistribution of power and resources, investigation within a critical-feminist perspective was a powerful process of discovery. This study has relevance for temporary agricultural and migrant workers in other regions and countries, health and social service providers, labour and human rights organizations, employers, and legislators. The findings also have broader relevance to the study of gender and migration in the context of globalization, and the health of foreign temporary workers who are denied access to the benefits, protection, and rights of citizenship while in Canada.

## References

- Anderson, J. (2000). Gender, 'race', poverty, health and discourses of health reform in the context of globalization: A postcolonial feminist perspective in policy research. *Nursing Inquiry*, 7(4), 220-229.
- Anderson, J. M., Rodney, P., Reimer-Kirkham, S., Browne, A. J., Khan, K. B., & Lynam, J. (2009). Inequities in health and healthcare viewed through the ethical lens of critical social justice: Contextual knowledge for the global priorities ahead. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 32(4), 282-294.
- Bail, K. M., Foster, J., George Dalmida, S., Kelly, U., Howett, M., Ferranti, E. P., & Wold, J. (2012). The impact of invisibility on the health of migrant farmworkers in the southeastern United States: A case study from Georgia. *Nursing Research and Practice*, doi:10.1155/2012/760418
- Baird, M. B., & Reed, P. G. (2015). Liminality in cultural transition: Applying ID-EA to advance a concept into theory-based practice. *Research and Theory for Nursing Practice: An International Journal*, 29(1), 25-37. doi:10.1891/1541-6577.29.1.25
- Berman, H., Alvernaz Mulcahy, G., Forchuk, C., Edmunds, K., Haldenby, A., & Lopez, R. (2009). Uprooted and displaced: A critical narrative study of homeless, aboriginal, and newcomer girls in Canada. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 30(7), 418-430.
- Browne, A. J., Varcoe, C., Smye, V., Reimer-Kirkham, S., Lynam, J., & Wong, S. (2009). Cultural safety and the challenges of translating critically oriented knowledge in practice. *Nursing Philosophy*, 10, 167-179.
- Carter, S., & Little, M. (2007). Justifying knowledge, justifying method, taking action: Epistemologies, methodologies, and methods in qualitative research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 17(10), 1316-1328.
- Davidson, H., Evans, S., Ganote, C., Henrickson, J., Jacobs-Priebe, L., Jones, D. L.,..... Reimer, M. (2006). Power and action in critical theory across disciplines: Implications for critical community psychology. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 38, 35-49.
- Foster, J., & Barnetson, B. (2015). The construction of migrant work and workers by Alberta legislators, 2000-2011. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 47(1), 107-131.
- Foster, J., & Taylor, A. (2013). In the shadows: Exploring the notion of "community" for temporary foreign workers in a boomtown. *Canadian Journal of Sociology/Cahiers Canadiens de Sociologie*, 38(2), 167-190.
- Freudenberg, N., & Tsui, E. (2014). Evidence, power, and policy change in community-based participatory research. *American Journal of Public Health*, 104, 11-14.
- Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). Paradigms and perspectives in contention. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp.191-216). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

- Habib, R. R., & Fathallah, F. A. (2012). Migrant women farm workers in the occupational health literature. *Work, 41*, 4356-4362. doi:10.3233/WOR-2012-0101-4356
- Hennebry, J. L., McLaughlin, J., & Preibisch, K. (2015). Out of the loop: (In)access to health care for migrant workers in Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*. doi:10.1007/s12134-015-0417-1
- Holloway, I., & Todres, L. (2003). The status of method: Flexibility, consistency and coherence. *Qualitative Research, 3*(3), 345-357.
- Madison, D. S. (2012). *Critical ethnography: Method, ethics, and performance* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.
- Malkki, L. (1995). Refugees and exile: From “refugee studies” to the national order of things. *Annual Review of Anthropology, 24*, 495-523.
- Maxell, J. A. (2005). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- McGuire, S. (2014). Borders, centers, and margins: Critical landscapes for migrant health. *Advances in Nursing Science, 37*(3), 197-212. doi:10.1097/ANS.0000000000000030
- McGuire, S., & Georges, J. (2003). Undocumentedness and liminality as health variables. *Advances in Nursing Science, 26*(3), 185-195.
- Menjívar, C. (2006). Liminal legality: Salvadoran and Guatemalan immigrants' lives in the United States. *American Journal of Sociology, 111*(4), 999-1037.
- Morse, J. M. (2015). Critical analysis of strategies for determining rigor in qualitative inquiry. *Qualitative Health Research, 25*(9), 1212-1222. doi:10.1177/1049732315588501
- Narushima, M., & Sanchez, A. (2014). Employers' paradoxical views about temporary foreign migrant workers' health: A qualitative study in rural farms in southern Ontario. *International Journal for Equity in Health, 13* (65). doi:10.1186/s12939-014-0065-7
- Nelson, G. (2013). Community psychology and transformative policy change in the neo-liberal era. *American Journal of Community Psychology, 52*, 211-223.
- Oleson, V. (2005). Early millennial feminist qualitative research design: Challenges and contours. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp. 235-278). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Oxman-Martinez, J., Hanley, J., Lach, L., Khanlou, N., Weerasinghe, S., & Agnew, V. (2005). Intersection of Canadian policy parameters affecting women with precarious immigration status: A baseline for understanding barriers to health. *Journal of Immigrant Health, 7*(4), 247-258.
- Parreñas, R. S. (2010). Transnational mothering: A source of gender conflicts in the family. *North Carolina Law Review, 88*(5), 1825-1855.

- Pellegrini Filho, A. (2011). Public policy and the social determinants of health: The challenge of the production and use of scientific evidence. *Cadernos de Saúde Pública*, 27(Sup 2), S135-S140.
- Preibisch, K. (2007). Local produce, foreign labor: Labor mobility programs and global trade competitiveness in Canada. *Rural Sociology*, 72(3), 418-449.
- Preibisch, K. L., & Encalada Grez, E. (2010). The other side of el otro lado: Mexican migrant women and labor flexibility in Canadian agriculture. *Signs*, 35(2), 289-316.
- Reimer-Kirkham, S., Anderson, J. M. (2010). The advocate-analyst dialectic in critical and postcolonial feminist research: Reconciling tensions around scientific integrity. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 33(3), 196-205.
- Richardson, L., & Adams St. Pierre, E. (2005). Writing: A method of inquiry. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., pp. 959-978). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Scantlebury, T. (2009). *Shifting responsibilities in migrant matrifocal households: A look at transnational households in the Caribbean* (Master's thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (MR52262)
- Turner, V. (1969). *The ritual process: Structure and anti-structure*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Vaughn, C. (2014). Participatory research with youth: Idealising safe social spaces or building transformative links in difficult environments? *Journal of Health Psychology*, 19(1), 184-192.
- Whittemore, R., Chase, S. K., & Mandle, C. L. (2001). Validity in qualitative research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 11(4), 522-537.

## Appendix A: Copyright Permission

**From:** Cjnr Nursing [mailto:cjnr.nursing@mcgill.ca]  
**Sent:** January-19-16 9:47 AM  
**To:** Kathryn Edmunds  
**Subject:** RE: permission to use an article

Hello Kathryn,

As the author of the published article we usually offer permission without any charge. Kindly make sure that the article is properly referenced and it is stated that McGill University Library holds the copyright to this article.

Many thanks.  
 Joanna

**From:** Kathryn Edmunds  
**Sent:** Monday, January 18, 2016 2:21 PM  
**To:** Cjnr Nursing <cjnr.nursing@mcgill.ca>  
**Subject:** permission to use an article  
**Importance:** High

Good afternoon,  
 Please see the request below for permission to use that article.  
 Thank you

**From:** Kathryn Edmunds  
**Sent:** October-13-15 9:24 AM  
**To:** 'cjnr.nursing@mcgill.ca' <cjnr.nursing@mcgill.ca>  
**Subject:** copyright release

Good morning,  
 I am requesting a copyright release for the article:  
 Edmunds, K., Berman, H., Basok, T., Ford-Gilboe, M., & Forchuk, C. (2011). The health of women temporary agricultural workers in Canada: A critical review of the literature. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 43(4), 68–91.

I am a Doctoral Candidate at Western University and in the process of completing my dissertation in an integrated-article (manuscript) format. The article published in CJNR is the literature review chapter for my dissertation and I am seeking permission to use it for that purpose.

Thank you,  
 Kathryn Edmunds RN, PhD(c)



## Appendix B: Ethics Approval



### Office of Research Ethics

The University of Western Ontario  
Room 4180 Support Services Building, London, ON, Canada N6A 5C1  
Telephone: (519) 661-3036 Fax: (519) 850-2466 Email: [ethics@uwo.ca](mailto:ethics@uwo.ca)  
Website: [www.uwo.ca/research/ethics](http://www.uwo.ca/research/ethics)

### Use of Human Subjects - Ethics Approval Notice

**Principal Investigator:** Dr. H. Berman

**Review Number:** 16916E

**Review Date:** February 24, 2010

**Review Level:** Expedited

**Approved Local # of Participants:** 25

**Protocol Title:** Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers: A Critical Ethnography

**Department and Institution:** Nursing, University of Western Ontario

**Sponsor:**

**Ethics Approval Date:** March 12, 2010

**Expiry Date:** April 30, 2011

**Documents Reviewed and Approved:** UWO Protocol, Letter of Information and Consent, Letter of Information and Consent (Those being photographed), Letter of Information and Consent (participant release form), Confidentiality Agreement, Poster, Announcement.

#### Documents Received for Information:

This is to notify you that The University of Western Ontario Research Ethics Board for Health Sciences Research Involving Human Subjects (HSREB) which is organized and operates according to the Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct of Research Involving Humans and the Health Canada/ICH Good Clinical Practice Practices: Consolidated Guidelines; and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario has reviewed and granted approval to the above referenced study on the approval date noted above. The membership of this REB also complies with the membership requirements for REB's as defined in Division 5 of the Food and Drug Regulations.

The ethics approval for this study shall remain valid until the expiry date noted above assuming timely and acceptable responses to the HSREB's periodic requests for surveillance and monitoring information. If you require an updated approval notice prior to that time you must request it using the UWO Updated Approval Request Form.

During the course of the research, no deviations from, or changes to, the protocol or consent form may be initiated without prior written approval from the HSREB except when necessary to eliminate immediate hazards to the subject or when the change(s) involve only logistical or administrative aspects of the study (e.g. change of monitor, telephone number). Expedited review of minor change(s) in ongoing studies will be considered. Subjects must receive a copy of the signed information/consent documentation.

Investigators must promptly also report to the HSREB:

- a) changes increasing the risk to the participant(s) and/or affecting significantly the conduct of the study;
- b) all adverse and unexpected experiences or events that are both serious and unexpected;
- c) new information that may adversely affect the safety of the subjects or the conduct of the study.

If these changes/adverse events require a change to the information/consent documentation, and/or recruitment advertisement, the newly revised information/consent documentation, and/or advertisement, must be submitted to this office for approval.

Members of the HSREB who are named as investigators in research studies, or declare a conflict of interest, do not participate in discussion related to, nor vote on, such studies when they are presented to the HSREB.

Chair of HSREB: Dr. Joseph Gilbert  
FDA Ref. #: IRB 00000940

Ethics Officer to Contact for Further Information

*This is an official document. Please retain the original in your files.*

cc: ORE File



## Office of Research Ethics

The University of Western Ontario  
Room 4180 Support Services Building, London, ON, Canada N6A 5C1  
Telephone: (519) 661-3036 Fax: (519) 850-2466 Email: [ethics@uwo.ca](mailto:ethics@uwo.ca)  
Website: [www.uwo.ca/research/ethics](http://www.uwo.ca/research/ethics)

### Use of Human Subjects - Ethics Approval Notice

**Principal Investigator:** Dr. H. Berman

**Review Level:** Expedited

**Review Number:** 16916E

**Revision Number:** 1

**Review Date:** July 16, 2010

**Approved Local # of Participants:** 25

**Protocol Title:** Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers: A Critical Ethnography

**Department and Institution:** Nursing, University of Western Ontario

**Sponsor:**

**Ethics Approval Date:** July 16, 2010

**Expiry Date:** April 30, 2011

**Documents Reviewed and Approved:** Revised eligibility of subjects and letter of information and consent. Announcement, Advertisement.

**Documents Received for Information:**

This is to notify you that The University of Western Ontario Research Ethics Board for Health Sciences Research Involving Human Subjects (HSREB) which is organized and operates according to the Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct of Research Involving Humans and the Health Canada/ICH Good Clinical Practice Practices: Consolidated Guidelines; and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario has reviewed and granted approval to the above referenced revision(s) or amendment(s) on the approval date noted above. The membership of this REB also complies with the membership requirements for REB's as defined in Division 5; of the Food and Drug Regulations.

The ethics approval for this study shall remain valid until the expiry date noted above assuming timely and acceptable responses to the HSREB's periodic requests for surveillance and monitoring information. If you require an updated approval notice prior to that time you must request it using the UWO Updated Approval Request Form.

During the course of the research, no deviations from, or changes to, the protocol or consent form may be initiated without prior written approval from the HSREB except when necessary to eliminate immediate hazards to the subject or when the change(s) involve only logistical or administrative aspects of the study (e.g. change of monitor, telephone number). Expedited review of minor change(s) in ongoing studies will be considered. Subjects must receive a copy of the signed information/consent documentation.

Investigators must promptly also report to the HSREB:

- a) changes increasing the risk to the participant(s) and/or affecting significantly the conduct of the study;
- b) all adverse and unexpected experiences or events that are both serious and unexpected;
- c) new information that may adversely affect the safety of the subjects or the conduct of the study.

If these changes/adverse events require a change to the information/consent documentation, and/or recruitment advertisement, the newly revised information/consent documentation, and/or advertisement, must be submitted to this office for approval.

Members of the HSREB who are named as investigators in research studies, or declare a conflict of interest, do not participate in discussion related to, nor vote on, such studies when they are presented to the HSREB.

Chair of HSREB: Dr. Joseph Gilbert  
FDA Ref. #: IRB 00000940

**Ethics Officer to Contact for Further Information**

*This is an official document. Please retain the original in your files.*

cc: ORE File

UWO HSREB Ethics Approval - Revision  
V.2008-07-01 (optApprovalNoticeHSREB\_REV)

16916E

Page 1 of 1



# Use of Human Participants - Ethics Approval Notice

Principal Investigator: Dr. Helene Berman  
 Review Number: 16916E  
 Review Level: Delegated  
 Approved Local Adult Participants: 25  
 Approved Local Minor Participants: 0  
 Protocol Title: Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers: A Critical Ethnography  
 Department & Institution: Faculty of Education, University of Western Ontario  
 Sponsor:  
 Ethics Approval Date: Expiry Date: April 30, 2011  
 Documents Reviewed & Approved & Documents Received for Information:

Document Name	Comments	Version Date
Revised Study End Date	The study end date has been revised to August 31, 2011 to allow for study completion.	

This is to notify you that The University of Western Ontario Research Ethics Board for Health Sciences Research Involving Human Subjects (HSREB) which is organized and operates according to the Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct of Research Involving Humans and the Health Canada/ICH Good Clinical Practice Practices: Consolidated Guidelines; and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario has reviewed and granted approval to the above referenced revision(s) or amendment(s) on the approval date noted above. The membership of this REB also complies with the membership requirements for REB's as defined in Division 5 of the Food and Drug Regulations.

The ethics approval for this study shall remain valid until the expiry date noted above assuming timely and acceptable responses to the HSREB's periodic requests for surveillance and monitoring information. If you require an updated approval notice prior to that time you must request it using the UWO Updated Approval Request Form.

Members of the HSREB who are named as investigators in research studies, or declare a conflict of interest, do not participate in discussion related to, nor vote on, such studies when they are presented to the HSREB.

The Chair of the HSREB is Dr. Joseph Gilbert. The UWO HSREB is registered with the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services under the IRB registration number IRB 0000940.

Ethics Officer to Contact for Further Information

*This is an official document. Please retain the original in your files.*

The University of Western Ontario  
 Office of Research Ethics

Support Services Building Room 5150 • London, Ontario • CANADA - N6A 3K7  
 PH: 519-661-3036 • F: 519-850-2466 • [ethics@uwo.ca](mailto:ethics@uwo.ca) • [www.uwo.ca/research/ethics](http://www.uwo.ca/research/ethics)



# Use of Human Participants - Ethics Approval Notice

**Principal Investigator:** Dr. Helene Berman  
**Review Number:** 16916E  
**Review Level:** Delegated  
**Approved Local Adult Participants:** 25  
**Approved Local Minor Participants:** 0  
**Protocol Title:** Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers: A Critical Ethnography  
**Department & Institution:** Faculty of Education, University of Western Ontario  
**Sponsor:**  
**Ethics Approval Date:** September 30, 2011      **Expiry Date:** November 30, 2011  
**Documents Reviewed & Approved & Documents Received for Information:**

Document Name	Comments	Version Date
Revised Study End Date	The study end date has been revised to November 30, 2011 to allow for study completion.	

This is to notify you that The University of Western Ontario Research Ethics Board for Health Sciences Research Involving Human Subjects (HSREB) which is organized and operates according to the Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct of Research Involving Humans and the Health Canada/ICH Good Clinical Practice Practices: Consolidated Guidelines; and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario has reviewed and granted approval to the above referenced revision(s) or amendment(s) on the approval date noted above. The membership of this REB also complies with the membership requirements for REBs as defined in Division 5 of the Food and Drug Regulations.

The ethics approval for this study shall remain valid until the expiry date noted above assuming timely and acceptable responses to the HSREB's periodic requests for surveillance and monitoring information. If you require an updated approval notice prior to that time you must request it using the UWO Updated Approval Request Form.

Members of the HSREB who are named as investigators in research studies, or declare a conflict of interest, do not participate in discussion related to, nor vote on, such studies when they are presented to the HSREB.

The Chair of the HSREB is Dr. Joseph Gilbert. The UWO HSREB is registered with the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services under the IRB registration number IRB 00000940.

Ethics Officer to Contact for Further Information

*This is an official document. Please retain the original in your files.*

**The University of Western Ontario**  
 Office of Research Ethics  
 Support Services Building Room 5150 • London, Ontario • CANADA - N6G 1G9  
 PH: 519-661-3036 • F: 519-850-2466 • [ethics@uwo.ca](mailto:ethics@uwo.ca) • [www.uwo.ca/research/ethics](http://www.uwo.ca/research/ethics)

## **Appendix C: Information Letter For Study Participants**

### **Information Letter**

#### **Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers: A Critical Ethnography**

Study Investigator: Kathryn Edmunds, RN, PhD (c)  
 Doctoral Student, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western Ontario

Student Supervisor: Dr. Helene Berman, RN, PhD  
 Associate Professor, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western Ontario

You are invited to participate in a research study about the health of women seasonal agricultural workers who migrate to Canada for temporary work. The aim of this study is to understand how time away from your family and home country, and your work here in Canada, may affect your health.

You may be able to participate if you:

- have current or past employment as a seasonal agricultural worker in the Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program or the Temporary Foreign Worker Program
- are able to speak English, Spanish, Thai or Tagalog
- are between the ages of 18 and 65
- are currently residing in southwestern Ontario

The purpose of this letter is to provide you with the information to make an informed decision about participating in this research. I am a Doctoral student in the School of Nursing at the University of Western Ontario and the information I am collecting will be used in my thesis.

If you take part in the study, you will be asked to:

- participate in 1-2 interviews with me.

You will be asked questions that will help me to understand how you feel about:

- being away from your home
- the work you do in Canada
- your health and everyday life

Interviews will take approximately 1– 1 1/2 hours to complete.

You will be able to choose if the interviews are by yourself or in a small group of 2-4 women. These group interviews are called focus groups. Focus group members are asked to keep everything they hear confidential and not to discuss it outside of the meeting. However, I cannot guarantee that confidentiality will be maintained by group members.

The interviews will be held at a place you choose and feel comfortable, such as:

- where you live
- at a community centre
- or at a coffee-shop

The interviews will be audio taped so that I can pay careful attention to what you are saying.

At the end of the first interview, you will also be asked if you wish to take photographs of your everyday life here in Canada and share those photographs with me. If you agree, you will be given a disposable camera and we will talk about how to use the camera, the consents that will be needed if you take photographs of other people, and that you only take pictures that feel safe for you. After 2 weeks, I will pick up the camera from you so I can develop the photographs. Two sets of the photographs will be made. I will keep one set, and the other set will be given to you. A second interview will be arranged so you can describe your photographs to me. You may also agree to a second interview without taking any photographs.

There are no known risks to your participation.

However, talking about any stresses at work, from being away from your families, or with your health could cause you some emotional discomfort.

You may not benefit directly from your participation in this study.

Potential benefits include increased insight and understanding of how you and other women workers feel about your work and health, and improved programs and policies that address the health needs of seasonal agricultural workers.

Information provided by you will be used for research purposes only. No information that discloses your identity will be released or published without your consent. Your research records, including interview transcripts, any photographs, and audio recordings of the interviews, will only be available to the study investigator and her supervisor, and they will be stored in a locked cabinet in a secure location. They will be destroyed after 7 years. Representatives of the University of Western Ontario Health Sciences Research Ethics Board may contact you or require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the research.

Reimbursement for expenses such as transportation, and/or for the time required to participate will be provided. You will receive \$20.00 cash for each interview in which you participate. If you agree to take photographs, you will also receive \$10.00 when the camera is picked up by me in order to develop the pictures.

Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may refuse to participate, refuse to answer any questions or withdraw from the study at anytime with no effect on your future status or employment in Canada. You can also request that the information you have given me is withdrawn from the study up to the point when the results are published. You will be given a copy of this letter of information and consent form once it has been

signed. If you would like to receive a copy of the overall results of the study please put your name and address on a blank piece of paper and leave it with me.

If you have any questions about the study or your rights as a research participant you may contact Kathryn Edmunds (study investigator) or Dr. Helene Berman (doctoral supervisor) or:

The Office of Research Ethics  
University of Western Ontario

Thank you

**Appendix D: Consent Form For Study Participants**  
**Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers:**  
**A Critical Ethnography**

Study Investigator: Kathryn Edmunds, RN, PhD (c)  
 Doctoral Student, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western  
 Ontario

Student Supervisor: Dr. Helene Berman, RN, PhD  
 Associate Professor, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western  
 Ontario

**Consent**

I have read the letter of information, have had the nature of the study explained to me,  
 and I agree to participate. All questions have been answered to my satisfaction.

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Name of participant (please print)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Signature of participant

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Name of interpreter (if needed – please print)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Signature of interpreter

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Name of investigator (please print)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Signature of investigator

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Date



**Appendix E: Recruitment Flyer**  
**Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers Study**

Kathryn Edmunds, a doctoral student in nursing at the University of Western Ontario is conducting a study about the experiences of women seasonal agricultural workers who migrate to Canada for temporary work.

The focus of the study is to understand how time away from your family and home country, and your work here in Canada may influence your health.

You may be able to participate if you:

- a) have current or past employment as a seasonal agricultural worker in the Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program or the Temporary Foreign Worker Program
- b) are able to speak English, Spanish, Thai or Tagalog
- c) are between the ages of 18 and 65
- d) are currently residing in southwestern Ontario.

For more information and contact in English:  
Kathryn Edmunds

All participants will receive compensation for your time.

**Appendix F: Announcement for Radio, Information Meetings**  
**Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers Study**

My name is Kathryn Edmunds and I am a doctoral student in Nursing at the University of Western Ontario. I am conducting a study about the experiences of women seasonal agricultural workers who migrate to Canada for temporary work.

The focus of the study is to understand how time away from your family and home country, and your work here in Canada may influence your health.

You may be able to participate if you:

- a) have current or past employment as a seasonal agricultural worker in the Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program or the Temporary Foreign Worker Program
- b) are able to speak English, Spanish, Thai or Tagalog
- c) are between the ages of 18 and 65
- d) are currently residing in southwestern Ontario.

For more information and contact in English: Kathryn Edmunds

Thank you

**Appendix G: Interpreter/Translator Confidentiality Agreement**  
**Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers:**  
**A Critical Ethnography**

Study Investigator: Kathryn Edmunds, RN, PhD (c)  
 Doctoral Student, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western  
 Ontario

Student Supervisor: Dr. Helene Berman, RN, PhD  
 Associate Professor, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western  
 Ontario

I, \_\_\_\_\_, as an interpreter, will be permitted to have access to participant information in order to perform interpretation and translation work related to the above research study. I agree to keep all information that I learn about the participants confidential. I understand that I may not discuss or disclose any information related to any participant to anyone other than the researcher and her supervisor.

I further understand that I may learn personal information about participants and their families that is private. I understand that it is my duty and responsibility to preserve and protect this privacy and confidentiality. I understand that this duty will extend after I am no longer providing interpretation and translation services for this study.

Both federal and provincial laws protect the confidentiality of participants. By signing below, I indicate that I understand and agree to maintain the privacy of the participants' research-related and personal information.

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Name of witness (please print)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Name of interpreter/translator  
 (please print)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Signature of witness

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Signature of interpreter/translator

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Date

## **Appendix H: Information Letter For Study Participants - Spanish**

### **Carta de Información**

#### **Desarraigo y Salud de las Mujeres Trabajadoras Agrícolas Temporales: Una Etnografía Crítica**

Investigadora: Kathryn Edmunds, RN, PhD (c)

Estudiante de Doctorado, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western Ontario

Supervisor del Estudiante: Dr. Helene Berman, RN, PhD

Associate Professor, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western Ontario

#### **Contacto en español:**

Se te invita a participar en un estudio sobre la salud de las mujeres trabajadoras agrícolas temporales que migran a Canadá para trabajar de forma temporal.

El objetivo de este estudio es comprender cómo su trabajo y el hecho de estar lejos de su país y de su familia pueden influir en su salud.

Tú puedes participar en este estudio si:

- Trabajas o has trabajado como trabajadora agrícola temporal en el marco del Programa de Trabajadores Agrícolas Temporales (PTAT) o el Programa de Trabajadores Extranjeros Temporales (PTET)
- Hablas inglés, español, Thai o Tagalog
- Tienes entre 18 y 65 años de edad
- Resides en el suroeste de Ontario

El propósito de esta carta es darte información sobre el estudio que estamos llevando a cabo para que puedas dar tu consentimiento informado si es que decides participar en este estudio. Soy estudiante de doctorado de la Escuela de Enfermería de la Universidad de Western Ontario y la información que estoy recolectando será usada para la elaboración de mi tesis.

Si participas en este estudio, se te solicitará lo siguiente:

- participar en 1-2 entrevistas conmigo

En estas entrevistas se te harán preguntas que me ayudarán a entender cómo te sientes en relación con:

- Estar lejos de tu hogar
- El trabajo que haces en Canadá
- Tu salud y tu vida cotidiana

Las entrevistas durarán entre 1-1.5 horas.

Tú podrás elegir si llevamos a cabo la entrevista de forma individual o en un pequeño grupo de entre 2 y 4 mujeres. Estas entrevistas llevadas a cabo en grupo son llamadas entrevistas focales. A los participantes en las entrevistas focales se les pide mantener en estricta confidencialidad todo lo que escuchan durante la conversación grupal y no compartir esta información con nadie más. Sin embargo, yo no puedo garantizar que los miembros del grupo mantendrán la confidencialidad.

Las entrevistas se llevarán a cabo en el lugar que tú elijas y en el que te sientas cómoda. Puedes elegir lugares, tal como:

- El lugar donde vives
- Un centro comunitario
- Un café público.

Las entrevistas serán grabadas para que yo pueda poner especial atención en lo que tú dices.

Una vez que terminemos la entrevista, se te preguntará si deseas tomar fotografías de tu vida cotidiana aquí en Canadá y compartir luego esas fotografías conmigo. Si estás de acuerdo en esto, se te dará una cámara desechable y hablaremos sobre su uso, el consentimiento que tendrás que solicitar si tomas fotos de otras personas y el hecho de que debes de tomar sólo fotos con las que te sientas segura. Después de 2 semanas, yo recogeré la cámara y revelaré las fotografías. Se harán dos juegos de las fotografías. Yo me quedaré con un juego y te entregaré el otro juego. Luego acordaremos una segunda entrevista en la que hablarás de tus fotografías conmigo. También puedes decidir si participas en una segunda entrevista sin tomar ya ninguna fotografía.

Tu participación en este estudio no implica ningún riesgo.

Sin embargo, el hecho de hablar de cosas relacionadas con el estrés en el trabajo, el estar lejos de tu familia, o de tu salud, puede causarte incomodidad emocional.

Tal vez no te beneficies directamente de tu participación en este estudio.

Un beneficio que se puede derivar de tu participación en este estudio es el hecho de que te puede ayudar a incrementar tu capacidad de entendimiento sobre la forma en que tú y otras mujeres se sienten en relación al trabajo. También este estudio puede estimular la creación de programas y políticas públicas orientadas a mejorar las condiciones de salud de las mujeres trabajadoras agrícolas temporales.

La información que proporcionas será utilizada sólo con fines de investigación. La información que revele tu identidad no será dada a conocer y no será publicada sin tu consentimiento. Las grabaciones y transcripciones de tus entrevistas, así como las fotografías, estarán sólo al alcance de la investigadora que lleva a cabo este estudio y su supervisora, y serán guardadas en un lugar seguro. Serán destruidas después de 7 años. Representantes de la Oficina de Ética en la Investigación de la Universidad de Western Ontario podría ponerse en contacto contigo o requerir acceso a tu archivo de participación en este estudio para monitorear la conducta de la investigación.

Se te reembolsarán los gastos de transportación y/o de tiempo invertido en tu participación. Recibirás \$20.00 dólares en efectivo por cada entrevista en la que participes. Si estás de acuerdo en tomar fotografías, recibirás \$10.00 dólares cuando recoja yo la cámara para trabajar en el revelado de las fotografías.

Tu participación en este estudio es voluntaria. Puedes rehusarte a participar o a contestar preguntas y puedes retirar tu participación en el estudio en cualquier momento que así decidas. Esto no afectará en ningún sentido tu estatus migratorio o de empleo aquí en Canadá. También puedes solicitar que alguna parte de la información que das aquí sea omitida siempre y cuando lo hagas antes de que los resultados sean publicados. Se te dará una copia de esta carta de información y forma de consentimiento una vez que sea firmada. Si quisieras recibir una copia de los resultados de este estudio, anota tu nombre y dirección en una hoja de papel, por favor, y déjala conmigo.

Si tienes preguntas o dudas sobre este estudio o sobre tus derechos como participante de esta investigación, puedes ponerte en contacto con Kathryn Edmunds (investigadora) o con la Dra. Helene Berman (supervisora de investigación), o con:

The Office of Research Ethics (Oficina de Ética en la Investigación)  
University of Western Ontario

Muchas gracias.

**Appendix I: Consent Form For Study Participants - Spanish**  
**Desarraigo y Salud de las Mujeres Trabajadoras Agrícolas Temporales:**  
**Una Etnografía Crítica**

Investigadora: Kathryn Edmunds, RN, PhD (c)  
 Estudiante de Doctorado, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western Ontario

Supervisor del Estudiante: Dr. Helene Berman, RN, PhD  
 Associate Professor, Arthur Labatt Family School of Nursing, University of Western Ontario

**Consentimiento**

He leído la carta información, se me ha explicado la naturaleza de este estudio, y doy mi consentimiento para participar. Todas las dudas que tengo se me han aclarado satisfactoriamente.

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Nombre de la participante (favor de utilizar letra de molde)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Firma de la participante

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Fecha

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Nombre del intérprete (favor de utilizar letra de molde)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Firma del intérprete

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Fecha

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Nombre de la investigadora (favor de utilizar letra de molde)

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Firma de la investigadora

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Fecha

## **Appendix J: Recruitment Flyer – Spanish**

### **Invitación**

#### **A participar en un estudio sobre la salud de las mujeres trabajadoras agrícolas temporales**

Kathryn Edmunds, estudiante de doctorado en enfermería en la Universidad de Western Ontario, está llevando a cabo un estudio sobre las experiencias de mujeres trabajadoras agrícolas que migran a Canadá a trabajar de manera temporal.

El objetivo de este estudio es comprender cómo su trabajo y el hecho de estar lejos de su país y de su familia pueden influir en su salud.

Usted puede participar en este estudio si:

- a) Trabaja o ha trabajado como trabajadora agrícola temporal en el marco del Programa de Trabajadores Agrícolas Temporales (PTAT) o el Programa de Trabajadores Extranjeros Temporales (PTET)
- b) Habla inglés o español
- c) Tiene entre 18 y 65 años de edad
- d) Reside en el suroeste de Ontario

Para mayor información, favor de comunicarse (en inglés) con: Kathryn Edmunds  
Contacto en español:

Todas las que participan en este estudio recibirán recompensa.



**Appendix K: Announcement for Radio, Information Meetings****Invitación****A participar en un estudio sobre la salud de las mujeres trabajadoras agrícolas temporales**

Kathryn Edmunds, estudiante de doctorado en enfermería en la Universidad de Western Ontario, está llevando a cabo un estudio sobre las experiencias de mujeres trabajadoras agrícolas que migran a Canadá a trabajar de manera temporal.

El objetivo de este estudio es comprender cómo su trabajo y el hecho de estar lejos de su país y de su familia pueden influir en su salud.

Usted puede participar en este estudio si:

- a) Trabaja o ha trabajado como trabajadora agrícola temporal en el marco del Programa de Trabajadores Agrícolas Temporales (PTAT) o el Programa de Trabajadores Extranjeros Temporales (PTET)
- b) Habla inglés o español
- c) Tiene entre 18 y 65 años de edad
- d) Reside en el suroeste de Ontario

Para mayor información, favor de comunicarse (en inglés) con:

Kathryn Edmunds

Contacto en español:

Todas las que participan en este estudio recibirán recompensa.

Gracias

## **Appendix L: Interview Guidelines**

### **Uprootedness and Health of Women Seasonal Agricultural Workers:**

#### **A Critical Ethnography**

Date:

#### Introduction

Thank-you for participating in this interview. I would like to understand as much as possible about your experiences of health as you come to Canada for seasonal agricultural work.

#### Demographic Data

1. Unique ID:
2. Age (year of birth):
3. Employment in Canada:
  - How many years have you been employed in SAWP or TFWP?
  - Other employment/relocation(s)?
4. Country of origin:
5. Marital Status:
6. Family:
  - Who do you consider to belong to your family? How are you connected to them?
  - Who is working in your family? Where?
  - Do you have children?
7. Language
  - What language (s) do you speak? Your family?
  - What language(s) did you grow up speaking?*
  - Do you have any language barriers while you are in Canada?

#### Uprootedness

1. What your life was like growing up?
  - Where? Rural/urban? With whom?
2. Did you live in one place or did you move around?
  - If so, how much?
  - What were the circumstances around moving?
3. How did you come to migrate for work in Canada?
  - How long have you been coming to Canada to work? How long do you stay?
  - What is it like to work in SAWP/TFWP? What kind(s) of work do you do?
  - Are there difficulties in your work here? How have you handled these?
  - Are there benefits?
  - How does migrating for work affect you and your family, especially your children, and your spouse/partner?

What kinds of things do you do to make your life and work in Canada better?

4. What is it like to be a woman in SAWP/TFWP?

A woman of colour in this community in Canada?

5. What does 'home' mean to you?

How do you feel when you talk about 'home'?

Has this feeling changed in some way over time?

6. What does 'community' mean to you?

In what ways do you feel that your community has shaped your life and the person you are today?

Do you feel like you are part of a community now, in Canada or in your home country?

What community do you feel most connected to? And least connected to?

7. How would you describe your home(s) and community(ies) today?

Who/what does this include?

Where do you feel most comfortable? In what places? Why?

8. Affiliations:

Are there any groups in Canada that you are connected with or feel a connection to?

How about at home?

9. If you had a choice, where would you like to be?

### Stories of Health

1. What does 'being healthy' mean to you?

2. When you are feeling healthy, what's going on in your life that makes you feel this way?

3. When you are feeling not healthy, what's going on in your life that makes you feel this way?

4. What sorts of things do you need or do to feel healthy?

How do you take care of yourself and your health?

5. Who do you think are the healthiest people in your community - here and at home?

6. Who are the least healthy people in your community – here and at home?

7. Does migrating for work affect how you feel about yourself? Your life? Your health?

What health concerns do you have right now?

How do you handle these concerns?

8. How does the work you do here in Canada affect your health?
9. Where have you gone to get help when you need it while you are here in Canada?  
Health care? Other services?  
What has this been like for you?
10. Support network  
Who do you consider to be part of your support group?  
Who takes care of you emotionally?  
How do you feel about your own situation in relation to others you know?
11. What would you like to see changed about SAWP/TFWP, if anything?
12. Where do you see yourself 5 years from now?

For those Participating in Photovoice

1. How would you describe the photos you took?
2. How do these photos relate to your health, being away from your family, and your work here in Canada?
3. Are there any photos that are especially significant to you?

Debriefing

The Interview is now officially over. However, I would like to ask you a few questions about the process if that's ok with you.

1. Is there anything you'd like to share that hasn't already been raised? Is there anything else that you feel is important to say about uprootedness and health in your life?
2. How do you feel now about participating?
3. Are there any questions you would like to ask me? Or my supervisor?
4. Do you want some support after this session in any way? (Note: support can include a variety of services/agencies)
5. Would you like to participate in the photovoice (taking photographs) part of the study?

For the Future

Name:

Employer/Nature of Work:

Contact information:

Unique ID:

Name to be used in research reports:

Follow-up

1. Can we contact you in the future if we would like to talk with you again?
2. For those who agreed to participate in photovoice: What is the best way to get in touch with you?
3. Can you give me contact information for someone else who knows how to get in touch with you?

After the study is completed, I will send you a summary of the findings if you would like.

Yes\_\_\_\_\_

No\_\_\_\_\_

I would also like to form an “Advisory Group” – a small group that will include women workers in SAWP/TFWP who have participated in this study.

The purpose of this group will be to give me feedback about the findings, to help me be sure that I have accurately interpreted what you have told me, and to find out your thoughts about future studies. I will also be holding a workshop with community organizations at the end of the study, and would invite women on the Advisory Group to participate, if they wish.

Does this sound like something that would be of interest to you?

Yes\_\_\_\_\_

No\_\_\_\_\_

### Appendix M: Participant Demographic Characteristics

Participants	Year of Birth	Years in a Canadian Temporary Foreign Worker Program	Marital Status	Children (Age in Years)
Women From Mexico		ALL - in SAWP		
	1969	6 (SAWP also in Alberta, Niagara Falls)	Single	3, 11, 14
	1977	2 (SAWP also in British Columbia)	Widow	8, 12, 13
	1980	4 (SAWP also in Niagara Falls)	Separated	8
	1972	12 (SAWP also in Niagara Falls)	Separated	14, 16, 17
Women From the Philippines		ALL - in S-SLO ALL - no other locations of employment in S-LSO	Married	2,
	1980	2 (Previous work in Taiwan)	Married	2, ?
	1983	3	Single	none
	1974	3	Married	6, 8
	1965	2 (Previous work in Israel, Singapore)	Married	Grown-up
	1983	2	Single	none
	1974	2 (previous work in Taiwan)	Married	8, 10
	1977	3	Married	4, 7, 7 (twins)
	1974	3	Married	4, 9, 11
	1980	3	Single	none
Women From Jamaica		ALL - in SAWP ALL - no other locations of employment in SAWP		
	1976	7	Single	8, 18
	1972	3	Single	7, 21
	1967	11	Single	19
	1962	6	Single	15, 17, 23
	1977	6	Married	10
	1968	10	Single	17, 15
	1973	4	Single	17

## Curriculum Vitae

<b>Name:</b>	Kathryn Edmunds
<b>Post-secondary Education and Degrees:</b>	<p>University of Windsor Windsor, Ontario, Canada 1973-1977 B.A.</p> <p>University of Manitoba Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada 1977-1980 B.N.</p> <p>Wayne State University Detroit, Michigan, United States 1988-1995 M.Sc.N.</p> <p>Western University London, Ontario, Canada 2005-2016 PhD candidate</p>
<b>Honours and Awards:</b>	<p>Iota Omicron Chapter, Sigma Theta Tau International (STTI) Graduate Student Research Award 2008</p> <p>Tau Upsilon Chapter, STTI Graduate Student Award 2010</p> <p>Faculty of Health Sciences, Western University Graduate Thesis Research Award 2010</p> <p>Canadian Institutes of Health Research (CIHR) Institute of Gender and Health, Summer Institute Award 2010</p> <p>Registered Nurses' Association of Ontario (RNAO) Community Health Nurses Initiatives Group Research Award 2010</p> <p>RNAO Nursing Research Interest Group Research Award 2010</p>

Registered Nurses Foundation of Ontario (RNFOO)  
Dorothy Ferguson Scholarship  
2010

Canadian Nurses Foundation (CNF)  
Nursing Care Partnership Grant  
2010

Graduate Student Conference Travel Award  
Faculty of Health Sciences, Western University  
2008, 2010, 2011, 2012, 2014

**Related Work  
Experience:**

Public Health Nurse  
Windsor-Essex County Health Unit, Windsor, Ontario  
1987-2003

Adjunct Assistant Professor & Sessional Instructor  
Faculty of Nursing, University of Windsor  
1996-2003

Assistant Professor  
Faculty of Nursing, University of Windsor  
2003-2006

Graduate Assistant, Research Coordinator  
Western University  
2005-2006

Teaching Assistant  
Western University  
2007-2009

Adjunct Assistant Professor & Sessional Instructor  
Faculty of Nursing, University of Windsor  
2007-2016

**Publications:**

Edmunds, K. (1993). Transcultural nursing care with Old Colony Mennonites in a school context. In M.E. Parker (Ed.), *Patterns of nursing theories in practice* (pp.122-141). New York, NY: National League for Nursing.

Edmunds, K.A., & Kinnaird-Iler, E. (2005). Multicultural clients, migrant workers, and newcomers. In L. Stamler & L. Yiu (Eds.). *Community health nursing: A Canadian perspective* (pp. 247-254). Toronto, ON: Pearson.



- Patrick, L. & Edmunds, K. A. (2005). Family care. In L. Stamler & L. Yiu (Eds.). *Community health nursing: A Canadian perspective* (pp. 137-152). Toronto, ON: Pearson.
- Edmunds, K.A., & Kinnaird-Iler, E. (2008). Multicultural clients. In L. Stamler & L. Yiu (Eds.). *Community health nursing: A Canadian perspective* (2n ed., pp. 311-319). Toronto, ON: Pearson
- Patrick, L. & Edmunds, K. A. (2008). Family care. In L. Stamler & L. Yiu (Eds.). *Community health nursing: A Canadian perspective* (2nd ed., pp. 162-175). Toronto, ON: Pearson.
- Berman, H., Alvernaz Mulcahy, G., Forchuk, C., Edmunds, K., Haldenby, A., & Lopez, R. (2009). Uprooted and displaced: A critical narrative study of homeless, aboriginal, and newcomer girls in Canada. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 30(7), 418-430.
- Edmunds, K., Berman, H., Basok, T., Ford-Gilboe, M., & Forchuk, C. (2011). The health of women temporary agricultural workers in Canada: A critical review of the literature. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 43(4), 68–91.
- Edmunds, K. A., & Kinnaird-Iler E. (2012). Cultural diversity. In L. Stamler & L. Yiu (Eds.). *Community health nursing: A Canadian perspective* (3rd ed., pp. 124-138). Toronto, ON: Pearson.
- Edmunds, K. A., & Samuels-Dennis, J. (2014). Immigrant Canadians. In d. Gregory, C. Raymond- Seniuk, L. Patrick, & T. Stephen (Eds.). *Fundamentals: Perspectives on the art and science of Canadian nursing* (pp. 1003-1026). Philadelphia, PA: Wolters Kluwer.
- Edmunds, K. A. (2015). Cultural care. In L. Stamler, L. Yiu, & A. Mawji (Eds.) *Community health nursing: A Canadian perspective* (4th ed., 170-183). Toronto, ON: Pearson.